



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, January 12, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JAY HIGGINS

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Pierce, and Woolery (3:22 p.m. – 7:37 p.m.).
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Limón, Eng, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **December 15, 2014**, as amended.

Action: James/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **December 22, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Sweeney/Pierce.
- Action: Bernstein/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **January 12, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Miller.
- Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Eng made the following announcements:
1. Board member Woolery will be arriving late.
 2. Due to the Martin Luther King, Jr. holiday on Monday, January 19, 2015, the Consent meeting will take place on Tuesday, January 20, 2015.
 3. Item #7, 1575 Oramas Road, will be reviewed after Item #1, 1632 La Vista Del Oceano Drive. Board member Bernstein expressed concern about the opportunity for public comment when items are reviewed before their scheduled time. Mr. Limon confirmed that language on the agendas note that time changes can occur and he advised the Board that an item can be revisited for public comment after a project has been reviewed.
 4. The election of a Chair and Vice-Chair will take place at the next meeting.
- b. Mr. Limon reported that both the Single Family Design Board's and the Planning Commission's approval of a Coastal Development Permit for 511 Brosian Way have been appealed. The appeal of both decisions will be heard at City Council on Tuesday, January 27, 2015.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Sweeney reported that the subcommittee for the New Zoning Ordinance met Thursday, January 8, 2015, to review the working list that staff created. The subcommittee plans to reconvene to identify the items that most impact decisions of the Single Family Design Board.

RECONSIDERATION

1. 1632 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR

E-1 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-180-081
 Application Number: MST2014-00200
 Owner: Young-Saari Living Trust
 Architect: James Lecron

(Proposal to construct a new three-level, 2,895 square foot, single-family residence including an attached, 442 square foot, two-car garage and basement located on a 10,145 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 498 cubic yards of grading, new site walls, a new pool, a covered loggia, and future ground-mounted solar system. The proposal is 77% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Reconsideration and review of Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings. Project was last reviewed on December 1, 2014.)

Project was not reviewed and no action was taken. Per the City Attorney, the opportunity to reconsider this project has expired.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 960 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-057
Application Number: MST2009-00149
Owner: Pike B. Riegert
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to construct a new two story 2,054 square foot single family residence with an attached 400 square foot garage on a vacant 5.58 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes 448 cubic yards of grading. The proposed total of 2,454 square feet is 33% of the maximum guideline floor to area ratio.)

(Review After Final is requested for exterior changes that include revised doors, windows, colors, lighting, landscaping, and finish details. Also requested are an expanded roof deck with additional guardrails, new sandstone clad posts on the roof deck, relocation of light wells, and extending the lower patio and retaining walls, with additional grading at the south and eastern sides of the house. This project was last reviewed on December 15, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:04 p.m.

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restore the size of the roof deck to its previously approved size and configuration.
- 2) Restore the sliding glass door on the second floor, south elevation to a window.
- 3) The Board can support the sliding glass doors at the first floor, south elevation, provided that the framing matches the bronze color of the other windows, and that the color is achieved not by painting.
- 4) The Board supports the larger deck on the first level and the patio on the east side.
- 5) The 5 gallon oaks shall be replaced with 24 inch box oaks and the 24 inch box oaks shall be replaced with 36 inch box oaks; amount to be determined.
- 6) The south side retaining wall located in front of the property is acceptable.
- 7) The material and finish of the natural sandstone and flagstone on the east side patio is acceptable.
- 8) Further study the cable railing on the upper level deck.
- 9) The Board supports the rebar style of the cable railing on the retaining wall surrounding the south, east and north side patio.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Pierce/Bernstein abstained).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 398 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-012-017
Application Number: MST2014-00439
Owner: Maria and Monte Wilson
Architect: Paul Zink

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a new 700 square foot, four-car, detached tandem garage with 300 square feet of detached accessory space contained within the same structure, a new five foot high gate with pillars and lighting and associated grading. The site is currently developed with an existing, 3,600 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, and an existing 576 square foot, detached, two-car garage which are to remain. The proposed total development of 5,176 square feet on a 1.10 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 103% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. This project addresses violations identified in a Zoning Information Report (ZIR2014-00284).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No.065-14. Project was last reviewed on September 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:55 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m.

A letter of expressed concerns from Sally Sphar regarding the defensible space requirements and the compatibility of a secondary dwelling unit in a high fire zone was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:59 p.m.

Failed Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) The majority of the Board finds that the proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood, is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood, the proposed building and structure are designed with quality architectural details, and does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, and the project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 3/3/0. Motion failed. (Sweeney/Bernstein/Pierce opposed) (Staff explained that it was not in the Board's purview to focus on zoning concerns so the motion was revisited.)

2nd Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) The majority of the Board finds that the proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood, it is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site, the proposed building and structure are designed with quality architectural

details, and does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, and the project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Unanimous vote was made on an identical motion after the Board discussed its previous support of the project.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 1306 DOVER HILL RD

E-1 Zone

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-014
Application Number: MST2014-00350
Owner: Erik Nickel
Designer: Amy Von Protz

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to convert an existing 367 square foot detached two-car garage to habitable accessory space, and construct a new 299 square foot attached one-car garage and 200 square foot one-car carport. The project includes a 127 sq. ft. first level addition, a 343 lower level addition, and a 92 square foot lower level non-habitable addition to the existing 1,973 square foot multi-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 3843 square feet, located on an 18,740 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 87% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required for requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 069-14. Project was last reviewed on October 20, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:21 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Architect; and Erik Nickel and Michael Loftus, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Bernstein/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 415 YANKEE FARM RD****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-030-024
 Application Number: MST2014-00464
 Owner: Sandra D. McGraw Trust
 Owner: Franck Hanse
 Architect: David Mendro
 Engineer: Thom Hume Consulting Engineers
 Contractor: Allen Construction

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,198 square foot single-family residence with an attached garage and carport and construct a new 2,622 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 683 square foot, attached two-car garage with a bike storage area. The proposal includes a new 513 square foot pool and 100 square foot spa, patios, decks, landscaping, and 1,500 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 3,305 square feet of development on a 1 acre lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 65% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00453.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on October 6, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: David Mendro and John Kucharski, Architects; and Scott Menzel, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m.

- 1) Lori Rafferty, a neighbor on Yankee Farm Road, submitted a letter and expressed her appreciation for changes to the project. She also expressed concerns regarding solid fencing impeding traffic visibility, tree heights causing visual impacts, light reflection, and construction parking.
- 2) Paul Weisman, a neighbor to the north of the project, offered his time to comment to Lori Rafferty, who in turn expressed concerns regarding visual impacts and light reflection, pointing out that a selling point of the neighborhood is the dark sky. In addition, she mentioned issues with privacy and the lack of parking for construction purposes.
- 3) Mark Davis, a neighbor to the west of the project, expressed concerns regarding light reflection and the appeal of the dark sky in the neighborhood, and possible issues with drainage. He requested that construction parking be placed on the property only to avoid traffic impacts and ended with support of the project.

Letters of expressed concerns from Patricia Foley, Lori Rafferty, and Kail Wathne were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:51 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City, it is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate, the quality of architecture and materials is acceptable, and the proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated specimen tree.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.
- 3) Provide the materials for the back wall structure.

- 4) Reduce the amount of exterior soffit lights.
- 5) Study the approach to the fencing, undulating the chain link from the street.
- 6) Study an alternate to the existing corner tree or provide skirting.
- 7) Provide the materials for the pool equipment wall.
- 8) The Board would like staff to ensure an appropriate construction parking plan.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:15 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:42 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 1346 MANITOU RD

E-1 Zone

(6:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-210-010
 Application Number: MST2014-00533
 Owner: Lewis E. Manring
 Architect: W. David Winitzky

(Proposal to add 1,193 square feet of first- and second-story additions to an existing 1,983 square foot single-family residence with a 455 square foot detached garage. The additions include habitable space that will connect the garage to the residence. The project also includes new landscaping, site walls, and an interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,631 square feet on a 27,168 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 76% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:42 p.m.

Present: W. David Winitzky, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued to the Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's appearance and finds that the proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the neighborhood, is compatible with the surrounding area, uses quality architecture and materials, and the existing landscape plan is sufficient.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**7. 1575 ORAMAS RD****E-1 Zone****(7:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-051-005
 Application Number: MST2014-00587
 Designer: Mark Morando
 Owner: George Pecoulas and Patricia Luscombe

(Proposal to replace the exterior windows and doors with Kolbe and Kolbe Vista Deluxe metal clad flush-mounts. The project includes new smooth-coat Mission style stucco, a new standing seam metal roof, alterations to the roof above the garage and dwelling, and a new garage door. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for alterations to the dwelling within the interior setback. A previous application (MST2014-00294) was reviewed and approved by the Single Family Design Board on July 14, 2014, for a 25 square foot addition, a new balcony and exterior alterations to the dwelling at the property.)

(Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. Project was referred from Consent on December 8, 2014.)

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Mark Morando, Designer; and George Pecoulas, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The majority of the Board finds that the standing seam metal roof is appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines and findings since the size of the property is small when compared to neighboring homes.
- 2) The majority of the Board finds that the stucco finish and garage doors are aesthetically appropriate.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Pierce/Sweeney opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 3015 SAMARKAND DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone****(7:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-191-007
 Application Number: MST2014-00628
 Owner: Leslie T. Nolan
 Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal for demolition of a 100 square foot front porch, addition of 329 square feet to the first-floor, and addition of 811 square feet to the second floor. The project includes an interior remodel of the existing 1,092 square foot single-family residence with an attached 335 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,612 square feet is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification to allow additions and alterations in the interior setbacks.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer Review for a requested zoning modification.)

Actual time: 6:51 p.m.

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:58 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds that the proposed modifications on the south and north side do not pose consistency issues and are aesthetically appropriate.
- 2) Study ways to mitigate the numerous jogs on the roof edge of the garage.
- 3) The Board supports the consistency and appearance of the house and its character within the neighborhood.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan for the front yard.
- 5) Study the fence finish to complement the architecture.
- 6) The 85% FAR is appropriate and the size, bulk and scale of the house is compatible with the neighborhood.

Action: Miller/James, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

9. 251 LA MARINA DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(8:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-161-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00583
 Owner: Navid Eskandari
 Architect: Alan McLeod
 Applicant: Lauren Anderson

(Proposal to construct 700 square feet of new one-story additions and a new 785 square foot two-story addition, to an existing 800 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The proposal includes demolition of 100 square feet of the existing non-conforming garage and a new, conforming, 400 square foot, two-car garage. The proposed development total of 2,685 square feet, located on a 6,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 100% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 7:16 p.m.

Present: Alan McLeod and Lauren Anderson, Architects; and Navid Eskandari, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study reducing the square footage to be less than 100%.
- 2) Study the second story roof line.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan that softens the front entry.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:36 P.M. ****

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Lisa James and Brian Miller.

FINAL REVIEW**A. 504 E VALERIO ST R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-001
Application Number: MST2014-00594
Owner: Sidney C. Carrera
Owner: Dan and Meg Purdey

(Proposal for a 321 square foot addition to an existing 3,315 square foot single-family residence with a 287 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes replacement of a rear deck with a new deck and stair, demolition of an existing rear deck at the dining room, new doors and windows, and an interior stair to the basement. The proposed total of 3,923 square feet on a 10,439 square foot lot is 104% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00430.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as Submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1118 FERRELO RD E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-321-014
Application Number: MST2014-00397
Owner: Timothy Louis Gozzano Living Trust
Designer: Chava Riley

(Proposal to add a 215 square foot second-story deck and 408 square foot ground-level deck in the rear yard of an existing two-story 1,352 square foot single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. The project includes removal of an outdoor barbecue and several existing low sandstone retaining walls in the rear yard, and construction of two new sandstone walls of up to 30 inches tall in the rear and front yards.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as Submitted.