



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, May 19, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

- FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
- BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
- BERNI BERNSTEIN
- LISA JAMES
- JAIME PIERCE
- DENISE WOOLERY
- JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
- DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
- AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:08 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein (3:08 p.m. to 8:04 p.m.), James (3:08 p.m. to 8:04 p.m.),
Pierce, and Woolery.

Members absent: Zimmerman.

Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of May 5, 2014 as
submitted.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **May 12, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Pierce/Zimmerman.
- Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **May 19, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Zimmerman/Pierce.
- Action: Woolery/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Eng announced that Board member Zimmerman will be absent from the meeting.
- b. Chair Sweeney announced his attendance at the May 14, 2014 City Council meeting in which he represented the Board in conveying their request for a stipend per meeting. He acknowledged there would be no action taken until June 2, 2014 after the Council had set an approved budget and could decide on whether or not to reinstate the stipend.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 3002 SEA CLIFF****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-091-036
 Application Number: MST2013-00270
 Owner: William Bridge Jr. & Michele Profant Family Trust
 Designer: Jason Grant

(Proposal for a façade remodel, interior remodel and additions to an existing 2,007 square foot one-story single-family residence, including a one-car garage, located on a 3-acre parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes 730 square feet of one-story additions, and conversion of 740 square feet of existing unfinished basement area into new floor area. The proposal includes one new uncovered parking space, and a total of 440 square feet of new decks, including a new roof deck with exterior stairs. The proposed total of 3,477 square feet is 57% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval requested. Project was last reviewed on April 21, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Designer; and Margie Grace, Landscape Contractor.

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m.

- 1) David Schott, a neighbor in close proximity, spoke in support of the proposed project. He did express concerns regarding the landscape and mitigation of the deck to surrounding homes in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with comments:
 1) The Board appreciates the design revisions.

2) The Board had positive comments regarding neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

3) The Board finds the color of the front entry gate appropriate.

Action: James/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:36 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:39 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3425 SEA LEDGE LN

A-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-082-012
 Application Number: MST2012-00135
 Owner: Jacques Habra
 Architect: Tom Henson

(Revised proposal for additions and alterations to an existing one-story, 1,589 square foot single-family residence with a detached 393 square foot two car garage located on a 17,490 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, and in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes 2,345 square feet of one- and two-story additions, the demolition of the existing garage, and the conversion of 488 of existing habitable floor area into a new two-car garage. Revisions to the previously approved project includes no new increase in square footage, the elimination of a proposed basement, a change in roof type, a relocation of the garage and driveway, and revised doors, windows, and landscaping. The proposed total of 3,826 square feet of development is 87% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Planning Commission review for a requested Coastal Development Permit. The proposal will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2011-00228.)

(New Project Design Approval requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-13. Project was last reviewed on May 5, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Tom Henson, and Peter Becker, Architects; Jacques Habra, Owner; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

2nd Motion: Attached to the first motion with the following conditions:

1) Create an enclosure for the lower southeast corner.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Zimmerman absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 1826 E LAS TUNAS RD

A-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-082-011
Application Number: MST2014-00002
Owner: Marilyn Makepeace Revocable Trust
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal to construct an 865 square foot, one-story, addition to the existing 2,479 square foot residence, including the conversion of the existing 675 square foot, detached accessory building (garage and workshop) to habitable floor area and 190 square feet of new additions. The proposal also includes the construction of a new, detached, 564 square foot, two-car garage with roof deck, new site retaining walls and stairs, and 270 cubic yards of site grading. The proposed total of 3,908 square feet, located on a 20,036 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 83% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 018-14. Project requires compliance with the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to Final Approval. Project was last reviewed on January 27, 2014)

Actual time: 4:12 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; Marilyn Makepeace, Owner; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Public comment re-opened at 4:27 p.m.

1) Kellam de Forest expressed concern regarding the mitigation of the deck in relation to neighboring homes.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan with details concerning the deck elevation.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 3) Per the parking area adjacent to the proposed project, the Board finds the modification aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the design guidelines.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 1562 MARQUARD TERR****R-1 Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-031-018
 Application Number: MST2013-00424
 Owner: Joanne Gronquist
 Architect: Joe Ewing

(Proposal for a 402 square foot first floor addition and 262 square foot second floor addition to an existing single-family residence with a 378 square foot detached, two-car garage with a 253 square foot hobby room. The project includes window and door alterations, replacement of existing siding with stucco, a new standing seam metal roof, and a demolition and relocation of 49 square feet of garage space. The proposed total of 2622 square feet, located on a 8,411 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District is 79% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. Project was last reviewed on December 2, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Joe Ewing, Architect; and Tim Gronquist, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the first and second floor setbacks as being aesthetically appropriate and do not pose consistency issues with the design guidelines.
- 2) The Board finds the interior setback modification for the garage as promoting an appearance of uniformity of development.
- 3) The Board appreciates the design revisions.
- 4) Study the bathroom windows regarding privacy to the south.
- 5) Study the heat distribution in relation to the high ceilings.
- 6) Study the skylight concerning the roof structure.
- 7) Study the east elevation for compatible windows.

Action: Pierce/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 523 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-062-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00212
 Owner: Gina Y. Han
 Architect: Ahmad Morshedi

(Proposal to construct a new 2,560 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage on an 8,427 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. This proposal is 78% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio and requires Staff Hearing Officer Approval for requested zoning modifications.)

(Concept review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 5:32 p.m.

Present: Ali Jeevan Jee, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:50 p.m.

- 1) Elizabeth Faoro, a neighbor in close proximity, submitted a letter with expressed concern regarding her view in relation to the substantial scale of the proposed project.
- 2) Blanche John, a neighbor in close proximity, submitted a letter with expressed concern regarding the excessive size of the proposed project to neighboring homes.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the east elevation in relation to the garage for continued development.
- 2) Provide a color palate.
- 3) Provide details for and the location of the lighting fixtures.
- 4) Study the bridge along the project for approval from the City and clarify its location.
- 5) The Board finds the modifications aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the design guidelines.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:24 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:35 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 209 E ISLAY ST

E-1 Zone

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-042-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00114
 Owner: Peter & Li Camenzind
 Agent: Jarrett Gorin
 Architect: Doug Leach
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 3,817 square foot, two-story, single-family residence and detached garage and construct a new 5,852 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 719 square foot attached three-car garage. A 2,696 square foot habitable basement is proposed below grade. The project also includes a new 60 square foot detached pool building, relocated driveway, and other site work. The proposed 6,068 square feet of above-grade floor area on 23,870 square foot lot is 124% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment. Approval of alterations to the sandstone wall are contingent upon Historic Landmarks Commission acceptance of HSSR addendum. Project was last reviewed on April 7, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Agent; Joseph Fournier, Architect; and Peter Camenzind, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:53 p.m.

- 1) Mary Suding submitted a letter in support of the proposed project regarding the square footage in relation to F.A.R. and the neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) Tom Muneio and Eileen Mira submitted a letter in support of the proposed project stating that the Craftsman style of the home would be consistent with the history of the neighborhood.
- 3) Robert L. Brace submitted a letter in support of the proposed project stating the home conformed to the neighborhood.
- 4) Kellam de Forest submitted a letter with concern regarding the massive scale of the proposed project in relation to "mansionization."

Public comment closed at 6:56 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design revisions.
- 2) The Board promotes further improvement in style concerning the front entry wall.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 1632 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR

E-1 Zone

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-180-081
Application Number: MST2014-00200
Owner: Young-Saari Living Trust
Architect: James Lecron

(Proposal to construct a new three-level, 2,895 square foot, single-family residence including an attached, 442 square foot, two-car garage and basement located on a 10,145 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 498 cubic yards of grading, new site walls, a new pool, a covered loggia, and future ground-mounted solar system. The proposal is 77% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept review. Comments only.)

Actual time: 7:17 p.m.

Present: Jim Lecron, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:32 p.m.

- 1) Eric D'Hoker and Jody Enders, a neighbor adjacent to the proposed project, submitted a letter and addressed concerns regarding the proposal to build a pool on an excessive slope. They also requested that construction be limited to weekdays only until 5 p.m.
- 2) Terry and Linda Perkins submitted a letter with expressed concerns regarding the impact of the proposed high wall that would support the main floor patio of the project. They stated it would be an eyesore to the surrounding neighbors.
- 3) Don Sharpe submitted a letter with expressed concern regarding the excessive square footage, projected elevations and landscape space of the proposed project.
- 4) Anthony Bladon, a neighbor in close proximity, presented a PowerPoint presentation expressing

concern with the substantial scale of the project in relation to neighboring properties previously approved by the Board.

Public comment closed at 7:41 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the style and quality of architecture.
- 2) Study a different style to the pool.
- 3) Provide more details of the architecture.
- 4) The size, bulk and scale are appropriate to the neighborhood.
- 5) Clarify the footprint of the upper level.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1314 FERRELO RD

E-1 Zone

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-283-006
 Application Number: MST2014-00197
 Owner: Scott & Ro Black
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a new 3,282, two-story single-family residence with an two-car garage and basement on a 10,890 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes 1,080 square feet of decks, new retaining walls, more than 500 cubic yards of grading, and site work on a driveway easement on an adjacent property. The proposal is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 8:05 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; and Scott Black, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:24 p.m.

- 1) VJ Jammalamadaka, a neighbor in close proximity, spoke in opposition of the proposed project for which the only access is through an easement on their property which has become a legal matter. She also spoke on the issue of limited on-street parking in the area and the desire to preserve the design of an existing sandstone wall below the driveway.
- 2) Rich Carson, a neighbor in close proximity, spoke in opposition of the proposed project with concerns regarding the massive scale of the project in relation to the lot size and privacy.
- 3) Sheldon Sanov, a neighbor north of the proposed project, spoke in opposition with concerns regarding the massive scale of the project and the stability of the surrounding terrain.
- 4) Gerald and Cynthia Wheeler, neighbors in close proximity, provided a letter in favor of the proposed project and adherence with good neighbor guidelines.

Public comment closed at 8:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the style, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Consider lowering the plate height on the second level.

- 3) Reconsider the size of the exterior decks to meet Single Family Design Guidelines for upper level decks.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan.
- 5) Provide an elevation of the project looking toward the site from Ferello Road.
- 6) Complement the stone work with the neighborhood.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Bernstein/Zimmerman absent).

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Jaime Pierce and Jim Zimmerman.

NEW ITEM**A. 1554 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-183-011
Application Number: MST2014-00213
Owner: Fred J. Krupica
Applicant: Paragon
Designer: SPH Design

(Proposal for a new 323 square foot swimming pool and attached 48 square foot spa and rock feature with automatic pool cover and associated plumbing and electrical at an existing 4,170 square foot single-family residence on a 14,024 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project also proposes 375 square feet of new exterior decking and stairs, new gates and guardrails, and 40 cubic yard of grading.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval, continued to staff for Final Approval with comment:

1) Provide a letter from the neighbor to the east indicating support for a spa in the proposed location.

NEW ITEM**B. 844 MEIGS RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-073-016
Application Number: MST2014-00214
Owner: Pierre L. Labarge IV
Architect: Dylan Chappell

(Proposal for a 309 square foot addition and new dormer on the first floor, and a 150 square foot reduction of the second story balcony at an existing 2,617 square foot, two-story residence in the Hillside Design District. The project also includes an interior remodel of 671 square feet. The proposed total of 2,928 on a 9,148 square foot lot is 84% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval, continued to staff for Final Approval.

NEW ITEM

C. 3761 LINCOLN RD

E-3/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-430-013
Application Number: MST2014-00219
Owner: Wayne Benner Trust
Architect: Chris Dentzel

(Proposal to construct a 162 square foot addition and remodel an existing two-story 2,540 square foot residence with a 396 square foot attached garage. The proposed total of 3,103 square feet on an 8,323 square foot lot is 95% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to consent for Final Approval.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:01 P.M. ****