



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 8, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair* - PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair* – PRESENT AT 3:22 P.M.
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT UNTIL 5:40 P.M.
BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT
LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - PRESENT
JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – ABSENT
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Woolery, Bernstein (present until 5:40 p.m.), James, Miller, Pierce, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of September 24, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 24, 2012**, as submitted.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **October 1, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Jaime Pierce**.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Zimmerman absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **October 8, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Jaime Pierce**.

Action: Pierce/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard made the announcements that the previously discussed (at the September 10th meeting), and approved project at 306 Sherman Drive, a Tea Fire rebuild, will be scheduled soon as requested by the Board for a discussion item at a future Full Board meeting to review possible changes for the Tea Fire rebuild.

2. Board member Bernstein announced she would be leaving the meeting early at 5:40 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports.**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****1. 1533 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-014

Application Number: MST2012-00046

Owner: Anina Davenport Revocable Trust

Architect: James Zimmerman

(This project has been revised to reduce the overall second-story addition by 283 square feet, reducing the FAR from 85% to 79%, and elimination of the 700 square foot "as-built" bluff-side, circular tiled patio. The revised proposal involves the construction of a 946 square foot, second-story addition to an existing 2,419 square foot residence with an attached two-car garage. The project also includes a major façade remodel, a 92 square foot one-story addition and interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,457 square feet, located on a 19,166 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit and requested modifications. The proposal will address the violations in ZIR 2011-00381.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; the project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit and zoning modifications. The project received a concept review by SFDB on February 27, 2012, and by the Planning Commission on September 6, 2012.)

(3:11)

Present: Jim Zimmerman, Architect; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m.

- 1) Michael Baugus, adjacent neighbor, opposition; expressed privacy concerns regarding the location of the westerly windows, and requested that the proposed project be relocated as easterly as possible.

Public comment closed at 3:22 p.m.

Ms. Bedard read the September 6, 2012, Planning Commission minutes to the Board.

Vice-Chair Sweeney summarized his participation of the September 4 Planning Commission site visit and the September 6 Planning Commission hearing.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the revised proposal with the reduced the size, bulk and scale, and reduced FAR from 85% to 79% to be acceptable; and understands the necessity of the modification given the configuration of the existing residence.
- 2) In response to the Planning Commissions minutes, Items #2 and 3. The Board is supportive of the proposed reduced second floor design in minimizing the width of the second story by 6-feet on both sides, and supportive of the centering and location of the proposed second story in relation to the site and to the development of the neighborhood.
- 3) The redesign has eliminated the originally proposed excessive attic space, thereby further reducing the size, bulk and scale.
- 4) The Board finds the present design to be a successful solution to adequately address both the adjacent parcels privacy concerns and maintain to the greatest extent feasible the public view corridor.
- 5) Provide a streetscape visual rendering on the plans; including second-floor heights.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman stepped down).

Board comment: The Board recommends that the applicant meet with adjacent neighbors to give them an opportunity to visit the site to view the privacy solutions.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 1702 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-180-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00020
 Owner: King Heirs, LLC
 Owner: The Mesa at Santa Barbara, LLC
 Agent: Brent Daniels
 Architect: Zehren and Associates

(Proposal for revisions to the previously approved project to include enclosing a 400 square foot covered porch into a new family room, adding a new fire place and chimney, adding four new high windows and a new skylight. The original project, which is currently under construction, is a new 4,281 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with an attached 443 square foot two-car garage and a detached 251 square foot one-car garage, located on a 45,143 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The revised proposals results in a total of 5,375 square feet and is 108% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:55)

Present: Stephanie Poole and Monica Jeffers, Agents for the Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with the comment that a majority of the Board supported the proposed enclosed additional square footage, and had positive comments regarding the project's size, bulk, and scale to be still consistent with neighborhood compatibility and appearance.

Action: Miller/Zimmerman, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Sweeney opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

3. 1835 EL CAMINO DE LA LUZ

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-100-018

Application Number: MST2012-00289

Owner: Rafael and Linda Franco, Trustees

(Proposal to enclose the existing 231 square foot second level deck above the two-car garage to a bedroom, on an existing two-story, 2,530 square foot, single-family residence. The proposed total of 2,761 square feet, located on an 8,682 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 82% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(The project was referred to the Full Board from Consent review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:15)

Present: Ray Franco, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m.

1) Patti Gutshall, opposition; expressed concerns regarding vacation units and rental (temporary) housing on the proposed property.

Public comment opened at 4:44 p.m.

Two letters of expressed concern from Herbert Barthels and Patti Gutshall were acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide details of the proposed metal roof on the plans.
- 3) Provide window details on the plans.
- 4) Specify the proposed landscaping materials in the new planter; the Board specified a draping, low-water plant material to be maintained.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 920 CAMINO VIEJO RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-060-047
Application Number: MST2012-00364
Owner: Marc and Mara Dworsky Living Trust
Architect: Bildsten & Sherwin Design Studio

(Proposal for construction of a new 3,010 square foot patio to include a pool and spa, an exterior barbeque counter and dining area, and a new 820 square foot accessory space to be constructed beneath the new patio. The parcel is currently developed with an existing 3,578 square foot single-family residence, and an attached 463 square foot two-car garage. The 820 square foot accessory space includes a 500 square foot study/art studio with a half bath, and a 320 square foot storage area. A total of 44 cubic yards of cut and fill grading is proposed. The proposed total of 4,861 square feet, located on a 1.15 acre lot, is 96% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(4:52)

Present: Susan Sherwin, Architect; Stacy Isaac, Landscape Architect; and Suzanne Riegler, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Assistant Planner Suzanne Riegler clarified the requested modifications:

- 1) The accessory building in the front yard;
- 2) The total accessory and storage building in excess of 500 square feet;
- 3) The garage and carport in excess of 750 square feet; parking in the front yard; and adequacy of screening from view of parking in the remaining front yard; and
- 4) The location and height of the requested gate.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board understands and considers the requirement for a fence along the frontage of the property along Camino Viejo, but would like further study on the gate element entrance for more compatibility with the general streetscape of the adjacent neighborhood.
- 2) The Board encourages the applicant to reconsider the location of the proposed 'guest' parking spaces (shown near the street).
- 3) The Board is not supportive of the carport for the additional proposed 'site' parking adjacent to the garage, and would prefer any additional proposed 'site' parking be uncovered.
- 4) Provide additional information with regards to a combination of both the landscape plan and a further detailed plan of the proposed patio to clearly demonstrate the relationship between the size and total area of the requested patio in relation to the size of the proposed accessory and storage area. (Concern was expressed regarding the large size and total area of the proposed patio.)
- 5) The Board understands the nature of the project and finds the size of the accessory building to be acceptable provided it is contained below the proposed new patio.
- 6) Study an alternative railing material, other than a glass railing material; study adding landscaping to the design solution.

- 7) Study refining the materials and front elevation of the accessory building to be more compatible and better reflect the design and architectural elements of the existing residence.
- 8) Provide a more detailed landscape plan to show how the front yard softens the general size, bulk, and scale of the existing house and the proposed outdoor patio, accessory, and storage building.

Action: Sweeney/James, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

5. 1482 LOU DILLON

A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-048
 Application Number: MST2012-00003
 Owner: Terence & Angela Becerra
 Architect: Eisenbeiz Design Studio
 Landscape Architect: Sam Maphis

(Proposal to construct a new 2,483 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 599 square foot garage on a 2.26-acre lot located in the Hillside Design District. Site improvements include an entry gate, fountain, bio-swale, concrete swale, stone garden walls, flagstone patios, and removal of two Eucalyptus trees, walkways and landscaping. The proposal includes 293 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposal is 54% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 056-03.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on February 27, 2012.)

(5:36)

Present: John Eisenbeiz, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:48 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 20 CAMINO VERDE

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-282-027
 Application Number: MST2012-00283
 Applicant: Jim Doub
 Owner: Rory Rye/Jim Doub
 Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects AIA

(Proposal to construct a new single-family residence to replace one destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes the construction of a 5,025 square foot, two-story residence and an attached 547 square foot two-car garage for a total of 5,572 square feet. The project includes 346 square feet of decks and refurbishment of an existing swimming pool and spa. No grading is proposed. The proposed total of 5,572 square feet, located on a 1.3 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 108% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and zoning compliance.)

(5:54)

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect; and Jim Doub and Rory Rye, Co-owners.

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The Board acknowledged previous letters of support with suggestions for privacy screenings from Kathy Mora, and from Dennis Dierenfield received at the initial August 20, 2012 Consent Calendar review.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the 108% FAR? 4/2 (passed). Support is provided with the acknowledgement that the proposed new house is utilizing the pre-fire building footprint.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The general site plan and design approach is acceptable. The Board appreciates the approach to incorporate a design that reflects the adjacent neighbors and immediate neighborhood.
- 2) Provide compliance with Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) for further clarification of the overall site and design aesthetics.
- 3) Study the geometry of the building with regards to the rectangular roof and the circular floor plan elements: in particular, further study and resolve the round roof dome element. The Board suggested considering a metal roof on the dome element with the color to match the concrete shakes.
- 4) Study methods to provide natural light into the south and westerly elevations, such as high windows in the kitchen. However the Board understands the potential privacy concerns with the adjacent neighbor.
- 5) Study incorporating windows in the northerly cylindrical (closet) element.
- 6) Provide further resolution of the cantilevered roof elements, and study the definition and design of the support column elements to better integrate with the general design approach.
- 7) Provide further refinement of the proposed eave edges; provide construction details.
- 8) The general color palette is acceptable. The Board looks forward to reviewing how the final materials will be applied and detailed.
- 9) Provide a further refined and more comprehensive landscape plan; in particular the area between the proposed residence and the adjacent westerly neighbor. Study screening elements.

Action: Sweeney/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 2224 GIBRALTAR RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-180-004
Application Number: MST2012-00187
Owner: Allison Armour
Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal to convert the existing 575 square foot two-car garage into a residential office and art room, and construct a new 480 square foot ,attached two-car garage for an existing 3,714 square foot, two-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 4,769 square feet, located on an 11.46 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 44% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission review for an amendment to the conditions of approval of the original subdivision (Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-91) for alterations to the approved building envelope.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review.)

(6:41)

Present: Ken Radtkey; Architect; and Allison Armour, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m.

Jonathan Bvoise, spoke in support of the project as long as the proposed structure matches in color, material, and style.

Public comment closed at 6:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Consent with positive comments and direction to correct the roof from a gable roof to a hip roof.

Action: Miller/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:00 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****A. 136 SAN RAFAEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-194-014
Application Number: MST2012-00213
Owner: Mairid Svensson, Revocable Trust
Designer: Robert Paul Design

(Proposal for a façade and interior remodel, and a 108 square foot first-story addition to an existing two-story 1,877 square foot single-family residence, and a 365 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 6,100 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes replacement of exterior siding, new roofing material, replacement of doors and windows, adding a new roof over the existing second-floor deck, a new ground level deck and site landscaping. The proposed total of 2,332 square feet is 86% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on September 24, 2012.)

Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 317 NORTHRIDGE RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-131-009
Application Number: MST2010-00218
Owner: Victoria Trivilian
Architect: Jason Grant

(Revised project to construct a new 473 square foot detached accessory structure with a 270 square foot covered porch, and a total of 40 cubic yards of grading. The proposal also includes the addition of a new covered porch, a 774 square foot patio and built in barbeque area to the existing 2,059 square foot single-family residence, including an attached 330 square foot garage, located on a 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 2,532 square feet is 51% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on September 24, 2012.)

Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 940 COYOTE RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-062-006
Application Number: MST2009-00001
Owner: Bonnie Logaan-Zimmer, Revocable Trust
Architect: Brian Nelson

(Proposal to rebuild a single-family residence and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed project data were verified to be a three-story 6,257 square foot house, attached 998 square foot garage, and detached 400 square foot garage. The project will increase the size of the previous residence by 1,189 square feet with the conversion of the understory to a basement. The project is located on a 1.3 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. This property provides a driveway easement for 950 Coyote Road. The proposed total of 7,655 square feet is 148% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final to add additional site landscaping at the location of the approved lap pool. The lap pool will be constructed under a separate future permit. The site landscaping has been approved by the Fire Department for compliance with High Fire Area landscaping requirements.)

Approval of Review After Final, of landscaping, as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Jaime Pierce**.