



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, October 1, 2007**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**      BERNIE BERNSTEIN, (arrived at 3:07 p.m., out from 5:55 until 6:08 p.m.)  
                                  ERIN CARROLL, Present  
                                  GLEN DEISLER, Present  
                                  WILLIAM MAHAN, Present  
                                  GARY MOSEL, Present (arrived at 3:08 p.m.)  
                                  DENISE WOOLERY, Present  
                                  PAUL ZINK, Present

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      GRANT HOUSE, Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      STELLA LARSON, Present (left at 5:15 pm.)

**STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent  
                          TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician, Present  
                          GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

| <b>SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b><br>(See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details) |           |  |
|--|-----------|--|
| <b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>  | Required  | <p><u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &amp; neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing &amp; proposed structures, building &amp; area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading &amp; retaining walls, &amp; existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing &amp; proposed grading where applicable.</p> |
|  | Suggested | <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete &amp; thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>  |
| <b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>  | Required  | <p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial &amp; multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees &amp; shrubs &amp; plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>  |
|  | Suggested | <p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" &amp; detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings &amp; must be complete &amp; accurate.</p>   |
| <b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>   | Required  | <p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting &amp; irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, &amp; plumbing where applicable.</p>  |

Chair Mahan called the meeting to order at 3:08.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of September 17, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 24, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler with the exception of the landscaping for Items B, reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 1, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler with the exception of the landscaping for Items B and D, reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

No announcements.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No reported violations.

**FINAL REVIEW**

**1. 206 LOS ALAMOS AVE**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-196-007

Application Number: MST2007-00347

Owner: James Candy

Designer: Joaquin Ornelas

(Proposal for a 781 square foot two-story addition, two new decks totaling 338 square feet, and replacement of all windows for an existing 2,109 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 7,097 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. No zoning modifications are requested for the project. The proposed total 2,890 square feet results in a FAR of 0.41.)

(3:10)

Present: Mary Chang, Property Owner; Jose Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m. Chair Mahan acknowledged a letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition. Public comment closed at 3:38.

Straw vote: How many Board members prefer screening to 6 feet high? 7/0/0.

X

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following conditions:**

- 1) Restudy the stair landing wall and window.
- 2) Provide balcony screening to six feet.
- 3) Restudy the two foot square stone pilasters along one side of the walkway.
- 4) Lower the pedestrian entry gate height.
- 5) Continue to study and simplify the project wherever possible.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed: Boards requested changes were not completed.)

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **2. 118 CALLE BELLO**

**A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-340-007

Application Number: MST2007-00385

Owner: Paul and Marianne Gertman

Architect: Bildsten and Sherwin

(Proposal for 248 cubic yards of cut and fill grading and sitework for new landscaped terrace and pool, enclosed pool house, open pergola, new solar photovoltaic panels and solar water heating panels on the southern, sloped portion of the 1.1 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)**

(3:46)

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; Paul and Marianne Gertman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m.

Jack Sheehan spoke in support.

Chair Mahan acknowledged a letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition.

Public comment closed at 4:04 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Return with readable elevations from the south, east, and west.
- 2) Retaining walls should not exceed six feet in height, use terraced retaining walls as outlined in the Hillside Housing Design Guidelines, section 34.11.
- 3) Show locations for use of stone and plaster on wall surfaces.
- 4) Provide cut and fill calculations.
- 5) Outdoor lighting shall comply with the City's lighting ordinance.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****3. 2131 RED ROSE WAY****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-252-045  
 Application Number: MST2007-00332  
 Owner: Sylvio Cunha  
 Architect: Emilio Casanueva

(Proposal to construct a 1,777 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The existing 960 square foot house on the 5,500 square foot lot will be demolished. The proposal has a FAR of 0.40 and is 85% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**(THE PROPOSAL IS 85% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)**

(4:22)

Present: Emilio Casanueva, Architect; Sylvio Cunha, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m. Chair Mahan acknowledged a public comment letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition. Public comment closed at 4:30 p.m.

**Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued to four weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Push back the roof deck to 15 feet from the west property line.
- 2) Raise the windows on the west elevation so the sills are 36 inch from the floor or level with the balcony railing.
- 3) Exterior lighting shall be downcast, in compliance with City Standards.
- 4) Thicken the wall on the east side of the entry recess.
- 5) Provide a color board.
- 6) The project is appropriate to the site and neighborhood; provides quality architecture and materials; and preserves two significant trees.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 5/1/1. Motion carried. (Deisler abstained. Mosel opposed: lacks neighborhood compatibility.)

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW****4. 133 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

**(5:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-061-024  
 Application Number: MST2007-00070  
 Architect: Jim Armstrong  
 Owner: James E. Moore

(Proposal to construct a two-level 4,004 square foot single-family residence with a detached 499 square foot accessory art studio building, 440 square foot attached carport, two swimming pools, 170 cubic yards of grading and associated site improvements on a vacant 3 acre lot in the Hillside Design District.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION**

**NO. 036-01.)**

(4:47)

Present: James E. Moore, Owner; David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:10 p.m.

Chair Mahan acknowledged a letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition.

Public comment was closed at 5:11 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Return with quarter inch scale elevations and architectural detailing conveying the contemporary ranch architectural theme.
- 2) Provide grading and drainage plans prepared by a licensed professional showing any existing oak trees and construction protection measures.
- 3) The cut and fill shall be balanced on site.
- 4) Provide an exterior architectural lighting plan.
- 5) Applicant shall notify the Montecito Homeowner's Association of the project and provide an acknowledgement letter from the Association for the file.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\*\*\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:30 P.M. UNTIL 5:55 P.M. \*\*\*\*\***

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****5. 3825 LA CUMBRE HILLS LN****E-3/SD-2 Zone****(5:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-042

Application Number: MST2007-00044

Owner: John and Marcia Briggs

Architect: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for remodeling and additions to an existing 1,254 square foot single-family residence with an attached 418 square foot garage on an 8,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes converting an existing 336 square foot second-story deck to habitable space, a 192 square foot addition, a 45 square foot deck, and a 382 square foot workshop at the lower level. The 2,582 square foot proposed total has a FAR of 0.32 and is 81% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Third Review. First review was at ABR.)**

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(5:55)

Present: Amy Von Protz Architect; Marcia Briggs, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:00 p.m.

Chair Mahan acknowledged a letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition.

Public comment closed at 6:02 p.m.

**Motion:** Preliminary approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar, with the comment that the proposal provides consistency in appearance, compatible with the neighborhood, and provides quality architecture and materials.

Action: Carroll/Mosel, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained.)

## **PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

### **6. 3834 LA CUMBRE HILLS LN**

**E-3/SD-2 Zone**

**(6:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-009  
 Application Number: MST2007-00226  
 Owner: Deborah D. Hart  
 Owner: Matt Benwitt  
 Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal for a new two-story 2,485 square foot single-family residence and an attached 642 square foot three-car garage on a 12,454 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. A modification to allow a garage in excess of 500 square feet was approved by the Staff Hearing Officer. The proposal has a floor-to-lot-area ratio of 0.25.)

### **(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 080-07.)**

(6:17)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect; Matt Benwitt, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:32 p.m. The following individuals spoke in favor or opposition: Marcia Briggs, neither, trusts the Board for a house that is compatible with the neighborhood. Chair Mahan acknowledged a public comment letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition. Public comment closed at 6:33 p.m.

Straw Vote: How many can support the deck? 5/2/0.

**Motion:** Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings and return to Full Board for in-progress review with the following conditions:

- 1) Restudy the 3-car garage setback, specifically at the southeast corner.
- 2) Restudy the front lawn, and the paved and landscaped areas.
- 3) Indicate on the plans a 300 square foot area for future photovoltaic installation.
- 4) Show the drip line area of the oak trees. Provide an arborist report if the building penetrates the drip line.
- 5) Provide a schematic landscaping plan for the front and side yards.
- 6) Landscaping is to be compatible with the neighborhood.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed: not compatible with the character of the neighborhood.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****7. 1812 OVERLOOK LN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-094-020  
Application Number: MST2007-00414  
Owner: John and Julia Baucke, Living Trust  
Architect: Patrick Pouler

(Proposal for a 420 square foot second-story addition for an existing 3,100 square foot two-story single-family residence on a 20,462 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The addition includes an exterior stairway and 55 square foot balcony on the southwest elevation. The proposal has a FAR of 0.17 and is 75% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(7:04)

Present: Patrick Pouler, Architect; John Baucke, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:09 p.m. Mr. Mahan acknowledged an unsigned letter and a letter from Paula Westbury, both in opposition. Public comment closed at 7:11 p.m.

The Board does not support the addition over the garage. It does not integrate into the existing building, seems like a second unit, and the size, bulk, and scale are not compatible to the neighborhood. The applicant may return with a redesigned proposal.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board.**

Action: Zink/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****8. 627 DOLORES DR****E-1 Zone****(7:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-132-004  
Application Number: MST2007-00417  
Owner: Raul J. Navarro, Trust 5/15/03  
Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal for a 909 square foot two-story addition to an existing one-story single-family residence on a 7,300 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Included in the proposal is removal of an as-built second-story deck, a new 109 square foot second-story deck, and an as-built gazebo. The proposed total of 2,563 square feet has a FAR of 0.35 and is 85% of the maximum.)

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)**

**(THE PROPOSAL IS 85% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)**

(7:24)

Present: Jose Esparza, Architect; Raul Navarro, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:30 p.m. The following individuals expressed concerns:

Lorraine Berskovich: loss of view.

Jacquelyn Gist: loss of privacy.

Mr. Mahan acknowledged a letter from Paula Westbury, in opposition.

Public comment closed at 7:36 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Push back the deck to 15 feet from the property line.
- 2) Restudy the second floor to be smaller or reconfigure to enhance the architecture.
- 3) Lower the plate heights to 7 or 7 1/2 feet.
- 4) Restudy the garage roof.
- 5) Restudy the second story windows for privacy.
- 6) Show neighbor's windows on the site plan.
- 7) Show a simulation of second story view impacts.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:50 P.M. \*\***

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

**A. 1242 BEL AIR DR**

**E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-231-014

Application Number: MST2005-00834

Architect: Hugh Twibell

Owner: Peter Parish

(Proposal for a 362 square foot first-floor addition to an existing 1,944 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 448 square foot two-car garage. Lot size is 12,775 square feet located in the Hillside Design District. No grading is proposed. A modification is requested for encroachment into the interior setback.)

**(Second review of Review After Final for "as-built" roof-top HVAC ducts.)**

Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the condition that screen and duct work are to match color of house.

**NEW ITEM****B. 1117 PLAZA DEL MONTE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-360-016  
Application Number: MST2007-00478  
Owner: Iddings Family Trust 2/28/02  
Owner: David Iddings  
Engineer: Norman Caldwell

(Proposal to replace existing wooden deck (one 312 square feet and one 97 square feet) and add two new retaining walls (one in upper yard is 97 linear feet, one in lower yard is 77 linear feet).)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Continued one week with the following comments: 1) Reduce the distance between the southwest post of the covered deck and the retaining wall, to 4 feet; 2) Add stairs at mid-portion of the upper retaining wall; 3) Add oak tree protection measures to plans; 4) Study alternate footings near oak tree; 5) Show location of oak tree.

**NEW ITEM****C. 32 E JUNIPERO ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-123-006  
Application Number: MST2007-00380  
Owner: John and Les White  
Applicant: Christophe De Rose

(Proposal to abate zoning violations per ZIR2006-00398. Proposal for a 24 square foot first-floor projecting window addition, new garden wall, enclose an existing arch, a small fountain, a roof for existing outdoor barbeque, and a gate and arch at front wall. The existing 3,739 square foot single-family residence is located on a 14,727 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification for the front gate and arch to exceed 3.5 feet in height is requested. The proposal would result in a FAR of 0.26 which is 87% of the maximum.)

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)**

**(PROPOSAL IS 87% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)**

Continued to Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments: 1) The project poses no negative aesthetic impact to the neighborhood; 2) Provide photographs showing compatibility of the architecture.

**NEW ITEM**

**D. 838 VALES ST**

**E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-083-017  
Application Number: MST2007-00480  
Owner: McDaniel Dennis  
Architect: John Kenneth Grist

(Proposal to construct retaining walls at the front of an existing 2,266 square foot single-family residence.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Reduce the retaining wall to 5 feet in front. 2) Planters at the front are to be faced with manufactured stone; 3) Gate to be a see-through design; 4) Consider a cap on the 5 foot wall; 5) Provide color and material specifications; 6) Provide lighting details.

-----

Consent Calendar reviewed by Glen Deisler except items B and D reviewed by Glen Deisler and Erin Carroll.

**\*\*\* CONSENT CALENDAR ENDED AT 12:30 P.M. \*\*\***