



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, September 17, 2007      David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street      3:03 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**  
 WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR, Present  
 PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR, Present  
 BERNIE BERNSTEIN, Present  
 ERIN CARROLL, Absent  
 GLEN DEISLER, Present  
 GARY MOSEL, Present (arrived at 3:07 p.m.)  
 DENISE WOOLERY, Present

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** GRANT HOUSE

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON

**STAFF:**  
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present (from 3:00 p.m. until 3:18 p.m.)  
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician, Present  
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

*Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)*

Single Family Design Board Submittal Checklist		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><b>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</b></p> <p><b>Photographs</b> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &amp; neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also panoramic streetscape photos.</p> <p><b>Plans</b> - floor, roof, etc. drawn to scale, three sets of <u>folded</u> plans, minimum size 18" x 24", required <u>at time of submittal &amp; with each plan revision</u>.</p> <p><b>Vicinity Map and Project Statistics Forms/for Equivalent</b> - (Include on first sheet). If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also street elevation outlines.</p> <p><b>Site Plan</b> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing &amp; proposed structures, building &amp; area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading &amp; retaining walls, &amp; existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><b>Exterior elevations</b> - showing existing &amp; proposed grading where applicable. .</p> <p><b>Story Pole Plan</b> - if story poles are required for the project.</p> <p><b>Topographic Survey</b> - professional survey for sites averaging 15% or more.</p> <p><b>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation</b> - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p><b>Site Sections</b> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><b>Rough sketches</b> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete &amp; thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient project review.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><b>Site Sections</b> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><b>Preliminary Landscape Plans</b> - required for some single family projects, for example, where grading or new landscaped areas are proposed or for over 85% of max. FAR* projects. Proposed tree removal or planting and other proposed planting areas must be shown per SFDB Guidelines, Part 2: Landscape Design. At least 80% of landscaped areas must be allocated for water-wise plants. Paved areas must be shown and site statistics provided. Plans must include any street parkway strips.</p> <p><b>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation</b> - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p><b>Color &amp; Material Samples</b> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" &amp; detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><b>Exterior Details</b> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings &amp; must be complete &amp; accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><b>Color &amp; Material Samples</b> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><b>Cut Sheets</b> - exterior light fixtures and accessories or noise generating equipment dBA CNEL levels at property line, where applicable.</p> <p><b>Exterior Details</b> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><b>Final Landscape Plans</b> - landscape construction documents including additional planting specifications, erosion control measures and irrigation plan.</p> <p><b>Consultant/Engineer Plans</b> - electrical, mechanical, structural, &amp; plumbing where applicable.</p>

Chair Mahan called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of September 4, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion approved. (Mosel and Carroll absent.)

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 10, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler, September 10, 2007 with the exception of the landscaping for Items C, reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Action: Deisler/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 17, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.

Action: Deisler/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:

a) Board member Carroll will be absent.

b) Requested report from Consent Calendar Representatives:

Boardmember Deisler reported that he has not experienced negative impacts due to time constraints.

2. Mr. Limón reported that staff met with the Chair Mahan to provide input with respect to Site Concept Review requirements. As discussed in the recent NPO update, the purpose of the requirement is for the Board to focus on the site layout of proposals on vacant lots or proposed demolition/rebuilds prior to reviewing the architecture. There has been concern about providing early feedback on site concept layouts for new homes to ensure the home is properly sited. Mr. Limon added that the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines will be updated to include this review requirement.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Chair Mahan reported a camper parked and tent a installed at 625 N. Voluntario Street, he requested that staff investigate. Mr. Limon, Senior Planner, responded that staff has received a complaint from a neighbor who will be addressing the Board when Item #4, 625 N. Voluntario, is heard.

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****1. 614 N VOLUNTARIO ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-034  
 Application Number: MST2007-00412  
 Owner: Jose Luis Perez  
 Architect: Jose Esparza

Proposal to add a 495 square foot second-floor addition to an existing two-story 2,038 square foot single-family residence. The project will result in a 2,533 square foot single-family residence including the 475 square foot two-car garage on the 5,850 square foot lot. The proposal has a FAR of 0.43 and is 95% of the maximum guideline FAR.

**(Referred from Consent Calendar.)**

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(3:18)

Present: Jose Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Redesign the proposal to: reduce the square footage, recompose the front elevation, and resolve the overlapping roof.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan showing the existing landscaping and any proposed enhancements.
- 3) Relocate the gas and electric meters from the front of the house to the side of the garage.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW****2. 853 CALLE CORTITA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-176-020  
 Application Number: MST2007-00178  
 Owner: John C. Lawrence  
 Architect: Christopher Manson-Hing

Proposal for additions to an existing 1,382 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes conversion of 339 square feet of under-story to habitable space, a 46 square foot front entry addition, and rebuilding an existing 399 square foot two-car garage. The project is located on a 6,507 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Approval of a modification for improvements to the reconstructed garage in the front-yard setback is requested. The proposal has a floor-to-lot-area ratio of 0.33.

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 059-07.)**

(3:46)

Present: Christopher Manson-Hing, Architect; John Lawrence, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with return on Consent Calendar with the following conditions:**

- 1) Study the shingles and board and batten layout, particularly at the corner connection.
- 2) Provide color boards and light fixtures when returning on Consent Calendar.
- 3) The project is compatible in consistency and appearance, and is appropriate to the neighborhood on 4 elevations; compatible in scale to the neighborhood; provides quality architecture and materials; provides protection of the oak tree with the cantilever.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **3. 3825 LA CUMBRE HILLS LN**

**E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-042

Application Number: MST2007-00044

Owner: John and Marcia Briggs

Proposal for remodeling and additions to an existing 1,254 square foot single-family residence with an attached 418 square foot garage on an 8,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes converting an existing 336 square foot second-story deck to habitable space, a 192 square foot addition, a 45 square foot deck, and a 382 square foot workshop at the lower level. The 2,582 square foot proposed total has a FAR of 0.32 and is 81% of the maximum FAR.

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**(Second Review. First review was at ABR.)**

(4:06)

Present: Amy Von Protz, Agent; Marcia Briggs, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:16 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury: opposed.

Public comment closed at 4:18 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Study the garage setback.
- 2) Study the window layout and how it relates to the roof.
- 3) Study reducing the balcony cantilever to between 30 and 36 inches.
- 4) Study the stairs to the front door. Exposed stairs treads with an open wood handrail are preferred.
- 5) Study stepping back the second floor at the family room approximately 4 feet.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 4:37 P.M. UNTIL 4:48 P.M. \*\*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**4. 625 N VOLUNTARIO ST**

**R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-184-010  
 Application Number: MST2007-00416  
 Owner: Jose Luis and Guadalupe Martinez  
 Architect: Patricio Nava

Proposal to construct a 764 square foot two-story addition and a 293 square foot roof deck to an existing 1400 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 400 square foot garage. The proposal includes demolition of 41 square foot entry to the existing residence. The proposal will result in a 2,523 square foot two-story residence with an attached two-car garage on an approximate 4,984 square foot lot. The 2,523 square foot proposed total has a FAR of 0.50 and is 103% of the maximum guideline FAR.

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(4:48)

Present: Patricio Nava, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m. The following individuals spoke opposition:

Matilda Monarrez: expressed concerns regarding noise and opposed to windows oriented toward her property. Submitted photographs.

Paula Westbury: opposed.

Public comment closed at 5:04 p.m.

Straw Vote: how many Board members can support, with mitigation of the decks, the size of the proposal? 2/4/0.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) The Board understands that what appears to be plate height dimension is actually a denotation to the sheathing top, and finds that acceptable.
- 2) When returning to Full Board, provide evidence of abated violations (camper/tent).
- 3) Provide a six foot plastered sound wall at the north and west property lines.
- 4) Shorten the south deck by 5-1/2 feet to allow the ridge at the garage to make contact with the vertical wall.
- 5) Eliminate the north deck.
- 6) Provide a preliminary landscaping plan showing hardscape, permeable paving, and proposed landscaping.
- 7) Study adding Spanish doors.
- 8) Provide a 20 closest home analysis.
- 9) Reduce the overall size of the proposal.
- 10) Replace the chain link fences with more traditional walls and gates.
- 11) Study reducing the size, bulk, and scale in area, height or both.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Erin Carroll absent.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****5. 129 CALLE BELLO****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-340-005  
Application Number: MST2007-00193  
Owner: Oscar Ball  
Designer: Ubaldo Diaz

Proposal to remove an unpermitted storage shed and deck and to construct a new detached one-story 500 square foot accessory structure at the same location with a new 310 square foot observation deck. The proposal includes removal of the existing Allan Block walls and construction of new retaining walls ranging from 3'-6" to 7'-0" in height. The project is located in the Hillside Design District on a 1.72 acre site. This proposal will abate the violations outlined in ENF2007-00051 and ENF2007-00692.

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)**

(5:43)

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; Ubaldo Diaz, Designer; Oscar Ball, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:57 p.m. The following individuals spoke in opposition:

Bob Hanrahan: opposed to location and size; Lynn Garten, representing UHIA and VCOA; Jim Hackett; Richard St. Clair: submitted photographs and site maps; George Fryer, representing VCOA; Elberta Pate; Kathleen Weinheimer, representing Richard St. Clair; Ellen Orlando; Paula Westbury; Jack Sheehan: opposed to size.

Public comment closed at 6:18 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members feel the site is appropriate for construction of an accessory structure? 2/4/0.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Complete a seismic analysis of the site indicating the fault location. Design an accessory structure that will not be impacted by the fault.
- 2) The accessory structure shall be dug into the landscape and have minimal visual impact to the hillside.
- 3) Revise the architecture to be low key and modest, to blend with the hillside, as opposed to the gable.
- 4) Provide exterior lighting details.

Action: Zink/Deisler, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

**\*\*\*\*\*THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:45 P.M. UNTIL 7:11 P.M. \*\*\*\*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****6. 3924 CAMELLIA LN****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-222-017  
 Application Number: MST2007-00397  
 Owner: Richard and Maria Macabio  
 Architect: Bryan Pollard

Proposal for a new 347 square foot second-story addition to an existing 2,202 square foot one-story residence with a two-car garage. Also proposed on this 7,015 square foot lot is a second-story, 39 square foot balcony. The proposal would result in a floor-to-lot-area ratio of 0.36.

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(7:11)

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:25 p.m. The following individuals spoke in opposition:

Tom Garner, submitted photos; Mona Nichol; Judy Wood; Lisa Lawson; Carol Stahmer; Andrea Gaines; Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 7:40 p.m.

Straw vote: how many Board members can support further expanding the size of the house? 2/4/0.

**Motion: Deny without prejudice the application as presented.** The Board finds the existing single-family residence is at the maximum appropriate size for the lot and neighborhood.

**Action:** Woolery/Bernstein, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent. Mosel and Zink opposed.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****7. 943 JIMENO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-051-027  
 Application Number: MST2007-00398  
 Owner: Irwin and Marilyn Carasso Trust  
 Architect: Jeff Gorrell

Proposal to construct a 1,100 square foot second-story addition, a 1,045 square foot one-story addition, convert 257 square feet of existing lower level floor area to crawl space, a new pool and 637 square foot pool deck to an existing single-family residence located in the Hillside Design District. The proposal will result in a 4,386 square foot two-story home which includes an attached two-car garage. A modification is proposed to expand the garage into the required front-yard setback in order to meet the minimum interior dimensions. The proposal has an FAR of 0.21 and is 93% of the maximum guideline FAR.

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)**

(7:55)

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect, Lenvik & Minor.

Public comment opened at 8:09 p.m. The following individuals spoke in opposition:

Reed Wilson: opposed to mass, size, and scale; Russ Jones; Paula Westbury: opposed; Clay Cole: concerned with height, submitted comment letter.

Public comment closed at 8:17 p.m.

The Board discussed the compatibility of the neighborhood.

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the modification for leaving the garage in the same location? 5/1/0. (Zink opposed.)

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Redesign the proposal to be smaller and lower, perhaps lower plate heights.
- 2) The existing garage is supportable in its current approximate location.
- 3) Eliminate the glass handrails.

Action: Mosel/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll absent.)

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **8. 1533 SAN MIGUEL AVE**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-131-002  
Application Number: MST2007-00020  
Owner: Wesley E. Sizer, Family Trust  
Architect: Paul Robert

Revised proposal for a new two-story 4,900 square foot single-family residence which includes a 500 square foot basement and 700 square foot attached two-car garage on a 24,589 square foot lot. The existing 1600 square foot residence and garage will be demolished. The proposal includes 500 square feet of accessory structures, a swimming pool, driveway, and 400 cubic yards total of cut and fill grading under the building footprint. The proposal has a FAR of 0.22.

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**(Third Concept Review. First review was at ABR.)**

(8:42)

Present: Robert Foley, Architect; William and Jennifer Brummet, Owners.

Public comment opened at 8:52 p.m. The following individuals spoke in favor or opposition:

Joe Lackerd: opposed; Michelle Gibbs: in favor; Paula Westbury: opposed.

Public comment closed at 8:58 p.m.

**Motion:** Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and return to Full Board with the following conditions:

- 1) Return for an in-progress review of the landscaping and accessory buildings.
- 2) Lower the east wing to three levels, following the grade.
- 3) The project is compatible with the neighborhood in appearance, quality of architecture and materials. Size, bulk and scale are appropriate to the site.

**Action:** Zink/Woolery, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Opposed: Bernstein and Mahan due to size. Carroll absent.)

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **9. 1394 SHORELINE DR**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-193-021  
 Application Number: MST2007-00344  
 Owner: Kristiaan D'Haese  
 Architect: Paul Zink

Proposal to construct a new two-story 3,067 square foot house and attached 500 square foot garage. The existing 1,109 square foot house and attached 400 square foot garage on the 9,781 square foot lot will be demolished. The project is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. The proposed total of 3,567 square feet has a FAR of 0.36 and is 98% of the maximum FAR.

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**(THE PROPOSAL IS ABOVE 85% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)**

(9:16)

**Present:** Paul Zink, Architect; Jaime Herman-Pearce, Landscape Architect; Kristiaan D'Haese, Owner.

Public comment opened at 9:29 p.m. The following individuals spoke in opposition:

Pete Schenck; Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 9:35 p.m.

**Motion:** Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and return to Full Board for in progress review with the following conditions:

- 1) Return to Full Board for an in progress review of details and a solution for extending the porch across the front windows.
- 2) The project is compatible to the neighborhood in consistency and appearance; compatible in scale; quality of architecture and materials; and preservation of trees.

**Action:** Woolery/Mosel, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed: due to size. Carroll absent; Zink stepped down.)

## CONSENT CALENDAR

### FINAL REVIEW

#### A. 1253 DOVER LN

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-220-024

Application Number: MST2007-00406

Owner: Mason Family Trust 4/22/02

(Proposal to demolish an existing 70 square foot day room, and constructing a 391 square foot family room with covered terrace, to an existing 897 square foot single-family residence in the Hillside Design District.)

Final Approval with the condition that the applicant to provide staff with a cut sheet of light fixtures.

### FINAL REVIEW

#### B. 16 NICHOLAS LN

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-033-001

Application Number: MST2003-00721

Owner: Paul Kontos

(Proposal for a 1,418 square foot second-floor addition over an existing 1,688 square foot residence with a 473 square foot attached two-car garage located in the Hillside Design District on a 16,216 square foot lot. A 150 square foot turret and 285 square feet of second-floor covered porches are also proposed. The 152 square foot workshop at the rear of the garage will be converted to a covered porch. The project received Preliminary Approval on January 26, 2004 and has since expired.)

**(Request for reinstatement of prior ABR approval.)**

Reinstated the expired Preliminary Approval and Final Approval with the condition that the wall is to be stucco to match the house.

### CONTINUED ITEM

#### C. 937 CIMA LINDA LN

A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-009

Application Number: MST2007-00314

Owner: Montesano Family Trust

Architect: Lenvik &amp; Minor

(Proposal to replace existing windows and doors, convert the existing three-car garage at the west elevation to habitable space, revise the east wing facade and balcony, revise and replace the south terrace and trellis, revise the pool terrace, add a spa and BBQ, etc. Landscaping improvements including, terraced retaining walls, paths, and revegetate 2.2 acres on a sloped hillside. Existing three-car garage at east wing is proposed to remain.)

**(Second concept review.)**

Preliminary Approval of the architecture and landscaping with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code. Final Approval of the vegetation removal.

**NEW ITEM****D. 1126 HARBOR HILLS DR**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-313-004

Application Number: MST2007-00445

Owner: William B. Morgan

Contractor: Allied Fence Company

(Proposal for installation of approximately 450 linear feet of a 5 foot high black vinyl chain link fence and 32 linear feet of 5 foot high black ornamental iron and one (1) 15 foot single swing gate.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the condition that the applicant is to use existing plant palette to screen the chain link fence from street view.

-----  
Consent Calendar reviewed by Glen Deisler with exception of landscape on Items C and D, reviewed by Denise Woolery.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:05 P.M. \*\***