



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 10, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Grumbine (at 4:22 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger (at 1:34 p.m., until 5:00 p.m.), and Suding (until 4:55 p.m.)

Members absent: Drury and Veyna

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Sanchez

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There will be an HLC Designation Subcommittee meeting on Wednesday, February 24, 2016 at 10:00 a.m. in the Community Development 2nd Floor Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 27, 2016, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 4/0/2. (La Voie and Orías abstained; Murray abstained on Items 9 & 10/Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Drury and Veyna will be absent.
- b. Commissioner Grumbine will be late.
- c. Chair Suding will leave at 4:55 p.m.; Commissioner Shallenberger will leave at 5:00 p.m.; Commissioner La Voie will leave at 5:30 p.m.

2. Mr. Limón announced a public workshop of the draft wireless ordinance on February 24 at 5:00 p.m. The City is required to update the ordinance by federal law. Design aesthetics will also be discussed, and the HLC will review the ordinance at a later date.

3. Chair Suding announced that he attended a Building & Fire Code Board of Appeals meeting on February 8 to talk about 29-37 E. Victoria Street's fire sprinklers requirement. The applicant is utilizing the California Historical Building Code to design an alternative to traditional fire sprinklers in order to preserve the building. Chair Suding spoke as a member of the public and on behalf of the HLC, stating that the Commission desired to protect the resource as best as possible.

Mr. Limón added that because of the length of the presentations and testimony, the item was continued.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**1. 610-612 & 618 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-032
 Application Number: MST2016-00018
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Applicant: Post/Hazeltine Associates
 Architect: Keith Nolan

(Review of a Phase I Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Review of historic significance of the properties only, no project is proposed. The report concludes that the house at 612 Castillo Street [excluding post-1925 alterations and the rear wing] and the house and sandstone retaining wall at 618 Castillo Street [excluding post-1925 alterations] are significant historic resources and are contributors to the potential Castillo Street Historic District-West Downtown. The house at 610 Castillo Street, the garage behind 612 Castillo Street, the garage/storage room behind 618 Castillo Street, and the concrete retaining wall in front of 610-612 Castillo Street are not significant historic resources.)

Actual time: 1:39 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that the agenda item description left out one detail, that the report concluded that the cottage behind 610 Castillo Street is also not significant. She has reviewed and agrees with the conclusions of the report.

Public comment opened at 1:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orías expressed that any development in the area should be sensitive to the neighborhood.
2. Commissioner La Voie expressed appreciation for the figures in the report and requested that they be placed throughout the text in the future.
3. Commissioner Murray echoed the appreciation of the figures and thanked the property owner for doing this work prior to project design.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comments:

1. When returning as part of a project, the report should include the impact on landscaping and trees.
2. The Commission requests initiation of Structure of Merit designation for 618 Castillo Street.

Action: Shalanberger/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 100 BLK S SOLEDAD STREET**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-495
 Application Number: MST2015-00294
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Laura Yanez
 Engineer: Thomas Conti

(Proposal for the Cacique and Soledad Street Pedestrian and Bicycle Bridges and Corridor Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on Cacique Street from Salinas to Alisos Streets and along Soledad Street from Cacique to Montecito Streets. Improvements will include the removal of the existing dilapidated wood pedestrian bridge along Cacique Street, construction of two pedestrian bicycle bridges along Cacique and Soledad Streets over Sycamore Creek, construction of sidewalks on Soledad and Cacique Streets, adjustment of intersection controls at certain corridor intersections to favor bicycle boulevard movements along Cacique Street, installation of pedestrian and bicycle-oriented lighting throughout the corridor and bridges, and riparian habitat enhancement.)

(Review of an Archeological Survey Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Thomas Conti, Bengal Engineering; and Colleen Hamilton, Applied Earthworks, Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed both the archaeological report and memorandum pertaining to the Cacique and Soledad Pedestrian/Bicycle Bridges and Corridor Improvements. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the conclusions and recommendations in both the report and the memorandum.

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Orías requested that when a significant tree is mentioned, a picture be included to identify it.

Motion: To accept the report with condition:

1. Replace the tipu tree with a tree of a similar biomass.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 6100 HOLLISTER AVE****A-I-1/SP-6 Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2014-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport Admin.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Applicant: Direct Relief
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 152 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing six main buildings and five outbuildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan [SP-6]. The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet [and reservation of 30,000 square feet] of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

(Review of a Supplemental Phase II Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone & Ken Victorino, Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report concerning the proposed warehouse development at 6100 Hollister Avenue. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. He is concerned, however, that no consideration was given to a no-project alternative or a modified project that would avoid impacts to the archaeological site (CA-SBA-59). This site, as well as all other prehistoric and protohistoric sites around the perimeter of the ancient Goleta Slough estuary, have undergone significant degradation over the last several decades due to various kinds of land development, and each new development project such as the one proposed is taking away archaeologists' ability to understand the prehistory of one of the most significant localities along the California coast. Because of the wide variety of natural resources that were available within and around the perimeter of the ancient estuary, it was a premier focus of settlement along the California coast for at least 8,000 years, with a population concentration higher than along the whole coastline of the state aside from San Francisco Bay. At the beginning of the Mission Period, three Chumash villages existed next to the estuary, with the largest total population among all Chumash settlement localities. Past archaeological projects, most being small-scale, have been in response to development projects such as the one proposed, and they have only scratched the surface of the rich prehistory of the locality. Further destruction of archaeological deposits will continue to reduce the possibility to learn about the unique prehistory of the estuary environs.

If the City decides to proceed with a Phase 3 data recovery project, the recommendations in the Recommended Action/Mitigation Measures section for a future Phase 3 project are reasonable and consistent with the City's guidelines. However, he proposes a few caveats. First, if distinctive features such as a house floor or baking pit are found to extend beyond the walls of a 1x1-meter test pit, the option should exist to expand the excavation to expose the whole feature. Second, if a

human burial is encountered within a test pit and the excavation therefore is terminated, the option should exist to excavate a pit at an alternative location. Third, archaeologists proposing to undertake a future Phase 3 project should be allowed some flexibility in determining the size and placement of excavation pits so long as the proposed plan of excavation is essentially consistent with City guidelines.

2. Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, recommended that the HLC accept the report and that the three items mentioned by Dr. Glassow be conditioned to be incorporated into the report and verified by staff. She further explained the timeline of the project.

Commissioner comments: Commissioners expressed concern about the impact of the project outside of the ancient slough and the potential removal of important archaeological areas from further investigation.

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**** The Commission recessed from 2:07 p.m. to 2:11 p.m. to review Dr. Glassow's comments and Mr. Stone's amended text. ****

Motion: To accept the report with condition:

1. The Commission accepts Dr. Glassow's comments and requires that they be inserted and addressed in the report, with the changes reviewed and approved by Dr. Glassow; confirmation of his approval shall be provided to the Commission.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 1300 BLK E YANONALI ST 1095 SEG ID

(2:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-095
 Application Number: MST2015-00317
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Craig Drake
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Public Works
 Engineer: Matt Burgard

(Proposal for the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge and Pedestrian Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on E. Montecito Street from Canada Street to the Five Points Roundabout and along N. Salinas Street from E. Mason to Clifton Streets. Improvements will include the installation of 270 linear feet of sidewalk along E. Montecito Street between E. Yanonali Street and Montecito Place and 700 linear feet of sidewalk along N. Salinas Street between E. Mason and Clifton Streets, the widening of the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge to include sidewalk along the east side, and shoulders for cyclists on both sides of the bridge. Existing sandstone will be used. An all-way stop will be installed at the intersection of E. Montecito and E. Yanonali Streets to improve pedestrian safety at a blind corner. Pedestrian scale lighting will be added along E. Yanonali, E. Montecito, and N. Salinas Streets to increase safety on pedestrian routes to the adjacent schools.)

(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Colleen Hamilton, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.; Andrew Grubb, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report regarding the proposed Montecito-Yanonali Street Bridge Replacement and Pedestrian Improvements Project. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. However, he wondered about the recommendation of monitoring earth-moving by a Chumash monitor but not by an archaeologist. The very low likelihood of cultural resources within the project area is well-argued, and monitoring does not seem necessary. He acknowledged, however, that some of the Chumash people recommended monitoring. Although some Chumash monitors are as good as archaeologists in recognizing cultural deposits, not all are. If any monitoring is to be done, he recommended that an archaeologist be involved as well.

Public comment opened at 2:42 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with incorporation of Dr. Glassow's recommendation.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1300 BLK E YANONALI ST 1095 SEG ID

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	ROW-001-095
Application Number:	MST2015-00317
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Agent:	Craig Drake
Applicant:	City of Santa Barbara - Public Works
Engineer:	Matt Burgard

(Proposal for the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge and Pedestrian Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on E. Montecito Street from Canada Street to the Five Points Roundabout and along N. Salinas Street from E. Mason to Clifton Streets. Improvements will include the installation of 270 linear feet of sidewalk along E. Montecito Street between E. Yanonali Street and Montecito Place and 700 linear feet of sidewalk along N. Salinas Street between E. Mason and Clifton Streets, the widening of the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge to include sidewalk along the east side, and shoulders for cyclists on both sides of the bridge. Existing sandstone will be used. An all-way stop will be installed at the intersection of E. Montecito and E. Yanonali Streets to improve pedestrian safety at a blind corner. Pedestrian scale lighting will be added along E. Yanonali, E. Montecito, and N. Salinas Streets to increase safety on pedestrian routes to the adjacent schools.)

(Courtesy review; comments only.)

Actual time: 2:45 p.m.

Present: Andrew Grubb, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Craig Drake, Project Manager, Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orías expressed appreciation for the installation of jacarandas and the pedestrian walkway separate from the bike lane.
2. Commissioner La Voie stated that board formed concrete for the middle panel of the bridge would be appropriate.

3. Chair Suding also stated that board formed concrete is preferable to a form liner emulating sandstone. He suggested that the railing is confusing, as it uses too many styles, and that the pedestrian railings need to tie into the piers.
4. Commissioner Shallenberger stated that some details need refining, including the capping of the rails and the shape of the tube steel; how they will terminate into the piers is an important detail. He also finds natural concrete appropriate for the middle panel of the bridge. He expressed concern for the cumulative effect of City bridge replacements, stating that the widened bridges are changing the character of these neighborhoods.
5. Commissioner Mahan stated that it is important to have real sandstone underneath the bridge. He also suggested a pyramid shape on the tops of the piers for draining.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:05 P.M. TO 3:14 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
 Application Number: MST2013-00312
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Public Works
 Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 55.5 feet long and 47 feet wide.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 18, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Jim Colton, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Craig Drake, Project Manager, Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.; and William Bishop, Landscape Architect, Van Atta Associates

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Correct the sections as shown on sheet S-14; show panels consistent with the extant bridge on the elevations of the new bridge.
2. Present a different proposal for the side wall finishing. A sandstone form liner will not be acceptable; béton brut is preferred.
3. The fence perpendicular to the roadway shall be wrought iron.
4. Add kickers if possible to the underside of the road deck at the beam to wall connection.

Action: La Voie/Shallenberger, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 401 SHORELINE DR****HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone**

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2016-00045
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Keven Strasburg

(Conceptual review of the proposed removal and replacement of hitching post-style bike racks in front of Los Baños del Mar Pool. Different options to remove, replace, and increase the capacity of bike parking are proposed including hitching post, hoop, and peak bike racks. This project is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The Los Baños del Mar Pool c. 1931 and 1992 is in the National Register of Historic Places.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and coastal review.)

Actual time: 3:50 p.m.

Present: George Thompson, Parks Capital Projects Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara; and Kevin Strasburg, Parks Project Technician, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman requested that in its comments, the Commission list what it likes and does not like for the chosen option.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent calendar with comments:

1. The Commission supports Option 1A, with enhanced landscaping along the entrance and façade of the building.
2. Study the fabrication of the hoop rack out of solid square stock, mostly likely 1.5 inches, with a square mounting bracket.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 301 E YANONALI ST****M-1/SP-2/SD-3 Zone****(4:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-005
 Application Number: MST2012-00494
 Owner: The Wright Partners
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Concept review only. Proposal to construct a new 44,211 square foot two-story commercial building to include a market and retail spaces with 186 parking spaces on the 3.16 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo and the SP-2 Cabrillo Plaza Specific Plan area. Parking is to be provided in a podium parking structure with the market above. Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit and Development Plan square footage is requested.)

(Third concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit and Development Plan. Project last reviewed on January 27, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:09 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 4:23 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with positive comments:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met as follows: The project is (1) in compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code and consistent with HLC Design Guidelines; (2) compatible with the architectural character of the city, the neighborhood, and the El Pueblo Viejo District; (3) appropriate in size, bulk, and scale; (4) sensitive to adjacent Landmarks and historic resources; (5) responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas; and (6) the use of open space and landscaping is appropriate to the project and City standards.
2. The Commission recommends evaluation by the Planning Commission of view impairment.
3. Restudy the location of the escalator to be less visible.
4. Provide the same design attention to the three-story elements of the building and make more compatible with the chosen Monterey style.
5. The Commission in its majority accepts the current proposal of massing and roofline and suggests consideration of certain elements to make it less uniform, particularly on the north elevation.
6. Certain structural elements should be more appropriate to the scale of architecture: the bay piers and the base of the water tower.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Suding, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**9. 29 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00087
 Owner: Tioga Holdings, LP
 Contractor: Total Heating & Air
 Business Name: Ca' Dario

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to address violations of enforcement case [ENF2014-01029] and permit "as-built" exterior alterations on an existing commercial building, including two [2] on-demand water heaters, lot line fence, and additional decorative elements. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Spanish Colonial building designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings c. 1922.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on January 27, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:01 p.m.

Present: Michael Chenoweth, representative of the Owner; and Craig Burdick, Studio 1030 Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that she spoke to Public Works about the outdoor dining furniture. The permit is still valid for three tables and six chairs. She also clarified that the fence is part of the enforcement case, and staff will need to investigate whether the height of the wall will present any visibility issues in the driveway.

Public comment opened at 5:06 p.m.

1. Jesse Swanhuysen, representative of the neighboring Rehling family, discussed compatibility concerns of the building. He pointed out the differences in a wall that existed prior to the current wall and expressed concerns about the material and height of the wall as proposed.
2. Valerie Rehling ceded her time to Jesse Swanhuysen.
3. Virginia Rehling ceded her time to Jesse Swanhuysen.
4. William Rehling showed photographs of the view of the building from a neighboring Structure of Merit and of the outdoor dining furniture.

Public comment closed at 5:17 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The applicant shall consider the requests of the Commission and accurately show on the plans and/or provide photo documentation of plasters, new walls, and existing equipment.
2. Study a wall that will reasonably screen the equipment from the neighbors; the wall shall be a masonry wall or sufficiently built to provide similar sound attenuation.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 5/0/0. (Drury, Shallenberger, Suding, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:35 P.M. ****