



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 25, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:44 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:48 p.m.) Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the previous meeting minutes with respect to the discussion item of the Italian Stone Pine trees located along the 300 - 800 block of E. Anapamu Street.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 11, 2013, with corrections.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 6/0/1. (Orías abstained. Boucher/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioner Boucher would be absent from the meeting.
2. Chair Suding announced that on Tuesday, September 24, 2013, he and Commissioner Drury conducted a site visit at the Lobero Theatre to view a mock-up of proposed sign lighting (which must return to the HLC full board for approval of a Review After Final).
3. Commissioner Orías requested a time and date for a tour of the Santa Barbara Museum of Art. It has not been scheduled, but Staff will inform the Commission as soon as it is.
4. Chair Suding announced that on September 18 he and Commissioners Murray and Sharpe attended a “Walkabout” of a portion of the Safe Passage Corridor project.
5. Commissioner La Voie and Chair Suding reported on the semi-annual joint meeting of the City Council and Planning Commission that was held on Thursday, September 12.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Limón stated that Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, plans to apply for a State grant to fund a demonstration project for a permeable city street improvement site. He would like to meet with one Commissioner on Friday, October 4, 2013, to discuss possible locations, design and materials. Jill Zachary, Parks and Recreation Assistant Director, gave insight on the process. Chair Suding agreed to attend the meeting.

INFORMATION ITEM1. **HISTORIC FRANCESCHI FLAME TREE**

(1:45) **Presenter:** Jill Zachary, Assistant Director, Parks and Recreation Department
(Presentation on the treatment and propagation plan for the Historic Franceschi Flame Tree located in Parking Lot 12.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

The Commission recessed from 1:53 p.m. to 1:56 p.m.

Staff comments: Jill Zachary, Parks and Recreation Department Assistant Director, stated that the tree was designated as a City Landmark Tree in 2002. It is the last remnant of Dr. Francesco Franceschi's nursery on lower State Street. The tree suffers from white-rot decay and poses a significant safety hazard. Staff has a proposed approach for treatment and a propagation plan to preserve and replicate it.

In a related matter, Parks and Recreation Department Staff will give a presentation in the month of November, 2013, to illustrate aspects of the Commission's involvement in the preservation enhancement of historic trees that are being proposed as part of the City of Santa Barbara Urban Forest Management Plan currently under development.

Tim Downey, City Arborist/Urban Forest Superintendent, stated that the tree has been declining due to its age and the construction around it. White-rot fungus limits the amount of moisture and nutrients from getting to the upper foliage due to the tree's decay. The base of the tree has eroded away and lack of support has brought safety concerns. The preservation plan for the tree includes reducing its height, preserve it in place for a while, propagate clones for eventual replacement, and monitor its health to evaluate whether it can remain longer or if it should be removed. Information will be posted at the location of the tree as to what is happening to the historic tree.

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commended staff for its efforts to save the tree. He questioned whether there are other examples of trees of this type in the city, if Dr. Franceschi combined two species, and why he chose it. Mr. Downey responded that the determination of the species was based on examination of the foliage and it is unknown who hybridized the tree. What is known is that it was being sold in Dr. Franceschi's nursery. There is a similar tree in Goleta called the Sexton Flame Tree.

Public comment closed at 2:07 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. Appreciation was expressed for the presentation and propagation plan.
2. Propagation as a form of preservation is supportable.
3. Every effort should be made to inform the public before the tree is reduced in height.
4. This type of communication with the Commission as well as alerting the public with respect to significant trees is what was envisioned as a collaborative effort to save them.

PUBLIC HEARING

2. 117 W MASON ST

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Consideration to adopt a resolution to designate the "Spanish Colonial Revival residence" constructed in 1931 as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the property qualifies for Structure of Merit status as per the Santa Barbara Municipal Code 22.22.040 under Criterion A and D. The building retains its integrity of location, configuration, design, materials and setting to qualify for designation.

Motion: To adopt a resolution to designate the “Spanish Colonial Revival residence,” located at 117 W. Mason Street, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. **33 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:10) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-181-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00327
 Owner: Unity Shoppe, Inc
 Architect: PMSM Architects
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Victoria Hall Theater

(Proposed renovation and seismic upgrade including a rerouted circulation pattern at the front entry, reconstruction of the stage house at the south elevation, and raising the existing roof height to 55 feet to accommodate a new fly loft. Changes will occur on the north, east, and south elevations. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit. This is a *Structure of Merit*: "Former First Baptist Church." The building is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places.)

(Review After Final of exterior color selection and change of decking material. Requires Historic Resource findings.)

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Jason Currie, Project Manager, PMSM
 Derek Westen, Board Member, Ensemble Theater Company

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final of exterior colors as proposed with the condition that the paving material for the courtyard is not approved.

Action: Shalanberger/La Voie, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for applicant to restudy the paving material in the courtyard with comments:

1. Study using a paving material that is a more appropriate solution for the deck. The wooden decking material is not historically appropriate.
2. The paving material shall have the appearance of concrete pavers.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 1528 CLIFF DR**

E-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-005
Application Number: MST2013-00063
Owner: Silvia Ronchietto
Applicant: Wallace Ronchietto
Architect: Lawrence Thompson Architects, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a 503 square foot detached two-car garage which includes a 24 square foot second floor master bathroom addition for an existing, 3,272 square foot, two-story single-family residence. The primary façade of the garage would face La Vista del Océano Drive. Also proposed are alterations to existing windows on the south and west elevations, a pergola from the Cliff Drive frontage to an existing entry door, and brick-paved patios at the south elevation. Total development on site would be 3,775 square feet, which is .298, or 93% of the maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio. Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification is requested for the garage location.)

(Requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings and compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 050-13.)

Actual time: 2:46 p.m.

Present: Lawrence Thompson, Architect

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with the following finding and comment:

1. The **Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria** have been met as stated in Subsection 22.68.060 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and that the project.
2. The project is in compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution with respect to the proposed front setback modification to allow a two-car garage to be constructed and the installation of a new door under the entry stairs within the required front yard setback along the La Vista del Océano Drive frontage.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 1017 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-018
 Application Number: MST2013-00390
 Owner: Victor William & Susan Marie Schaff
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This project involves one building spanning two separate parcels: 039-281-018 and -019. Proposal for a total 136 square foot addition (68 square feet in each of two retail spaces) resulting from the relocation of existing entry doors towards the street. New doors, windows, and tile base are proposed on the front elevation and door and window changes are proposed on the rear elevation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)

Actual time: 2:54 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with the following findings and conditions:

1. **CEQA Findings made as follows:** The Historic Landmarks Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
2. The tile selection shall be a hand-made black tile and return to Staff for final determination.
3. The buttresses shall have the scalloped detail recess of the adjacent property.
4. The sidewalk material shall be run to the base of the tile brick.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:07 P.M. TO 3:12 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**6. 1746 PROSPECT AVE**

R-2 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-027
 Application Number: MST2013-00391
 Owner: Kathleen Luke
 Applicant: Thomas C. McMahon, AIA

(Proposal to demolish two existing second floor dormers, construct two new second floor dormers in the same location, raise the roofline by 3'-6", and add a new French door on the rear elevation.)

(Review of an Amendment to the Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan. The report found that the proposed alterations represent a less-than-significant impact on a structure found to be worthy of Structure of Merit status.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Tom McMahon, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff reviewed the Amendment to the Historic Structures Report and agrees with the report's conclusions that the proposed addition of the dormers at the rear elevation meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for rehabilitation of a historic resource.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the report lacked a street façade of the building and that it would be important to note whether changes to the house would impact the public view. Staff responded that the project will occur in the rear and out of public view.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Murray/Sharpe, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Boucher/Shallanberger absent. La Voie abstained on the premise that he did not receive a copy of the report.)

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

7. 1746 PROSPECT AVE

R-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-027
Application Number: MST2013-00391
Owner: Kathleen Luke
Applicant: Thomas C. McMahon, AIA

(Proposal to demolish two existing second floor dormers, construct two new second floor dormers in the same location, raise the roofline by 3'-6", and add a new French door on the rear elevation.)

(Request by Staff to add the structure at 1746 Prospect Avenue to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Tom McMahon, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the structure was deemed eligible as a historic resource in the 2006 Historic Structures Report.

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept Staff's recommendation of placing the structure located at 1746 Prospect Avenue on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Murray/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**8. 1746 PROSPECT AVE** **R-2 Zone**

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-027
 Application Number: MST2013-00391
 Owner: Kathleen Luke
 Applicant: Thomas C. McMahon, AIA

(Proposal to demolish two existing second floor dormers, construct two new second floor dormers in the same location, raise the roofline by 3'-6", and add a new French door on the rear elevation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Tom McMahon, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Project Design and Final Approvals** with the following finding and condition:

1. The **Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria** have been met as stated in Subsection 22.68.060 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.
2. The pergola brackets shall be removed, the surfaces patched and repainted to match the existing building.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****A. 613 E VICTORIA ST** **R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-093-015
 Application Number: MST2013-00338
 Owner: Giegerich-Polchin Family Trust
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal to permit an as-built 219 square foot ground floor addition to the rear of an existing 1,216 square foot, one story single-family residence with detached one-car garage. Other alterations will address violations called out in Zoning Information Report ZIR2002-00154 to lower the hedge height, demolish an unpermitted service porch and relocate the water heater, remove a trellis and storage from the required setbacks and garage, and permit site walls which range in height from 3'-6" to 5'-8". Also proposed is to construct a new trellis. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification. This is a *contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District.*)

(Comments only; requires Staff Hearing Officer Review.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the positive comment that the addition matches the existing architecture.

NEW ITEM**B. 601 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-010
Application Number: MST2013-00370
Owner: Rosenquist Family Trust
Agent: Paul Eggli

(Proposal to repave an approximately 180 square feet area and construct a 10'-0" x 19'-0" wood trash enclosure with access gates. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2012-01143.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 24 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-051
Application Number: MST2013-00349
Owner: Rycama, LLC
Applicant: Lynx Property Management
Architect: Wayne Labrie Architect

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to an existing courtyard patio. The project includes a new plaster and wrought iron enclosure, infill of a pair of existing French doors, new paving, planters, and awnings. This is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources*: "Old Livery Stable & Carriage Factory, Sprague Livery Stable.")

(Second Review.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the main color to be Frazee "Folding Chair" CL1704D and wainscot to be Frazee "Nebraska" CL1695D.

NEW ITEM**D. 419 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-031
Application Number: MST2013-00392
Owner: Peter Lewis
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an illegal 360 square foot unenclosed structure at the rear elevation and construct a new accessible ramp, entry door, and three new windows. No new floor area is proposed.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:22 P.M. ****