



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 31, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Absent
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor – Absent
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Orías (at 2:10 p.m.), Shallanberger (1:33 p.m. to 2:07 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher and Murray.

Staff present: Limón, Hernández (until 3:39 p.m.), Gantz (until 5:00 p.m.), and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the previous Historic Landmarks Commission meeting.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 17, 2013, as presented.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Boucher and Murray would be absent from the meeting and Commissioner Orías would be arriving late.
- b) Chair Suding would be stepping down from Items 1 and 2 at 209 E. Islay Street, Item 6 at 902 Chapala Street, and Item 8 at 35 State Street.
- c) Item 6 at 902 Chapala Street was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:33 P.M. TO 1:36 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. **209 E ISLAY ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-042-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00250
 Owner: Peter and Lisa Camenzind
 Architect: James Lecron

(Proposed demolition of a 3,817 square foot single-family dwelling.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report determined that the house, garage, and exterior sandstone fireplace are not significant historic resources but the sandstone retaining wall is eligible for Structure of Merit Status.)

Actual time: 1:36 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine
 Peter Camenzind, Owner

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff reviewed the report and supports the report's conclusions that the house and the fire place do not meet the City of Santa Barbara's significance criteria due to the alterations that have occurred. However, the project does meet State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA in that the low sandstone wall surrounding the property does qualify as a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 1:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, pointed out that, although on page 6 of the report it states one structure on the site was designed by the architectural firm Soule, Murphy and Hastings, it was actually two homes. He also questioned how a proposed project could be analyzed in the report as shown on page 35 under the subheading "Analysis of the Proposed Project" without the mention of what is being proposed.

Public comment closed at 1:40 p.m.

The preparer of the report responded that the owners' intent at this point is to build a single-family residence, but a specific proposed project does not exist; therefore, there are no architectural plans yet.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 5/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Boucher/Murray/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

2. 209 E ISLAY ST

E-1 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-042-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00250
 Owner: Peter and Lisa Camenzind
 Architect: James Lecron

(Proposed demolition of a 3,817 square foot single-family dwelling.)

(Request by Staff to add the sandstone retaining wall to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Resources List.)

Actual time: 1:43 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff is making this request in light of the Historic Structures/Sites Report's determination that the sandstone retaining wall is historically significant.

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke in support of Staff's request so as to ensure that the design review be under the HLC's purview.

Public comment closed at 1:46 p.m.

Motion: To add the sandstone retaining wall to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Boucher/Murray/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:46 P.M. TO 1:49 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM**3. GUTIERREZ STREET BRIDGE REPLACEMENT**

E-1 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
Application Number: MST2013-00312
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Staff Member: John Ewasiuk, Principal Engineer
(Presentation and discussion on the Gutierrez Street Bridge Replacement project.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: James Colton, Bridge Project Manager
Craig Drake, Principle Engineer, Drake Haglan and Associates
Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. Presentation of the design intent early on in the project is appreciated.
2. Show all landscape treatment on the plans.
3. Maintain/restore the existing landscaping to the extent possible; particularly the mature and large vegetation that acts as shadowing for the creek bed.
4. Minimize the width of the paving/hardscape at the roadside walk level within applicable funding restraints.
5. Future presentation should have an overlay of existing versus proposed with clear delineation of cross sections, architectural elevations without engineering data, etc.
6. If the straightening of the existing sidewalk increases the bridge width, it would not be supportable.
7. The bridge rail design is of most importance. For inspiration, look at the Chapala Street and Ortega Street bridge rails that were successfully designed.
8. The Commission would be interested in reviewing the environmental analysis document.
9. Do not emulate the sidewalk conditions at the intersection of Haley and De la Vina Streets.

(Boucher/Murray/Orías absent. Shalanberger left at 2:07 p.m.)

FINAL REVIEW**4. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
 Application Number: MST2010-00261
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Ewasiuk

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. Overall existing bridge width is 33.4 feet and is proposed to be 49.5 feet.)

(Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137. Project was last reviewed on February 13, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: John Ilasin, Project Engineer
 David Black, Landscape Architect
 Tom Conti, Project Engineer, Bengal Engineering

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed pilasters at the ends of the bridge and whether they could be made of stone similar to the historic Mission Creek Bridge to better fit in with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Receipt of letters were acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition; and a letter from Eddie Harris, Urban Creeks Council, suggesting that the creek sides be heavily planted and to provide shade for the habitat.

Public comment closed at 2:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Bridge Rail Alternative 4 without round finial is preferred.
2. Simple faux sandstone like a hitching post without cap would be appropriate.
3. The bridge rail and faux sandstone should have a matte finish.
4. Proposed finish and material should facilitate graffiti removal.
5. Use real sandstone as an example of how the proposed faux sandstone should look (i.e., color variations).
6. Manipulate the color at the bridge rail to make it more of a brown color base (rather than orange).
7. A simple pilaster at the rail ends is preferred.
8. Proposed landscape is appropriate and appreciated.
9. Mix the sizes of the proposed Sycamores to be 25% at 24-inch box and 75% at 15-gallon. All Sycamores on neighboring property should be 24-inch box as presented.
10. Future presentation should have an overlay of existing versus proposed with clear delineation of cross sections, architectural elevations without engineering data, etc.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**5. MISSION CREEK**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-012
 Application Number: MST2008-00360
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Ilasin, Project Engineer

(Proposal to widen Mission Creek between Cabrillo Boulevard and Highway 101 and replace existing bridges. This is part of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. Bridges to be reviewed under separate Master Applications. Reach 1A (phase 1) creek widening between Cabrillo Boulevard and W. Mason Street is complete. Reach 1A (phase 2) creek widening is part of the Mason Street Bridge Replacement project (MST2010-00261). Reach 1B is located between W. Mason Street and W. Yanonali Street.)

(Involves Reach 1B to widen the creek channel between Yanonali and Mason Streets and includes the construction of channel walls, expanded habitat zone, rip-rap revetments, ornamental fencing, and landscaping. Reconfiguration of parking spaces on 135 Kimberly Ave. is also proposed. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 036-08. Project was last reviewed on February 13, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:03 p.m.

Present: John Ilasin, Project Engineer
 Matt Griffin, Santa Barbara County Flood Control District

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Receipt of letters were acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition; and a letter from Eddie Harris, Urban Creeks Council, suggesting that the creek be shaded with vegetation to provide for expanded habitat zones, and removal of non-native ornamentals.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. This project needs to be consistent and exemplary with respect to the City's SWMP requirements.
2. Provide a landscape plan prepared by a licensed landscape architect.
3. A licensed landscape architect should be present at the next presentation.
4. The proposed ADA ramp design is not acceptable per the esthetic guidelines for El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.
5. Provide a biologist or landscape architect explanation of landscape pipes for the Sycamore function.
6. Verify the height of the guardrail on the raised wall above the sidewall on page 6 of the plans, Section BB.
7. The size of the boulders should be large enough to prevent washing-away. Boulders should be keyed into the creek bottom.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**6. 902 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
Application Number: MST2012-00149
Owner: Cynthia Howard Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Contractor: Signs By Ken, Inc.
Business Name: Charles Schwab

(Proposal for a facade remodel to replace the existing storefront window system, remove the existing eave, fascia, and parapet, and add new copper gutter and downspouts. Parking lot work and a new trash enclosure will be reviewed under separate application MST2012-00217.)

(Second Review. Review After Final to add 1/4" flat black aluminum panels to all four elevations. Signage was reviewed under a separate application. Project was last reviewed on July 17, 2013.)

This item was postponed at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**7. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST** C-2 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
Application Number: MST2011-00174
Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This is a *designated City Landmark*: "The Lobero Theatre." (This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.))

(Review After Final of change to approved plans to remove two proposed intermediate handrails at the main entry steps. Requires Historic Resource Findings.)

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Mat Gradias, Architect, KBZ Architects, Inc.

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the original design intent, removal of railings in the center, and he believed the proposal is an improvement.

Receipt of a letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

- Motion:** **Approval of Review After Final as submitted with the following findings made:**
1. **Historic Resource:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource.
 2. **Alterations to a City Landmark:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.
- Action:** La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:39 P.M. TO 3:51 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

8. **35 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone
(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(Project Design Approval of the revised project is requested for Areas A, B, and C. The City Council approved the project on December 11, 2001, and a Substantial Conformance Determination was issued by the City Administrator on June 27, 2013. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103. The last concept reviews were on January 30 and April 10, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:51 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields and Shannon Halliday, DesignARC, Inc.
 Philip Suding, Landscape Architect
 Allison DeBusk, Project Planner

State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that the City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they serve on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Public comment opened at 4:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, suggested breaking up the stacked windows on the Mason Street side of Building B to make them similar to the El Paseo window design.

Receipt of a letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 4:14 p.m.

Motion: Areas A and B continued two weeks with comments:

1. The architecture is acceptable.
2. The landscape plan is generally acceptable
3. It would be preferred that glass railings not be included anywhere within the proposed design.
4. Radically simplify the *paseo* in Area B and open it up to State Street.
5. Resolve the connection across E. Mason Street in a more symmetrical manner, specifically between the lobby, *paseo* entrance central arch, walkway, and palm trail line.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 5/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)
Motion carried.

Public comment reopened at 4:51 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the steps leading up to the lawn area and questioned whether hand railings will be needed.

Public comment reclosed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Area C continued two weeks with comments:

1. Restudy the design of the large State Street arch.
2. The restaurant corner column needs to be restudied. Eliminating the base and possibly adding an element at the corner to accentuate the column was suggested.
3. The Mason Street arch needs to work with the rest of the corner building to determine its style (i.e., Moorish versus Spanish).
4. Restudy the glass facing Mason Street so that it relates to the hotel entry and to make it less contemporary.
5. The two landscape areas need to relate better as one; it was suggested that they be on axis to be a more traditional Spanish garden.
6. The square lawn and stairs are too contemporary.
7. The pattern of street trees along State Street is too formal. It should not compete with the *allée of the palm trees*.
8. The design of the palm *allée* is supportable.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 5/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)
Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 222 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-028
 Application Number: MST2013-00299
 Owner: Charles H. and Chambers A. Jarvis Trust
 Applicant: Inaki Villarin

(Proposal for a new ADA access ramp at the main entry of an existing office building.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1601 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-008
 Application Number: MST2012-00429
 Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors, LP
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: El Prado - La Quinta

(Major exterior remodel and renovations to existing three-story El Prado Inn. Improvements include refinish of exterior windows, doors, lighting, trim, railings and new landscaping. Construct new porte-cochère, open beam exercise pavilion, security gates, site repairs to paving, stairs, restoration of building elements. Remodel of adjoining annex, pool deck areas and add spa area. New second-story balconies and deck areas. Two additional parking spaces are provided for future two-guest room conversions. This is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.*)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1118 E CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00297
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Keven Strasburg, Park Project Technician
 Applicant: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to remove 13 existing steel bollards at the east and west entries bathhouse promenade entries and replace them with five fixed bollards and four removable bollards. In addition, two new fixed bollards are proposed at the pathway to the east promenade. All bollards are to be painted Malaga Green to match those approved at Chase Palm Park. This is a *Structure of Merit*: "Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa.")

(Third review.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 9 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
Application Number: MST2013-00024
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court
Architect: Amy Taylor
Business Name: Bouchon

(Proposal to remove an existing unpermitted 247 square foot canvas patio cover and construct a 353 net square foot, one-story, 16'-0" tall addition at the front of an approximately 3,550 square foot building. There are four buildings on this site.)

(Review After Final of the following changes to the approved plans: Add gas radiant heaters; add fixed window blinds to shield gas radiant heaters; weep screed detail; light fixtures and light rope.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted with the exception of the light rope, which was previously approved.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:06 P.M. ****