



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 27, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 2:45 p.m.
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 2:45 p.m.
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present until 2:45 p.m.
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present until 1:56 p.m. and again at 2:04 p.m.
BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor – Present until 2:13 p.m.
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Orías, Shallenberger, Suding, and Winick
 Boucher, Murray and Sharpe until 2:45 p.m.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:13 p.m.), Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There will be an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, April 3, 2013, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street, 2nd Floor.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 13, 2013.

Motion: To postpone the approval of the March 13, 2013, minutes to the next meeting.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Winick, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Commissioners Boucher, Murray, and Sharpe would leave the meeting at the beginning of Item 4 at 2121 Garden Street.

b) Based on feedback from the HLC, the applicant for La Entrada de Santa Bárbara has made revisions to the project plans and has submitted them for a Substantial Conformance Determination. The plans will be discussed by the Planning Commission on April 4, 2013. Staff has also been informed that Entrada intends to submit these same plans for HLC review on the April 10 agenda. A copy of the latest plans is available for review at the Planning/Zoning Counter.

2. Nicole Hernández announced that there would be an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, April 3, 2013, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street, 2nd Floor.

3. Mr. Limón announced there would be a City Council meeting on April 9 and 16, 2013, and requested that a member attend to represent the Commission. Commissioners Murray and Orías agreed to attend on April 9.

4. Chair Suding announced he attended the March 22, 2013, Chair/Vice-Chair Advisory Group meeting.

5. Chair Suding reported on the County of Santa Barbara Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission's proposal to the County Parks Department to change pruning practices for shrubs and trees on courthouse grounds.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher reported on Sign Committee project applications requesting non-traditional gooseneck lighting for signs within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two-car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Hodges House, Summit Lighthouse.")

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Actual time:

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, state that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required. The standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources applies to the project and shall be reproduced on the plans prior to final design review approval.

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two-car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Hodges House, Summit Lighthouse.")

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report found the house to be eligible for designation as a City Landmark and for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources and the National Register of Historic Places.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, commented that staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State of California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines of the City's Master Environmental Assessment.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on a correction to the historical account on pages 6 of the report with respect to Winsor Soule's career advantages due to his marriage to Judith de Forest. He also noted that, when the house was on the Pearl Chase Society Historic Homes Tour, the original plans were posted on the wall and the draftsman that signed the document was Lockwood de Forest, Jr.

Public comment closed at 1:56 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two-car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Hodges House, Summit Lighthouse.")

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Barbara Lowenthal and Anthony Grumbine, Harrison Design Associates
Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commended the applicant in the restoration of this building. He inquired as to the possible restoration of the northwest corner garden.

Public comment closed at 2:25 p.m.

The commission recessed from 2:32 p.m. to 2:33 p.m. with the purpose of reviewing the plans.

Motion: Continued to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments in support of the requested modifications and design:

1. The owner is commended for the appropriate restoration of the building, living within the perimeter of the existing building, and removing some of the non-historically significant additions.
2. Reconsider the use of a more historically-appropriate paving material at the entrance walkway and in the motor court.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/1/0. (Orías opposed because, although she supports the project, she is concerned with the potential affect on the garden by the pool, and considered that it warranted further review.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:44 P.M. TO 2:50 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 2121 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003
Application Number: MST2012-00470
Owner: Zohar and Danna Ziv
Applicant: Thomas Ochsner Architect
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for a minor addition and alterations to an existing, 6,752 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, detached garage, and detached accessory building. The proposal includes a 128 square foot addition to an existing 500 square foot storage structure to be converted to a one-story, three-car detached garage. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 749 square foot garage to a 276 square foot covered patio, a 473 square foot swimming pool pavilion and a 27 square foot equipment enclosure. Additional improvements on this 25,500 square foot parcel will be a new swimming pool, relocated driveway with new vehicular entry gate, new pedestrian gate, new site walls, and landscape plan. The proposed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) will be .27, or 146% of the guideline maximum FAR. Total square footage on site will be 6,907 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for zoning modifications. This proposal will address violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-00425 including conversion of a storage building to habitable space and removal of illegal structures. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "the Olives Brinkerhoff-Fenzi House.")

(Project Design and Final Approvals are requested. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 009-13 and Historic Resource Findings. Project was last reviewed on January 16, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:50 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio
Ray Ames, Architect, Thomas Ochsner Architect

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, requested that the applicant inquire as to whether the property owners intend to take action for the building to be designated as a City Landmark.

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with Historic Resource Findings made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Orías/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**5. 00 E CABRILLO BLVD**

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
 Application Number: MST2004-00878
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant
 Agent: Applied Earthworks Inc.
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(This is a revised project. The original Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge project was approved by the Planning Commission and Historic Landmarks Commission. The revised proposal involves the relocation of the beachway component of the bridge. The proposed bridge is to be a stand-alone bridge approximately 59 feet to the south of the originally-approved location. The beachway bridge width dimension would change from 18.5 feet wide to approximately 14 feet wide. The proposed 148 foot long beachway (pedestrian/bicycle) bridge would replace the approved temporary beachway bridge. The relocated beachway bridge would also provide room for the harbor dredge pipeline underneath.)

(Review After Final of changes to previously-approved project including: the deletion of transition wall 3, revision of transition wall 2 layout and elevation, revised landscape plan and fence details, and clarification of wall finish and step heights of transition wall 1. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-07. Project was last approved reviewed on October 24, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:00 p.m.

Present: Adam Hendel, Supervising Engineer
 David Black, Landscape Architect, David Black & Associates

Clarification: The project was last reviewed (not approved as originally agendized) on October 24, 2012, at which time an Addendum to the Supplemental Historic Properties Survey Report (originally accepted by the HLC on December 13, 2006) was accepted as presented. The portion of the project for which the applicant is now requesting a Review After Final was given Project Design Approval on January 7, 2009, and Final Approval on January 21, 2009.

Public comment opened at 3:08 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final of the walls as submitted and the applicant is requested to reconsider the location of the fence at the corner at TW2 to be stepped back from the back-of-sidewalk.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 1302 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-011
Application Number: MST2013-00100
Owner: JP Morgan Chase Bank
Applicant: Andrea Przybylski
Business Name: Chase Bank

(Proposal for relocation of accessible parking and associated new accessible ramp and path of travel.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 819 STATE ST A C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-010
Application Number: MST2013-00114
Owner: ESJ Centers
Architect: Eleven Modern
Business Name: Blue Glue

(Proposal to replace an existing storefront entry with a new storefront window and to replace existing entry doors with new.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheet A3.0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 205 CHAPALA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070
Application Number: MST2010-00263
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Applied Earthworks
Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposal to replace the Chapala Street - W. Yanonali Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The replacement bridge would be a single-span bridge consisting of a combination of precast and cast-in-place concrete slab with asphalt concrete or polyester concrete overlay on the deck for the road surfacing. City standard sidewalks would be added to both sides of the street on the bridge and would tie into the existing sidewalks along Chapala and Yanonali Streets. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit to perform this work in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review After Final of change to approved project to remove an existing 24" diameter tree *Lagunaria patersonii* "Cow Itch tree" in public right-of-way.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the replacement tree shall be a 15-gallon *Platanus racemosa* "California Sycamore" and shall be located as marked on Sheet L-1.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:21 P.M. ****