



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, January 30, 2013**     **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**     **1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**                    PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present  
    DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
    LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
    MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
    WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present  
    FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
    JUDY ORÍAS – Absent  
    CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent  
    BARRY WINICK – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**                    DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**                DALE FRANCISCO – Present 2:45 p.m. to 4:10 p.m.

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**    SHEILA LODGE – Present

**STAFF:**                    JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:45 p.m.; 4:00 p.m. to 4:10 p.m.; and 4:52 p.m.  
    NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present  
    SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
    GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

---

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

### CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Suding.

### ATTENDANCE:

Members present:            Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent:             Orías and Shallanberger.

Staff present:                Limón (until 2:45 p.m.; 4:00 p.m. to 4:10 p.m. and 4:52 p.m.), Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

### GENERAL BUSINESS:

A.     Public Comment:

Sheila Lodge announced she is the new liaison for the Planning Commission.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 16, 2013.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 16, 2013, as presented.**

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 5/0/2. (Murray abstained from Item 11. Boucher/Winick abstained. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.**

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item E. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Chair Suding would be stepping down on Item 5 at 35 State Street; Commissioner Shallanberger would be stepping down on Items 2 and 6 at 101 State Street and 1601 State Street, respectively; Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down on Item 4 at 720 De La Vina Street; and Commissioner Orías would be absent.
- b) Item B on the HLC Consent Agenda was referred to the Full Board and would be reviewed as the last item on the agenda.

2. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a) On February 5, 2013, the City Council will consider funding to support enhancements for creation of historic districts and the implementation of the Historic Resources Element.
- b) The joint Architectural Board of Review and Historic Landmarks Commission 2013 Design Awards will be held at the February 12 City Council meeting.

3. Commissioner Drury announced he would be leaving by 5:40 p.m.

4. Commissioner Murray reported on the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation Annual Meeting & Community Awards Presentation held on Saturday, January 26, 2013. Individual members of the Historic Resources Element Task Force were presented awards from the SBTHP as well as California Senate awards signed by Hannah-Beth Jackson.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Suding announced there would be an HLC Survey Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, February 6, 2013, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****1. 2082 LAS CANOAS RD**

A-1 Zone

**(1:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-030-037  
Application Number: MST2012-00262  
Owner: Ron Petelski  
Architect: James McClintock  
Engineer: Victor Beck

(Proposal for site grading; construction of multiple retaining walls; to level, extend, and pave the driveway; and create a building pad for a future residence located on a 3-acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. The proposal involves 1,250 cubic yards of cut, 1,250 cubic yards of fill, and 1,000 cubic yards of recompaction to be balanced on site. Retaining walls include a new 120 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 6-inches to 12 feet, a new 200 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 4 to 5-feet, and a new 145 linear foot 6-foot tall site wall. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2012-00172.)

**(Continued Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report and Addendum Letter prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Actual time: 1:43 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeological Consultant

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, state that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report addendum dated January 23, 2013, and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations in that, specifically, David Stone has documented the extent of the mission aqueduct remains on the property, and his proposed measures for avoiding impact to them should ensure avoidance of impact to these remains.

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke in favor of the preservation of the aqueducts on the site.

Public comment closed at 1:46 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report as presented.**

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:46 P.M. TO 1:59 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****2. 101 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

**(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-006  
Application Number: MST2011-00171  
Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an existing 714 square foot laundry building and 40 space parking lot and construct a new 20,439 square foot, three-story hotel with 34 guest rooms and a 33 space, at-grade parking garage totaling 10,331 square feet. Planning Commission review is requested for three front setback modifications, a parking modification, Development Plan approval, a Transfer of Existing Development rights and a Coastal Development Permit.)

**(Third Concept Review. Requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission review. Project was revised to increase height since last review on October 10, 2012.)**

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis  
Mark Romasanta, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:**

1. The concept and proposed changes are supportable.
2. The proposed scale relative to the neighboring structures is supportable.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:08 P.M. TO 2:17 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****3. 1105 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

**(2:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-222-024  
Application Number: MST2013-00016  
Owner: Santa Barbara Club  
Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects

(Proposal to replace existing wood windows with aluminum-clad windows. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Santa Barbara Club, constructed in 1904, **and** is included on the **State Historic Resources Inventory**.")

**(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings.)**

Actual time: 2:17 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect, Edwards Pitman Architects  
Thomas Dain, General Contractor, Santa Barbara Club

Commissioner Murray disclosed she spoke to the applicant with respect to the proposed window changes.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the proposal may have an adverse impact to the historic resource, and replacing the original character-defining windows as proposed may not meet Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The applicant was requested to provide the following: 1) thorough restoration investigation, including whether all windows are beyond repair; 2) energy efficiency analysis to determine whether the windows are the primary culprit; and 3) the life-expectancy and benefits of the proposed windows over restoration.

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local resident/historian, commented on the architectural, historical and cultural importance of the building that was designed by Francis Wilson. It is eligible for designation as City Landmark and possibly for placement on the National Register of Historic Places.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of maintaining the historic integrity of the windows.

Public comment closed at 2:34 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to allow the applicant to either present an alternate proposal or withdraw it, with the following comments:**

1. The Commission sympathizes with the applicant's frustration with maintenance costs.
2. Investigate restoring the existing wood windows.
3. Aluminum clad windows as presented are not acceptable.
4. The windows and their details are an important character-defining element of this building.
5. Pursue finding a company that does window-specific restoration.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## **FINAL REVIEW**

### **4. 720 DE LA VINA ST**

C-2 Zone

**(2:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-017

Application Number: MST2012-00277

Owner: SHGC Property LP

Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal for a two-story mixed-use development comprising the following: conversion of an existing one-story duplex to a partial two-story, 500 square foot commercial building including demolition of 360 square feet of floor area; demolish an existing 486 square foot detached studio; construct a 620 square foot ground level studio apartment; a 789 square foot, second-floor, 1-bedroom apartment; a 613 square foot, second-floor, 1-bedroom apartment; three covered parking spaces; and one accessible parking space. Total development on site will be 2,354 square feet. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources as eligible for City Structure of Merit status.**)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on December 5, 2012.)**

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:52 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** **Final Approval with Historic Resource Findings made as follows:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

**Action:** Winick/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:53 P.M. TO 3:01 P.M. \*\***

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **5. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

**(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004  
 Application Number: MST97-00357  
 Agent: Ken Marshall  
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld  
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.  
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design  
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes the option to develop either (i) 123 hotel keys, comprised of all hotel rooms, 19,893 square feet of commercial floor area and 246 parking spaces or, (ii) 116 hotel keys, comprised of 107 hotel rooms with 9 timeshare units, 20,443 square feet of commercial floor area and 246 parking spaces.)

**(Comments only; this is a single concept review of a revised project as part of a Substantial Conformance Determination request. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103. Project was last reviewed on September 1, 2010.)**

Actual time: 3:01

Present: Melissa Cinarli and Mark Shields, Architects, DesignARC  
 Philip Suding, Landscape Architect, Suding Design  
 Michael Rosenfeld, Representing Ownership

**Staff comments:** Mr. Limón made the following clarification in response to public comment with respect to the HLC Chair acting as the landscape architect for the project: The City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they serve on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m.

Holly Waters, West Beach Neighborhood representative, expressed concern with the effect of the reduction of Area C's open space on the neighborhood's character, the densification of the neighborhood itself, and the delay the proposed changes would cause in the completion of the project.

Michael Self, local resident, expressed concern with the considerable changes to the original proposal, and is concerned about the danger and increased congestion through lane removal, street narrowing, and bulb-outs.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with possible impacts on views of the mountains from State Street, and vehicle circulation with the narrowing of the street.

Kenny Slaughter, local business owner, expressed support for the project and commented on the need for completion of this gateway to the City.

Jim Westby, local resident, expressed concern with the considerable changes between the approved plan and the proposed changes, primarily the loss of open space and the densification at State Street.

Public comment closed at 3:49 p.m.

Letters were received from Holly Walters representing the West Beach Neighborhood, Tony Romasanta representing the Harbor View Inn, and Paul Bullock representing the Greater Santa Barbara Lodging & Restaurant Association.

**The Commission made the following comments:**

1. **State Street Width:** This issue was addressed during the previously approved design. Although previously approved, the narrowing of State Street would be a disservice to the community.
2. **Area A:**
  - a) Consolidating the parking is prudent and supportable.
  - b) The idea of a plaza is supportable.
3. **Area B:**
  - a) Bringing the paseo down to the ground is supportable.
  - b) Planters and walls should be removed. If security is needed, it was suggested that piers or a wrought iron fence be used.
  - c) Widening access to Mason Street from the plaza would be better.
4. **Area C:**
  - a) This area needs further study.
  - b) The proposed retail closer to the street would be successful.
  - c) The concept of a large plaza with its open space in the previously approved design that contributed to State Street as a gift to the public was appropriate and supportable. The buildings have taken over in the new design.
  - d) The arches in the previous proposal gave it a certain poetry.
  - e) The reduced height is a benefit, but the open space previously proposed is desired.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****6. 1601 STATE ST**

C-2/R-4 Zone

**(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-008  
Application Number: MST2012-00429  
Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors LP  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Major exterior remodel and renovations to existing three-story El Prado Inn. Improvements include paint and refinish of exterior windows, doors, lighting, trim, railings and new landscaping. Construct new porte-cochère, open beam exercise pavilion, security gates, site repairs to paving, stairs, restoration of building elements. Remodel of adjoining annex, pool deck areas and add spa area. New second-story balconies and deck areas. Two additional parking spaces are provided for future two-guest room conversions.)

**(Project requires Environmental Assessment. Projects last reviewed as Concept Discussion on November 7, 2012.)**

Actual time: 4:14

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis  
Martin Hartmann, Project Manager, Cearnal Andrulaitis  
Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 4:41 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local resident/historian, commented on the expectation of a "major remodel" based on the project description and the building's eligibility for Structure of Merit status.

Public comment closed at 4:44 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to allow the preparation of a Historic Structures/Sites Report with the comment that the Commission would like to move forward with a Structure of Merit designation if the building is deemed to qualify.**

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL – Referred from the Consent Calendar****7. 702 LAGUNA ST****R-3 Zone****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-023  
 Application Number: MST2010-00288  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority  
 Architect: East Beach Ventures Architecture

(Proposal for approximately 7,656 square feet of one and two-story non-residential additions at an existing Housing Authority facility. The additions consist of a 2,946 square foot first floor addition and a 2,726 square foot second floor addition to an existing 986 square foot one-story storage building (Building A), and a 1,834 square foot one-story addition to an existing 4,184 square foot one-story maintenance building (Building B). There are 59 parking spaces proposed. Approved by Planning Commission on June 16, 2011.)

**(Review After Final to remove Building B addition and paint storage building; the existing paint storage building and trash enclosure to remain; existing site work at southeast portion of the site to remain; eliminate the tower element of Building A, reduce number of windows, eliminate deck number 1, redesign the front entry including paving and simplify detailing, 58 parking spaces, and a 61 square foot interior addition.)**

Actual time: 5:08 p.m.

Present: Peter Ehlen and Adrian Coulter, Architects

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Failed

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final as presented.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 3/3/0. (Boucher/La Voie/Sharpe opposed. Winick stepped down. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion failed.

**Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the tile roof shall remain on the tower as originally proposed at Building A.**

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 5/1/0. (La Voie opposed. Winick stepped down. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)****NEW ITEM****A. 410 W SOLA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-051-010  
 Application Number: MST2013-00037  
 Owner: Heather Veronica Gray

(Proposal to install 3.43 kw photovoltaic solar system on roof. A total of 14 solar panels are proposed.)

**(Proposed alteration to a Potential Historic Resource.)**

**Continued two weeks for mock-up of installation.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****B. 702 LAGUNA ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-023  
Application Number: MST2010-00288  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority  
Architect: East Beach Ventures Architecture

(Proposal for approximately 7,656 square feet of one and two-story non-residential additions at an existing Housing Authority facility. The additions consist of a 2,946 square foot first floor addition and a 2,726 square foot second floor addition to an existing 986 square foot one-story storage building (Building A), and a 1,834 square foot one-story addition to an existing 4,184 square foot one-story maintenance building (Building B). There are 59 parking spaces proposed. Approved by Planning Commission on June 16, 2011.)

**(Review After Final to remove Building B addition and paint storage building; the existing paint storage building and trash enclosure to remain; existing site work at southeast portion of the site to remain; eliminate the tower element of Building A, reduce number of windows, eliminate deck number 1, redesign the front entry including paving and simplify detailing, 58 parking spaces, and a 61 square foot interior addition.)**

**The review of this project was referred to the Full Board and added as Item 7.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****C. 1321 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-027  
Application Number: MST2012-00180  
Owner: Ernest Brooks II Trust  
Applicant: Peikert Group Architects  
Business Name: Santa Barbara Middle School

(Proposal for a minor addition and exterior alterations in the basketball court area and rear parking lot including the following: removal of existing portable storage, construction of a new 438 square foot storage building with clay tile roof and 8' tall wood fence enclosure, a 14' tall sound barrier wall on the east side of the basketball court, and a 6-10' tall fence around two sides of the court. Also proposed is to restripe a small section of the parking lot, reducing the number of parking spaces from 115 to 109, which still meets the parking requirement of 109 spaces. New light fixtures, planters, and landscaping will complete the project. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Jefferson Campus."**)

**(Review After Final to replace the north garage door at the shed to double man-doors, and changes to the parking lot planters.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheet A-0.1 and door changes approved as submitted.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****D. 905 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-028  
Application Number: MST2013-00017  
Owner: Eleanore Alexander  
Engineer: Ken Dickson  
Business Name: Persona Neapolitan Pizzeria

(Proposal to remove the existing bulkhead tile and repaint the front façade of an existing commercial building. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Bothin Building."**)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****E. 2020 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA STE 125/126****SP-7 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-163-004  
Application Number: MST2013-00035  
Owner: Michael Towbes LLC  
Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal to increase the height of the existing parapet wall by 20 and 28-inches on the southeast corner of Ebbetts Hall. The property is currently developed within the Riviera Park Research and Communications Center Campus. This is a **Designated City Landmark**: Furse Hall, Quadrangle Buildings, Ebbetts Hall, and Grand Stair.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Continued two weeks to allow time for noticed public hearing.**

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:20 P.M. \*\***