



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

JOINT MEETING WITH THE PLANNING COMMISSION & REGULAR MEETING

Wednesday, July 20, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

HLC MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present

DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present

LOUISE BOUCHER – Present

MICHAEL DRURY – Absent

WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present

FERMINA MURRAY – Present

JUDY ORÍAS – Present

CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

PC MEMBERS: JOHN JOSTES, *Chair* – Present 1:41 to 4:10 p.m.

SHEILA LODGE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent

BRUCE BARTLETT – Present

CHARMAINE JACOBS – Recused herself

MIKE JORDAN – Present @ 2:20 p.m.

STELLA LARSON – Present

DEBORAH L. SCHWARTZ – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Present until 5:50 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present

DANIEL KATO, LAND USE TEAM SUPERVIOR – Present until 5:04 p.m.

JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present

GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, July 15, 2011, at 4:00 p.m., the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 p.m. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, and Sharpe.

Members absent: Drury.

Staff present: Limón, Jacobus, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Wanda Livernois, Brinkerhoff Neighborhood resident, commented that the city-owned building on the corner of Haley and De la Vina Streets located within the Brinkerhoff district is being painted. She believed the colors to be inappropriate to the style of the cottage (136 W. Haley Street).

Jessica Grant, City Public Works Project Planner, commented that she is assisting the County with the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. The Lower Reach 1A is currently under construction. Shotcrete samples of the wall will be available for review. Chair Suding and Commissioners La Voie and Sharpe volunteered to do a courtesy review that would be coordinated through the HLC Staff.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 6, 2011.

The review of the previous meeting minutes were tabled to the end of the meeting.

(5:58)

Motion: To postpone the approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 6, 2011, to the next meeting.

Action: Shallanberger/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Drury would be absent from the meeting.
- b) Chair Suding and Vice-Chair Sharpe were invited to the Semi-Annual Advisory Group Meeting being hosted by the Community Development Department. The meeting would be on Wednesday, September 7th, in Room 15 of City Hall. Invitations would be sent by mail in August.
- c) A 101/Cabrillo Pedestrian & Bike path DRT meeting would be held on Thursday, July 28th at 11:00 a.m. in the Public Works Conference Room.
- d) A status report would be given to the City Council on August 16th regarding the proposed changes to De la Guerra Plaza, and then the Historic Structures/Sites Report and the Archaeological Resources Report are tentatively scheduled for HLC review on August 17th.

2. Mr. Jacobus announced that this would likely be his last meeting because he would be leaving on a long-term medical leave from his position as the City's Urban Historian. He expressed appreciation for all the positive experiences working with the Commission and City Staff. Chair Suding emphasized that Mr. Jacobus will be greatly missed as a resource and as a human being.

3. Commissioner Orías announced that the next Historic Resources Element Task Force would meet on August 3, 2011, 8:30 a.m. at the Mental Health Association Building, Water Resources Conference Room, 617 Garden Street, third floor.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT: PHASE I

1. **2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(1:41)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2010-00166
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Schacht Aslani Architects

(Proposed project consists of the Master Plan for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. The project components include deconstruction of the majority of the existing structures, approximately 57,700 square feet, with the exception of the designated structures of merit and proposed new development of approximately 1000,000 square feet. The project requires a Measure E allocation of 57,000 square feet and has received a dual designation as a Community Priority and Economic Development project.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report found the following buildings eligible for City of Santa Barbara Landmark status: the Main Museum Building including the Original Museum, Gould Indian Hall, Botany Hall, Fleischmann Mammal Hall, Library, Local Birds Hall, Reserve Collections Building - Administration, the Director's House, the Hazard Carriage House & Wall, and the MacVeagh House.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this report is a Phase I Structures Report that analyzes all the building structures, features, and landscape on the site. He recommended changes to pages 62, 81 and 99. Staff read the report and found the report to be accurate and finely detailed.

Motion: To table the acceptance of the report and continue its consideration to the meeting of August 3, 2011, with the following comments:

1. The preparers of the report are to incorporate the requested changes from the Commission and Staff.
2. The Commission agreed with the analysis, recommendations and conclusions of the report.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/1/0. (Shallanberger opposed. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:12 P.M. TO 2:23 P.M. ****

JOINT MEETING WITH THE PLANNING COMMISSION**JOINT CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED: PUBLIC HEARING****2. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(2:23)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2010-00166
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Schacht | Aslani architects

(Proposed project consists of the Master Plan for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. The project components include deconstruction of the majority of the existing structures, approximately 57,700 square feet, with the exception of the designated structures of merit and proposed new development of approximately 1000,000 square feet. The project requires a Measure E allocation of 57,000 square feet and has received a dual designation as a Community Priority and Economic Development project.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Plans for this project were discussed on July 21, 2010, at a joint meeting of the Planning Commission and the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

PC Members Present: Chair John Jostes
 Bruce Bartlett
 Mike Jordan
 Stella Larson
 Deborah Schwartz

Others Present: Peter Lawson, City Associate Planner
 Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS
 Dr. Karl Hutterer, SBMNH Executive Director
 Walter Schacht, Architect, Schacht Aslani architects
 Susette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects
 Chelsey Swanson, City Associate Transportation Planner

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of three letters from the public:

1. Richard Solomon and Jana Zimmer – expressed concerns with fire evacuation, transportation circulation, construction noise, and operating noise impacts.
2. Dennis Allen – wrote in support.
3. Lauren Carey – expressed concerns with noise and food concession plans.

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

1. Richard Solomon, neighbor – suggested inclusion of seven things that are not currently proposed as expressed in his submitted correspondence to the HLC and PC.
2. Paul Collins, SBMNH Curator of Vertebrate Zoology – spoke in support.
3. Paul Russell, SBMNH Board of Trustees – spoke in support.
4. Peter Schuyler, resident – spoke in support.

5. Steve Hicks, SBMNH Board of Trustees – spoke in support.
6. Heather Moffett, SBMNH Director of Education and Exhibits – spoke in support.
7. Don Olson, Upper East Neighborhood Association and Museum Master Plan Advisory Committee – spoke in support.
8. Norman Sprague, SBMNH Board of Trustees – spoke in support.
9. Palmer Jackson Jr., Chairman SBMNH Board of Trustees – spoke in support.
10. Kellam de Forest, local resident – spoke in support.

Public comment closed at 3:54 p.m.

Joint comments by the Planning Commission and Historic Landmark Commission members:

1. Positive Comments:

- a. The museum is one of the most outstanding institutions in the area. It is of great importance for the community's natural history education and values, and the regional IQ.
- b. The proposal is thoughtful, precedent-setting in a positive way, and shows considerable depth and complexity.

2. Compatibility:

- a. Connectivity and balancing of the project through the adjacent Mission property is important.
- b. Addressing impacts in the project description would facilitate a timely and speedy review.
- c. The community outreach in Mission Canyon is appreciated, along with the neighborhood house-to-house contact, community outreach meetings, mailings, and presentations at various functions.
- d. Assure that the project's proposed mitigations are consistent with the Mission Canyon Community Plan, and coordinate with the Mission Canyon Association on the proposed project.
- e. Articulate in writing the mitigation measures in very clear, precise and comprehensive terms.
- f. Special sensitivity to the neighborhood is required by the Conditional Use Permit. Consider forming an advisory neighborhood board that would meet regularly and get the neighbors involved.

3. Architecture/Massing:

- a. It should not be treated as an urban site.
- b. Aesthetic values should involve more of an architecture style that can be celebrated; namely, Hispanic architecture. The buildings should reflect the current non-institutional feel.
- c. Resolve the exterior and interior relationships to create true *paseos* and courtyards. The building form should reflect an implied mass that breaks up the building.
- d. Avoid the simple linearity of the big structures. Angled buildings would better wrap around the site instead of rectangular "shoe boxes." A 5 or 10 degree turn of some buildings would help to avoid having unnecessary spaces that are created when everything is parallel.
- e. Residential: Incorporate more employee-based rental housing into the project. Consider the possibility of providing rental housing for other employees in town that would leave the premises during the day, when the resources would be needed, and returning when the resources are no longer needed.
- f. Emphasize a sense of sustainability not only in how the site is treated, but enhancing the housing experience as well.

4. **Conditional Use Permit:** Clearly show the existing baseline. Include as much detail as possible.
5. **Historic Issues:**
 - a. Historic Resources proposed to be demolished should be clearly shown on plans.
 - b. The historical restoration/rehabilitation should be a priority. Once the historic resources are taken care of, the other parts of proposal will fall into place. The MacVeagh House should be part of that priority.
 - c. Assure coordination between the Phase I and II Historic Structures/Sites Report, especially in terminology. Reconcile the number of parcels in all reports.
6. **Biological Issues & Creek Restoration:**
 - a. The commissioners acknowledge the importance of the Museum staying current in the science field, but the expanded facilities should be sensitive to the biological resources.
 - b. Research the base flood elevation of Mission Creek and show that elevation on the plan.
 - c. Restudy the project's increased runoff and determine if a more natural drainage system can handle the capacity of the runoff. Also determine the proposed bridge capacity of the creek.
 - d. Specify locations and size of replacement vegetation and who will maintain the restoration of habitat as opposed to simply stating "where feasible" on the plans.
 - e. Provide more information on the numbers of Oak Trees being replaced and resolve disagreements on how the removed Oak Trees will be replaced both on site and off site.
7. **Solar Panels/Green Roof:**
 - a. Keep in mind that organic roofs are not fire proof and that roofing material should be consistent with the Fire Marshall's requirements.
 - b. Study the use and location of ventilation system from the exhaust hoods in the proposed science labs and determine where the vents will be located on the roof to minimize any conflicts with roof top equipment (i.e., solar panels and green roofs).
 - c. A more passive, naturalist approach was suggested where the buildings use passive light and natural ventilation.
8. **Annexation:** The entire property needs to be brought into the City's jurisdiction to avoid extending the project and, as a result, making the project more expensive.
9. **Transportation Issues/Recirculation/Parking:**
 - a. The Mission Canyon/Puesta del Sol proposal with new turn pockets and lane striping are of concern with respect to safety for pedestrians and bicyclists.
 - b. The proposed left turn intersection configuration from Mission Canyon is of great concern with respect to safety.
 - c. Restudy the proposed one-way street section of Puesta del Sol and determine if it is necessary.
 - d. Provide more information on why more parking spaces would be needed if not expecting an intensification of use.
 - e. Determine where buses will be parked and show on plans.
10. **Emergency Access Issues:**
 - a. Use best practices for fire protection for the buildings, the creek and woodlands.
 - b. Work with the fire department to design a fuel management plan and evacuation plan in the event of a wildfire.
 - c. At least five Commissioners continue to question the necessity for the fire access road along the creek area and in the oak woodland. The necessity of the proposed fire access road should be resolved with input from the City Fire Department. The benefits to the habitat on the creek side and the oak woodland should be the main concerns.

**** THE COMMISSION TOOK A BREAK FROM 5:04 P.M. TO 5:10 P.M. ****

REGULAR MEETING

PRESENTATION ITEM

3. ARTIFICIAL TREE CONCEALMENT STRUCTURE MATERIALS

(5:10) Presenter: Rienk Ayers, Manager of AyerTel Communications
(Presentation of artificial tree concealment structure materials for cell towers.)

Present: Rienk Ayers, Manager of AyerTel Communications

Discussion held.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 900 CHANNEL DR

R-1/SD-3 Zone

(5:39) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
Application Number: MST2011-00246
Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
Applicant: Tricia Knight
Architect: Sac Wireless

(This parcel contains a **City Landmark: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain."** Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 58 foot tall tower pole structure concealed as an artificial pine tree and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower as an artificial Eucalyptus tree. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification to allow the project to encroach into the front setback on Channel Drive.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Present: Tricia Knight, Applicant

Public comment opened at 5:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the use of plastic for concealment.

Public comment closed at 5:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

- 1.** The proposed design is not compatible with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines, the architecture of the adjacent building, and the character of the neighborhood; and it is not sensitive to historic landmarks and adjacent resources.
- 2.** The Commission would entertain other design alternatives.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****A. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
Application Number: MST2011-00279
Owner: Jeffrey Hansen, HDG Associates
Applicant: Tynan Group

(This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mar Monte Hotel."** Proposal to convert 10 underground parking spaces to 1,900 sq. ft. of storage space, create a valet parking plan for the underground parking, and to relocate two existing ADA accessible parking spaces for 1111 E. Cabrillo Blvd. and 1039 Orilla Del Mar. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings and coastal review.)

(Project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

Continued indefinitely for applicant to resolve the valet parking plan and ADA changes.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 210 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025
Application Number: MST2011-00061
Owner: DBN Carrillo, LLC
Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for exterior facade changes to an existing building in the Radio Square retail center including the following: new exterior paint color, new windows along Carrillo Street, new storefront, new 397 square foot patio along the De la Vina Street frontage, new HVAC equipment, and the removal of two existing ficus trees and one existing palm tree. No new floor area is proposed. The parking requirement for this parcel is 94 spaces, with 72 legal, nonconforming spaces to be maintained.)

(Review After Final of changes to doors and windows on the north, south, and west elevations, and enlargement of an existing trash enclosure with added landscaping island.)

Continued two weeks to the Full Board.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 1816 STATE ST****C-2/R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-032-021
Application Number: MST2009-00281
Owner: Alamar II, LLC
Architect: Bryan Murphy
Business Name: Fiesta Inn & Suites

(Proposal for an addition and exterior alterations to an existing three story commercial building. The proposal includes facade alterations, a 62 square foot lobby addition, a tower addition having no new floor area, a 270 square foot storage room addition on the 3rd floor of the building, a new 312 square foot deck, two new patio areas totaling 585 square feet, widening the second floor corridor by 164 square feet, and alterations to the existing parking lot. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Conditional Use Permit for a non-residential use in a residential zone and zoning modifications for the new deck, parking, and trash enclosure to encroach into the interior yard setback of the residentially-zoned portion of the site. Approval of this project will abate violations outlined in ENF2008-01335.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 33 E MICHELTORENA ST****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-014
Application Number: MST2011-00286
Owner: Archdioces of Los Angeles
Architect: Gary Jensen

(This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Notre Dame School."** Proposal to permit a new handrail/guardrail along the front entry stairs at Anacapa Street and a new 42" high steel gate and eight foot tall steel fence along the west side of the main building. The overheight fencing and hedges are being reviewed under separate Master Application MST2011-00180, which will require Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 520 PLAZA RUBIO****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-281-003
Application Number: MST2011-00216
Owner: Tal Family Limited Partnership
Architect: DW Reeves & Associates, AIA

(The 11,876 square foot parcel is currently developed with a 1,663 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. This proposal is to permit an as-built, 381 square-foot, detached two-car garage that was constructed to replace an existing garage of the same size damaged by a tree fall. The residence and garage total 2,044 square feet, and the parcel is conforming with two covered parking spaces to remain. The discretionary approval required for this project is a zoning modification to allow an increase in roof height within the required ten foot interior setback. No additional square footage is proposed. This application addresses violations called out in zoning information report ZIR2011-00080 and enforcement case ENF2011-00123.)

(Final approval of the project is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 025-11.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**F. 1114 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-009
Application Number: MST2011-00289
Owner: La Arcada Investment Corporation
Architect: Barry Winick

(This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "La Arcada Court."** Proposal for the installation of exterior mechanical ducts on the rear elevation. The ducts will tie into previously-approved rooftop exhaust equipment under permit BLD2011-00743. Ducts to be painted to match the building color.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheets A-201 and A-600 to match adjacent chimney structure to the south.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**G. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST99-00305
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Agent: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Phase II is MST2005-00490.)

(Review After Final of change to mechanical enclosure on the east side of Cottage 16.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the door shall be a solid wood plank door.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**H. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2010-00342
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Historical Consultant: Alexandra Cole
Architect: Gensler
Architect: Henry Lenny
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to rehabilitate an existing historic waterfall.)

(Review After Final of change to the west pathway and provision of an ADA turnaround.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**I. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Gensler
Architect: Henry Lenny
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Review After Final of changes to service gate from three sliding gates to two swinging gates.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:01 P.M. ****