



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 3, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:49 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, January 29, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 6, 2010**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 6, 2010, with correction.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) The 35th annual California Preservation Conference will take place May 12-15, 2010. The Commissioners were asked to inform staff if they plan to attend.
- b) Item 3, 512 Bath Street, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request. The Commissioners were asked to keep the reports for future review.

2. Mr. Jacobus announced there will be a meeting of the Designations Subcommittee on February 17 at 10:00 a.m. in the Community Development Director's Conference Room.
3. Commissioner Adams announced that Santa Barbara Beautiful launched its new commemorative tree plaque program. The plaques were designed by Steve Hausz. The HLC was acknowledged for its support during today's event.
4. Commissioner Adams announced the Awards Committee will be meeting some time in late March. In the meantime, he is asking for nominations of projects that may be deemed worthy.

5. Commissioner Murray announced that Kellam de Forest was honored by the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation for his unrelenting preservation activity. He was recognized as saving many structures and bringing awareness to the public about historic preservation.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. 913 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(1:41) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-037
Application Number: MST2009-00524
Owner: Aryana Jeans, LLC
Architect: Henry Lenny

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Levy's Shoes." Proposal for a façade remodel to include the replacement of an existing commercial storefront with new steel storefront and wrought iron ornamentation, and relocation of the entry door, enclosing the existing entry area resulting in 63 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(The purpose of the discussion item is to discuss a reduced scope of work option for the proposed project.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commission comments:

1. Positive comments and design direction were provided on the storefront design; however, details are needed to consider proportions and aesthetic issues.
2. The project can be referred to the Consent Calendar.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 30 S QUARANTINA ST

M-1/SD-3 Zone

(1:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-031
Application Number: MST2009-00513
Owner: Pegseven, LLC
Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(Proposal for a new compressed natural gas (CNG) fueling facility for MarBorg Industries. The proposal includes the construction of a new 8 foot tall concrete masonry unit (cmu) wall and two 7 foot tall chain link gates to enclose the new 2,040 square foot fueling facility. The project is located on a 29,555 square foot lot located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Compass Rose.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agreed that it is unlikely that there will be any adverse effects to any significant cultural resources. However, as a precaution, he recommends that, should excavation for the wall footing extend into native soil, a qualified archaeologist should monitor the trench for the presence of historical features and/or deposits. Additionally, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources would apply.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 512 BATH ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-035

Application Number: MST2009-00469

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposed demolition of an existing two-story apartment building and the construction of a two and three-story multi-building apartment complex on a 1.10 acre lot. The proposal includes 53 affordable studio units, varying between 300 and 399 square feet, a 901 square foot two-bedroom manager's unit, 2 laundry rooms, a 623 square foot recreation room and a 1,415 square foot community center. The proposal includes 30 vehicle parking spaces, including 12 covered and 18 uncovered, and 32 covered bicycle parking spaces. The project will result in 18,751 square feet of residential area; 2,165 square feet of community facilities; 3,760 square feet of garages; and the removal of eight existing trees. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications for bonus density, parking, distance between buildings, and an interior setback encroachment.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

(1:49)

Motion: To adjourn the meeting until 2:00 p.m.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE MEETING WAS RECONVENED AT 2:02 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 1555 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

E-1 Zone

(2:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-151-008
 Application Number: MST2009-00033
 Owner: Larry Falxa, Trustee
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal for 735 square feet of additions to the first and second floors and remodeling for an existing 2,702 square foot two-story single-family residence. The existing 440 square foot detached two-car garage and approximately 80 square foot shed will remain on the 21,041 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 3,957 square feet is 84% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
 Clay Aurell, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this is a much simpler version of an English Tudor Revival style. Staff requested that the second paragraph on page 17, Section 9.1.1, be struck from the report because it is inaccurate; the home is not on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he was always told this was designed by Soule, Murphy & Hastings* who used this English Tudor type of style. He added that Mr. Murphy lived close to this property.

Public comment closed at 2:06 p.m.

Motion: To direct Staff to initiate the process to place the house on the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures/Sites List.

Action: Murray/Adams, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: To accept the report with the following conditions:

- 1) The project shall return to the HLC for review since the report concludes that the property is worthy of Structure of Merit status.
- 2) Photo documentation should be included in the design review.

Action: Murray/Suding, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

* Architectural firm of Winsor Soule, John Frederic Murphy, and Theodore Mitchell Hastings.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 1816 STATE ST**

C-2/R-1 Zone

(2:18) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-032-021
Application Number: MST2009-00281
Owner: Alamar II, LLC
Architect: Bryan Murphy
Business Name: Fiesta Inn & Suites

(Proposal for an addition and exterior alterations to an existing three story commercial building. The proposal includes facade alterations, a 62 s.f. lobby addition, a tower addition having no new floor area, a 270 s.f. storage room addition on the 3rd floor of the building, a new 312 s.f. deck, two new patio areas totaling 585 s.f., widening the second floor corridor by 164 s.f., and alterations to the existing parking lot. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Conditional Use Permit for a non-residential use in a residential zone and zoning modifications for the new deck, parking, and trash enclosure to encroach into the interior yard setback of the residentially-zoned portion of the site. Approval of this project will abate violations outlined in ENF2008-01335.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he highly approved sprucing up the hotel of which the original design was utilitarian. He added that a tower should serve some function.

Public comment closed at 2:27 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

- 1) The applicant's response to the request that the design be simplified is appreciated; particularly the southwest elevation on State Street.
- 2) Explore returning the southeast elevation facing the parking lot to the Monterey style with its simplicity and charm.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.
- 4) The existing and proposed plans should be in a more clear presentation.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REFERRED BY FULL COMMISSION****A. 128 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2003-00243
Architect: Rex Ruskauff
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.
Agent: Tiffany Campbell
Agent: Suzanne Elledge

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval is requested to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications are requested to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

(In Progress Review. Preliminary Approval was granted September 2, 2009. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-07.)

Comments given.

NEW ITEM**B. 11 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
Application Number: MST2010-00019
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court
Architect: Jeff Gorrell
Applicant: Olio Cuana, Inc.

(Proposal for minor exterior changes to an existing commercial building to include the following: raise the existing exterior landing ten-inches, add new guardrail and handrail, raise the existing entry door and window to the new finished floor level, and provide new plaster finish to match the existing building.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:43 P.M. ****