



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 27, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present  
 DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Present  
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
 KEN CURTIS – Absent  
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
 FERMINA MURRAY – Absent  
 ALEX PUJO – Absent  
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

ROGER HORTON – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present  
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present  
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, May 22, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking Online Meetings.

**GENERAL BUSINESS (1:32):**

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

(1:38)

Marck Aguilar, Redevelopment Supervisor, commented that in 1998 the Historic Landmarks Commission encouraged Staff to obtain a period railcar to display as part of the Santa Barbara Railroad Station's restoration project. The circa 1914 Southern Pacific Business Car *Santa Barbara* will be arriving this month. A ribbon cutting ceremony is scheduled for some time in July and the HLC will be informed of the details.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 13, 2009.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 13, 2009.**

Action: Adams/Drury, 5/0/1. (Sharpe abstained. Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item B, 834 State Street, which was reviewed by Susette Naylor, and Item F, 2300 Garden Street, which was reviewed by Robert Adams.**

Action: Boucher/Shallanberger, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Curtis, Murray, and Pujo would be absent.
  - b) The Creeks Division has produced a new brochure titled “A Homeowner’s Guide to Managing Storm Water” which contains valuable information on reducing storm water flows and water pollutants from residential lots. The brochure is available online and at the Planning and Zoning Counter.
  - c) The new EPV Design Guidelines are printed and available online or at the Planning and Zoning Counter for \$15 per book.
2. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, announced that an HLC Survey Subcommittee meeting will be held at the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room on June 10 at 10:00 a.m. to discuss the update to the City Potential List.
3. Commissioner Adams announced that the HLC Summer Party will probably be held on a Sunday at his home.
4. Commissioner Sharpe announced that the book signing for Santa Barbara Conservancy’s “Stone Architecture in Santa Barbara” was postponed to June 4<sup>th</sup> from 5:00 to 8:00 p.m. to be held in the Casa de la Guerra courtyard.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 1235 VERONICA SPRINGS RD COUNTY Zone

**(1:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-039  
 Application Number: MST2003-00793  
 Owner: Hillside House  
 Applicant: John Polansky  
 Applicant: Carl Steinberg  
 Agent: Alexandra Cole  
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to annex the 23 acre property into the City's jurisdiction, demolish the existing 28,700 square foot Hillside House facility and all accessory buildings, except for one building known as the Harmony House, which is proposed to be relocated on site. The new development includes 125 new dwelling units, an administration office, community center, leasing and management office, non-profit lease space, and therapy pool. Of the proposed 125 new dwelling units, 12 units are proposed to be special need units, 28 are proposed rental units, 74 are proposed market rate units, and 11 are proposed affordable units. The development includes 5.5 acres of structures, roads and parking (includes 183 covered and 79 uncovered for a total of 262 parking spaces). The remaining area will be 4.75 acres of common open space and 13 acres of passive open space and creek setbacks. The proposal includes restoration of riparian areas along Arroyo Burro Creek and will include the removal of 176 trees (not including oaks or palms), to be replaced with 209 riparian associated trees. Total proposed grading includes 7,200 cubic feet of cut and 15,900 cubic yards of fill. The project requires City Council approval for annexation, General Plan Amendment, and Zone changes, and Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Plan.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:41 P.M. TO 1:57 P.M. \*\***

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

2. 421 E COTA ST C-M Zone

**(1:57)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-010  
 Application Number: MST2009-00250  
 Owner: Transition House  
 Architect: Mark Wienke

(Proposal to demolish an existing mixed-use commercial two-story building and existing paving and construct a new 9,969 square foot mixed-use building comprising six, two-bedroom affordable apartment units and two, two-bedroom affordable apartment units and a 2,080 square foot daycare center. A zoning modification to requested to provide 37 parking spaces rather than the required 57 parking spaces.)

**(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Fermina B. Murray, Consulting Historian.)**

Present: Marck Wienke, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this is the old Mom's Restaurant building. The report concluded that the building has been so altered over time that it is not historically significant. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions.

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

3. 1330 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

**(2:01)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001  
 Application Number: MST2007-00371  
 Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation  
 Applicant: Peikert Group Architects

(There is a Structure of Merit on this site: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch." Proposal for a three-story, mixed-use project on a vacant parking lot site. The commercial portion would include 10,000 square feet and the residential portion would include 55,180 square feet and consist of 35 residential condominium units, including 26 market rate units, four workforce units, and five inclusionary units. A 6,200 square foot "village green" and courtyard would be provided on-grade between the theater and the proposed development. The project would include a 41,000 square foot underground parking garage providing 117 parking spaces, a certain number of which would be available in the evenings for theater patrons. This project will require Planning Commission approval of a Development Plan and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

**(Review of revised Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
 Lisa Plowman, Architect

Staff comments: Melissa Hetrick, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner, stated that the report focuses on the impacts of the project on the neighboring historic resource: the "Arlington Theater." In order for an adjacent project to have a significant CEQA impact to a historic resource, the impact would have to be direct. On the other hand, a change in view would be relevant as it relates to community compatibility, design guidelines and the City's policies. The Commission would need to distinguish between CEQA findings and guideline findings as to what it supports.

Ms. Hetrick suggested that, if the Commission agrees with the report that the CEQA findings are less than significant, it could accept the report and specify that it does not agree with potential policy or design review concerns, including views and other aspects of the project.

Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, understands the HLC's view impact concerns, however, Staff believes HLC acceptance of the HSSR, does not constitute approval of the project design and still allows for project design compatibility criteria concerns to be voiced in the future. The project's size and design still ultimately requires Planning Commission and HLC approvals. Mr. Limón further clarified that, if the HLC is in disagreement with the CEQA conclusions of the report, it should not accept the report and identify reasons.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Chair Naylor acknowledged receipt of a letter from Kellam de Forest, Pearl Chase Society.

**Motion:** **To not accept the report with the following comments:** 1) The majority of the Commission believe that the proposed project would have an adverse impact on the adjacent historic building in terms of CEQA: There is an adverse impact to the spatial relationships that are a character defining aspect of the adjacent landmarked building. 2) Policy findings will affect future thinking related to view blockage and spatial relationships, which do not affect the approval or disapproval of this report.

Action: Drury/Adams, 5/1/0. (Shallanberger opposed. Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

## **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

**(2:34)**

### Consideration of Intent to Hold Public Hearing.

The Commission was requested to adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on June 24, 2009, to consider a request by Linda Dye, property owner, to designate the Flores Casita, located at 1809 Stanwood Drive, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Staff Present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian

**Motion:** **To adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on June 24, 2009, to consider a request by the property owner to designate the Flores Casita, located at 1809 Stanwood Drive, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.**

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

4. 1221 STATE ST C-2 Zone

**(2:37)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-018  
 Application Number: MST2009-00201  
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP  
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor  
 Business Name: Victoria Court Retail Complex

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Victoria Court, formerly Sears." Proposal for three new wrought iron security gates at existing pedestrian entrances to Victoria Court retail complex.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Ed Lenvik, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:42 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:** 1) The overall design is acceptable. 2) It was requested that a proportion of the bottom rail be closer to 10 inches as opposed to 6.5 inches.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:45 P.M. TO 2:51 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

5. 418 STATE ST C-M Zone

**(2:51)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024  
 Application Number: MST2009-00236  
 Owner: Gregory and Cheryl Young  
 Architect: Howard Wittausch  
 Business Name: India House

(Proposal to abate enforcement case ENF2009-00268 to upgrade roof trusses and remodel an existing storefront entry. The entry remodel will consist of recessing the storefront entrance 12'- 6" to provide covered, outdoor dining at the streetfront. This will result in a Measure E square footage credit of 488 square feet.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Howard Wittausch, Architect  
 Greg Young, Owner

**Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) It was recommended that the applicant continue to play with the proportion of the posts in order to achieve a more graceful arch shape. 2) Explore the use of the area above the frame. 3) It was suggested that the bands on the arch be tiled and not painted. 4) The ivy should be omitted from the plant list due to its invasive nature.

Action: Shallanberger/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT CALENDAR****NEW ITEM**

A. 801 GARDEN ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-029  
 Application Number: MST2009-00237  
 Owner: FBK Investments, LLC

(Proposal to replace nine existing windows like-for-like but using dual-pane instead of single-pane to match existing windows. Also proposed is to demolish two balconies and replace two pairs of French doors with windows.)

**Final Approval with the condition that new windows shall be recessed into the plaster wall in accordance with the original walls unlike other windows replaced on the surface of the plaster.**

**FINAL REVIEW**

B. 834 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-021  
 Application Number: MST2008-00071  
 Owner: First States Properties  
 Applicant: Yvonne Michals  
 Architect: Steve Hausz  
 Business Name: Bank of America

(Proposal to remove five existing automatic teller machines, install four new automatic teller machines and relocate one night drop. Any new signage is to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final with the following conditions:** 1) The bases of the existing light standards in the parking lot shall be connected so that the color either matches the light standard color or returns to a neutral concrete finish. 2) The existing trash receptacles shall be replaced with standard street receptacle types or other as appropriate in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

**NEW ITEM**

C. 130 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-410-001  
 Application Number: MST2009-00241  
 Owner: Thornhill Ranches, LP  
 Owner: Robert Egenolf

(Proposal to paint exterior of building.)

**Final Approval as noted on Sheet A-3.**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

## D. 350 CHAPALA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-450-004

Application Number: MST2008-00497

Owner: Robert J. Vickery, Condo Association President

(Proposal to install two gates and fencing at each entry stairway. The stairways are at the corners of the building facing Gutierrez and Chapala Streets and Parker Way and Chapala Street.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**Final Approval with the following conditions:** 1) The posts, horizontal bars, and frame shall be solid wrought iron stock. 2) The pickets shall be 5/8" square tubular iron. 3) The mesh on the gate and side panel shall end below the row of circles element. 4) The colors shall match the existing gates.

**NEW ITEM**

## E. 632 STATE ST

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-017

Application Number: MST2009-00252

Owner: Leroy and Lena Scharfeld

Architect: Dawn Sherry

Business Name: Tonic Bar and Nightclub

(Proposal to install a new wrought iron railing to run along the top of an existing rear patio wall.)

**Final Approval as noted on Sheet T2.1.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

F. 2300 GARDEN ST

RETIRED Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
Application Number: MST2005-00812  
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC  
Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates  
Architect: M2 Architecture  
Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.  
Contractor: Matt Construction  
Business Name: San Roque High School

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

**(Review After Final of revision to landscape plan related to accessibility changes and front steps to gymnasium.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on L.001.**

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:18 P.M. \*\***