



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 13, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Absent
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- KEN CURTIS – Absent
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

ROGER HORTON – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. There was a meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission Designations Subcommittee on Wednesday, May 13, 2009, at 10:00 A.M. in the David Gebhard Room at 630 Garden Street, to discuss the nomination of the Flores Casita at 1809 Stanwood Drive as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.
- B. On Thursday, May 7, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- C. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking Online Meetings.

**GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):**

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 29, 2009.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 29, 2009, with corrections.**

Action: Adams/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: To table the ratification of the Consent Calendar to later in the meeting.**

Action: Boucher/Drury, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

(1:54)

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Alex Pujo.**

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Curtis and Sharpe would be absent, and Chair Naylor would be stepping down from Item 3 at 2300 Garden Street.
- b) Item #1 on today's agenda, review of the Phase I Archaeological Resources Report for 825 De La Vina Street, has been postponed indefinitely at the case planner's request. The Commissioners were asked to retain their reports for future review.

- c) The updated EPV Design Guidelines were adopted yesterday by the City Council. After the document is submitted to the printer, it will take one to two weeks for completion.
  - d) There will be a special seminar training opportunity for boards and commissions. The theme will be Sustainability and Green Designs to be held on Thursday, May 28, from 9 a.m. to 12 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.
2. Commissioner Drury commended the firefighters and law enforcement on the extraordinary efforts during the Jesusita fire. The difficult task was well coordinated. Commissioner Adams added that City Staff was constantly posting updates and assisting the community, and the community itself was brought together during the disaster.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, reported that, at the Designations Subcommittee that met in the morning, the Flores Casita at 1809 Stanwood Drive was discussed and it was decided to place it on a future HLC agenda to designate it a City Structure of Merit. A resolution of intent to hold a public hearing is planned for adoption and it is scheduled to be held sometime in June, 2009.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

## **ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 825 DE LA VINA ST C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-024  
Application Number: MST2007-00400  
Owner: 825 De La Vina / Popp LLC  
Architect: B3 Architects

(Proposal for a new three-story mixed-use project to include seven residential condominiums and a total of 750 square feet of commercial space on an existing 14,750 square foot parking lot in the C-2 Zone. The proposal includes 4 one-bedroom and 3 two-bedroom residential condominiums, which vary in size from 809 to 1,776 square feet. A total of 19 parking spaces will be provided onsite (14 covered and 5 uncovered). Project requires Planning Commission review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

**This item was postponed indefinitely at the case planner's request.**

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

2. 1235 VERONICA SPRINGS RD COUNTY Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-039  
Application Number: MST2003-00793  
Owner: Hillside House  
Applicant: John Polansky  
Applicant: Carl Steinberg  
Agent: Alexandra Cole  
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to annex the 23 acre property into the City's jurisdiction, demolish the existing 28,700 square foot Hillside House facility and all accessory buildings, except for one building known as the Harmony House, which is proposed to be relocated on site. The new development includes 125 new dwelling units, an administration office, community center, leasing and management office, non-profit lease space, and therapy pool. Of the proposed 125 new dwelling units, 12 units are proposed to be special need units, 28 are proposed rental units, 74 are proposed market rate units, and 11 are proposed affordable units. The development includes 5.5 acres of structures, roads and parking (includes 183 covered and 79 uncovered for a total of 262 parking spaces). The remaining area will be 4.75 acres of common open space and 13 acres of passive open space and creek setbacks. The proposal includes restoration of riparian areas along Arroyo Burro Creek and will include the removal of 176 trees (not including oaks or palms), to be replaced with 209 riparian associated trees. Total proposed grading includes 7,200 cubic feet of cut and 15,900 cubic yards of fill. The project requires City Council approval for annexation, General Plan Amendment, and Zone changes, and Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Plan.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.**

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:42 P.M. TO 1:54 P.M. \*\***

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

## 3. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

**(1:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024  
 Application Number: MST2009-00009  
 Owner: San Roque School Charitable Trust  
 Agent: Mary Rose and Associates  
 Architect: Appleton and Associates  
 Architect: M2 Architecture  
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is eligible for City Landmark status: "St. Anthony's Seminary." The original seismic and safety upgrade project approved under application MST2005-00241 has been revised to include the following changes: Proposal for the demolition of 1,803 square feet of floor area and stair at the south elevation, courtyard side, of the Infirmary Wing to create an accessible outdoor classroom with tiered seating and to extend the existing arcade roofline to cover an accessible path. The project will also include new accessible restrooms on the lower level, a technical mezzanine on the upper level, and the integration of handicapped access at the main level. Adjustments will be made at grade to the adjoining courtyard and walkways to meet accessibility, utility, and life safety standards. Portions of the roof above the south courtyard facade of the Infirmary Wing will be removed with the remaining to be upgraded to meet structural and seismic requirements, with the overall roof height to be lowered by 4.5 feet. An existing brick chimney and roof penetrations are also proposed to be removed. A partial demolition of the south-facing courtyard will allow the restoration of five original windows on the Main Building. An existing opening between the Main Wing and Infirmary Wing will be infilled with a new window to match the existing on this 12.3 acre parcel.)

**(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
 Mary Rose, Agent

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the report contains quality photographs that are very well done. The stone walls and gates are addressed as requested. The report confirms that the entire site qualifies for designation as a City Landmark.

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the report answers questions that have been made for many years about the original structure. He confirmed that the structure was originally a German Romanesque Gothic style.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

**First**

**Motion:** To accept the report as submitted with high commendation to the applicant and the preparer of the report.

Action: Murray/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**Second**

**Motion:** The Commission directs Staff to begin the process of designating the site as a City Landmark and the applicant can now submit a letter of intent to have the site designated as a City Landmark with a time-certain commitment.

Action: Murray/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**DISCUSSION ITEM**

**(2:20)** Coordination of review and approvals for tree removals in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Mr. Limón provided an overview of current tree removal regulations. He also discussed possible ideas to improve communication between the Street Tree Advisory Committee and the HLC; such as the requirement for a written memorandum to be submitted to the HLC on specific actions or conditions imposed, appoint an HLC liaison to monitor Street Tree Advisory Committee agendas, and improved conditions of approval for tree planting and maintenance.

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the need to protect trees in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and surrounding landmarked properties.

Bob Cunningham, Street Tree Advisory Committee member, commented that the City Landmark Lyre Silk Oak tree at 1309 State Street, which was part of the Arlington Hotel's gardens, should be replaced with a like species.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The City should have a general policy that a City Landmark Tree that needs to be removed should be replaced with a like species on a case-by-case basis, with the only exception in the case of a health or safety hazard.
2. There should be an improvement of the process, rather than expansion of the bureaucracy, so as to not overburden City Staff or the public.
3. The public should be noticed when a street tree, not located on private property, is being reviewed for removal.
4. It was suggested that a peer review be required if an arborist report advises that a tree be removed.
5. The HLC landscape architect could be appointed as a liaison to the Street Tree Advisory Committee to improve communication between boards as well as adopting Staff's suggestion that a memorandum be provided to the HLC advising them of the Street Tree Advisory Committee's comments and conditions.
6. Rather than the City Council reviewing tree cutting appeals, the Street Tree Advisory Committee could review them.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

4. 1221 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

**(3:01)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-018  
 Application Number: MST2009-00201  
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court LP  
 Architect: Lenvik and Minor  
 Business Name: Victoria Court Retail Complex

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Victoria Court, formerly Sears." Proposal for three new wrought iron security gates at existing pedestrian entrances to Victoria Court retail complex.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Ed Lenvik, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The concept of the use of security gates is supportable in view of safety issues. 2) The shape, height and material of the proposed gate are not appropriate: a) It should be more traditional in style and proportion. b) It should be better integrated with the large building. c) Solid stock should be used rather than tube steel. 3) The loss of *paseo* views is of concern; therefore, the closed gates should be used after-hours.

**Action:** Adams/Shallanberger, 6/1/0. (Murray opposed because she would prefer that the windows be secured, rather than resort to the installation of a gate. Curtis/Sharpe absent.)  
 Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

5. 418 STATE ST

C-M Zone

**(3:16)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024  
 Application Number: MST2009-00236  
 Owner: Gregory and Cheryl Young  
 Architect: Howard Wittausch  
 Business: India House

(Proposal to abate enforcement case ENF2009-00268 to upgrade roof trusses and remodel an existing storefront entry. The entry remodel will consist of recessing the storefront entrance 12'- 6" to provide covered, outdoor dining at the street-front. This will result in a Measure E square footage credit of 488 square feet.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Howard Wittausch, Architect  
 Gregory Young, Owner  
 Krishan Gupta, Business Owner

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners could support the arch colors as proposed? 5/2.  
(Adams/Murray opposed.)

How many Commissioners would agree to have the arch colors toned-down? 2/5.

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** **1)** The concept is supportable and a great improvement. **2)** Study the overall integration of the entire façade and the arches: **a)** The frame appears to be over-accentuated. **b)** The space between the arch in the frame and the roof is too large and begs for something to be done with it. **3)** Planters should be integrated into the design.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

## CONSENT CALENDAR

### FINAL REVIEW

A. 834 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-021  
Application Number: MST2008-00071  
Owner: First States Investors 5000a, LLC  
Applicant: Yvonne Michals  
Architect: Steve Hausz  
Business Name: Bank of America

(Proposal to remove five existing automatic teller machines, install four new automatic teller machines and relocate one night drop. Any new signage is to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.)

**(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.**

### REVIEW AFTER FINAL

B. 15-17 W CARRILLO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-004  
Application Number: MST2008-00426  
Owner: 15 W. Carrillo, LLC  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a Structure of Merit: "15 W. Carrillo St. Building." Proposal to construct a new exit stair, door, and landing at the rear of a two-story commercial building.)

**(Review after Final of changes to add a stair cavity, maintenance access door, and stair landing windows.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

C. 2300 GARDEN ST RETIRED Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
Application Number: MST2005-00241  
Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC  
Agent: Mary Rose and Associates  
Architect: M2 Architecture  
Architect: Appleton and Associates, Inc.  
Contractor: Matt Construction Company  
Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

**(Final Approval of the Review After Final is requested.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheet AR201.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

D. 500 ANACAPA ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-031  
Application Number: MST2009-00128  
Owner: Louis and Leonila Sanchez  
Architect: Studio G  
Business Name: EOS Lounge

(Proposal to install a new awning along the Anacapa Street frontage, change exterior paint color, replace the existing wood wall treatment with smooth-troweled plaster, replace the existing frosted glazing with clear glazing, and construct a new trellis at the rear patio. Approval of a similar project under MST2007-00052 [without the proposed new trellis] has expired.)

**(Review After Final of proposed change to door and new light fixtures.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on both sheets.**

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:43 P.M. \*\***