



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 25, 2007

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present
 ALEX PUJO, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Absent
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 STEVE HAUSZ – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
 DONALD SHARPE – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Present from 1:45 p.m. to 3:00 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present until 6:00 p.m.
 Irma Unzueta, Project Planner – Present from 4:45 p.m. to 5:35 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required <u>at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. <u>Plans</u> to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Materials</u> submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on July 20, 2007 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 11, 2007.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 11, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0. (Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Ms. Gantz reviewed the motion that was made for Item 11 at the July 11th meeting. The motion called for a 'revised preliminary approval and indefinite continuance for details'. This particular item has never been reviewed as part of the project. The project has already been granted final approval. This item was on the agenda as a "review after final," which can be approved, denied, or continued. Ms. Gantz clarified that the latter portion of the motion would be correct, but the "revised preliminary" portion would not apply to this particular review. So it should just be "Continued indefinitely for details."

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie, with the exception of Item F, 31 W. Carrillo Street, which was reviewed by both William La Voie and Steve Hausz.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Commissioner Adams would be absent. Commissioner Hausz would be in around 3:00 p.m. Commissioner Naylor would be stepping down from Item 1, 2559 Puesta Del Sol and Item 10, 28 W. Cabrillo Blvd.; Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down from Item 16, 1829 State Street and Item 17, 222 W. Alamar Avenue; and Commissioner Murray would be stepping down from Item 3, 915 E. Anapamu Street, and Items 6, 7, and 8, 125 Rametto Road.
 - b) The project at 1900 Lasuen Road, which was continued two weeks to today's meeting, was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request. (This item is not on the agenda.)
 - c) Item 15 at 636 State Street shown on today's agenda was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request until such time that documentation regarding original exterior finishes requested by the HLC can be located.
 - d) Parking Superintendent Victor Garza has requested a withdrawal of the application for removing the eucalyptus tree behind the Central Library and La Arcada at 1115 Anacapa Street. He has received clear direction from Public Works management that the tree will not be removed. They will continue to monitor the retaining wall for any movement and, if at such time the wall is determined to be in danger of collapse, they will study their options to repair or replace the wall and how that would affect the tree. If, in the future, it is determined that wall work is necessary and the tree would need to be removed, then they would return to HLC for permission prior to removing the tree.
 - e) The HLC/ABR Joint Awards presentation is tentatively set on the City Council agenda for Tuesday, August 21, 2007.
2. Chair La Voie stated that the Braille Institute will be receiving an HLC/ABR Joint Award. He requested that Staff contact the architect to ask that blue prints or line drawings of the principal elevations be provided along with a photograph of a good size (no smaller than 11" x 17") for display in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.
3. Mr. Jacobus announced a City Council meeting on August 7th regarding the appeal of the Commission's decision to leave 1849 Mission Ridge Road on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Chair La Voie will be attending the meeting with Staff and Mr. Jacobus requested other Commission members' attendance as well.
4. Mr. Jacobus made the Commissioners aware of a memo from the City Attorney's Office regarding the project located at 1385 Santa Barbara Street as to a potential conflict of interest with Alex Cole preparing a Historic Structures Report since she is a member of the congregation. The City Attorney's office determined that Ms. Cole is acting as a private citizen and that a decision by the Commission to reject the report would be based on the evaluation of the report's content rather than the fact that the report was written by a member of the church.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Ms. Boucher reported on the Events Subcommittee and stated that she will circulate a sign-up sheet at the next meeting for Commissioners to indicate what they would like to share at the August 18th HLC summer gettogether.

2. Mr. Pujo asked that the proposed revisions to El Pueblo Viejo District (EPV) Guidelines by the Subcommittee be presented to the entire Commission for review. Ms. Gantz stated that Staff is working on preparing the revisions and will then present a copy to each of the Commissioners.
3. Chair La Voie reported on the Special Joint Meeting between the Planning Commission, Architectural Board of Review, and Historic Landmarks Commission that took place on July 18th. As a result of that meeting, he urged the Commission to pay closer attention to the Urban Design Guidelines and compatibility with the surrounding neighborhood when reviewing projects.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL E-1 Zone
 (1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2006-00542
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Architect: Dwight Gregory
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History

(This is a Structure of Merit: Museum of Natural History. Proposal to construct an 800 square foot one-story structure for injured raptors on a 326,498 square foot parcel.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that a Phase 2 investigation is necessary because the location of the proposed raptor building is at the base of a long slope, down which sediments may have been washed in the past. The Phase 2 investigation is a subsurface archaeological test excavation program whereby buried cultural resource materials can be detected if they exist, and this report is to be completed prior to completion of the Environmental Assessment and final approval being granted by the HLC for this project.

Motion: To accept the report with Dr. Glassow's comment that a Phase 2 investigation is necessary.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1298 LAS POSITAS RD A-1 Zone

(1:46) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-034
 Application Number: MST2006-00509
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Elings Park Foundation
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Permit and Planning Services
 Landscape Architect: George W. Girvin Associates, Inc.

(Revised proposal for Elings Park improvements to include Elings Park South. Additional improvements at the southern portion of the property accessed from Cliff Drive include a BMX track with exterior lighting, park office building, a new parking lot, a disc golf course, picnic areas, and 11,650 total cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Development Plan and recommendations to City Council for rezoning and a General Plan Amendment.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because no prehistoric or historical resources were identified within the project area, no further archaeological studies are recommended and no monitoring or mitigation measures are necessary.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Naylor/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 915 E ANAPAMU ST E-1/R-3 Zone

(1:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00331
 Owner: Charles Crail
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Permit and Planning Services

(Proposal for review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report to demolish an existing structure in anticipation of a future multi-residential project.)

(Review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by San Buenaventura Research Associates.)

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the report concludes that the house does not qualify for state, local, or national historical registers, no mitigation measures are being proposed.

Motion: To accept the report with the following conditions: 1) The mature oak tree and the sandstone wall shall be retained as significant elements that are part of the neighborhood and historic character of the site. 2) The location of the mature oak tree shall be identified in the report.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 1809 STANWOOD DR A-1 Zone

(1:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-143-005
Application Number: MST2007-00353
Owner: Linda C. Dye
Agent: Roy Harthorn

(Review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report in preparation for a proposal to replace the structure's foundation and roof and restore the porches.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates, and Roy Harthorn, Historic Building Code Consultant.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
Roy Harthorn, Consultant
Henry Lenny, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the cabin has an interesting history and there are very few left in the County. The property owner intends to restore and use the cabin. Staff reviewed the report and agreed with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 5/2/0. (Curtis/Pujo opposed because the proposed renovations will lose the connection to the period of historical significance. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

5. 1809 STANWOOD DR A-1 Zone

(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-143-005
Application Number: MST2007-00353
Owner: Linda C. Dye
Agent: Roy Harthorn

(Review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report in preparation for a proposal to replace the structure's foundation and roof and restore the porches.)

(Consideration of a structure to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for Structure of Merit status.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
Roy Harthorn, Consultant
Henry Lenny, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that, when a structures report is presented and the report finds that the property qualifies as a historic resource, by placing the property on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Potential List), the Commission retains purview over the design review. If the Commission concludes that the Architectural Board of Review would be the appropriate reviewing body, the Commission may simply not add the property to the "Potential List." Mr. Jacobus further explained that the City Ordinance provides for buildings that qualify for Structure of Merit or Landmark status to be placed on the "Potential List." The property owner would also have the option of waiving the 60-day appeal waiting period in order to move forward in a more rapid succession.

Motion: To place this structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for Structure of Merit status.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 5/2/0. (Curtis/Pujo opposed because the historical connection no longer exists. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

6. 125 RAMETTO RD A-2 Zone
 (2:08) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-011
 Application Number: MST2007-00333
 Owner: Burrows Family Trust 5/18/93
 Architect: Peter Kavonian

(Proposal for a 640 square foot master bedroom addition with a 311 square foot basement beneath to an existing 2,974 square foot residence and attached garage. The project will result in a 3,925 square foot structure on a 46,316 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District.)

(Review of Letter Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
 Peter Kavonian, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this addendum to an Historic Structures Report already approved by the Commission is for a proposed addition that the Commission will have the opportunity to review.

Motion: Continued two weeks to allow the Commission to review the original Historic Structures Report and the previously accepted Letter Addendum with the following comments: 1) Additional documentation of the original core of the building should be included in the report. 2) In view of the unusual character of the home, the Commission is to conduct a site visit.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: It was requested that the character defining interior/exterior elements be documented before anything further is done to the building.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

7. 125 RAMETTO RD A-2 Zone

(2:21) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-011
 Application Number: MST2007-00333
 Owner: Burrows Family Trust 5/18/93
 Architect: Peter Kavonian

(Proposal for a 640 square foot master bedroom addition with a 311 square foot basement beneath to an existing 2,974 square foot residence and attached garage. The project will result in a 3,925 square foot structure on a 46,316 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District.)

(Consideration of a structure to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for Structure of Merit status.)

Present: Peter Kavonian, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that placing the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources will bring the project into the Commission's design review purview.

Motion: To place the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for Structure of Merit status.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 125 RAMETTO RD A-2 Zone

(2:24) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-011
 Application Number: MST2007-00333
 Owner: Burrows Family Trust 5/18/93
 Architect: Peter Kavonian

(Proposal for a 640 square foot master bedroom addition with a 311 square foot basement beneath to an existing 2,974 square foot residence and attached garage. The project will result in a 3,925 square foot structure on a 46,316 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
 Peter Kavonian, Architect

Motion: Continued two weeks while awaiting the Commission to conduct a site visit and review of the original Historic Structures Report accepted by the Commission September 15, 1999; and the previous Letter Addendum accepted February 18, 2004.

Action: Sharpe/Naylor, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:33 P.M. TO 2:37 P.M. ****

TIME EXTENSION HEARING

9. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:37) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Agent: Stonecreek, LLC/Adventure Studios
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Applicant: MF Santa Barbara, LLC
 Architect: Doug Singletary
 Landscape Architect: Philip Suding
 Engineer: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
 Business Name: Ritz- Carlton Club

(Proposal for Entrada de Santa Barbara (formerly the Ritz-Carlton Club) involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

(Request for a fourth time extension of HLC Final Approval of Area B. The third time extension, which was granted for a period of six months, is due to expire on August 6, 2007.)

Present: Ken Marshall, Agent
 Bruce Bartlett, Architect
 Ray Wickem, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:42 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, stated that it is pleasing to see that this project is moving along. He questioned whether the construction fence that will be placed along the perimeter could be more attractive. He also suggested planting landscaping, specially facing lower State Street, to achieve the same objective. Mr. De Forest requested an update on the Californian Hotel.

Public comment closed at 2:43 p.m.

Motion: The Commission accepts the request for a one year time-extension for the Final Approval of Area B starting on August 6, 2007 (expiring on August 6, 2008).

Action: Pujo/Murray, 5/0/2. (Boucher/Sharpe abstained. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: Any significant design changes will need to comply with the Urban Design Guidelines that were adopted by City Council subsequent to the 2004 final approval of the project's design.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. 28 W CABRILLO BLVD & 1 STATE ST

HRC-1/R-4/SD-3 Zone

(2:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-002
Application Number: MST2007-00276
Owner: Beach Motel Partners
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
Business Name: Harbor View Inn Spa

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "La Casa Del Mar Motel." Proposal to convert an existing 1,812 square foot hotel conference room to a guest spa and 668 square feet of exterior improvements including a new Jacuzzi spa and privacy wall at an existing patio at the Harbor View Inn. Staff Hearing Officer approval for three zoning modifications will be required for the Jacuzzi to be located within 15 feet of the front lot line; existing overheight hedges and new wall to be located within ten feet of a front lot line; and, to add a new door within the required 30 foot front yard setback on this 67,122 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL FOR ZONING MODIFICATIONS.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
Mark Romasanta, Owner

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments conveyed to the Staff Hearing Officer:** **1)** The Commission recommends acceptance of the request for the modification to install a solid fence at the proposed location based on the mitigation for the encroachment that the design provides pedestrian interest and public value with the incorporation of public art. **2)** The design should be modified to include a panel of either decorative or mural tile. **3)** The wall top should have some traditional shape.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: The Commission has considered the installation of the solid wall at the proposed location acceptable and the details of the ceramic tile can be worked-out at the Consent Calendar. The wall will be plaster with stone base, stone cap, and a ceramic tile design. The top of the wall should have some vertical relief.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

11. 651 PASEO NUEVO C-2 Zone

(3:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Application Number: MST2007-00292
Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency
Applicant: Glen Morris
Business Name: Paseo Nuevo

(Proposal to change all incandescent light bulbs throughout the Paseo Nuevo complex to compact fluorescent bulbs in 46 existing wrought iron and glass "Wynona" wall mounted and free standing light fixtures.)

(Review After Final of alternate light bulb.)

Present: Glen Morris, Applicant

Motion: Final approval of the Review After Final of the alternate light bulb as proposed.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:11 P.M. TO 3:20 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

12. 19 E ORTEGA ST C-2 Zone

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-013
Application Number: MST2007-00348
Owner: 710 State Street Partners
Architect: Richard Six/Lenvik & Minor Architects

(Proposal for exterior changes to an existing commercial building including a new fenestration layout on the south elevation including window trim and awnings at the first floor entry, minor alterations to the exterior stairs including new walls and header wall to enclose the area under the stairs, new bike storage with wrought iron enclosure, new metal trellis at a first floor window, new metal fascia at the second story entry, new plaster surfacing on entire building, new light fixtures, and new plantings for the existing landscaped areas.)

(Environmental Assessment is complete.)

Present: Richard Six, Architect

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would agree that the applicant should abandon the concept of retaining the existing ironwork on the stairs? 2/4. (Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Sharpe opposed. Naylor abstained.)

How many Commissioners would agree that the entire building needs more work? 7/0.
(All agreed.)

How many Commissioners would support the direction of incorporating elements of the modern ironwork, with great restraint, into the ironwork design? 3/4.
(Boucher/Curtis/Pujo/Sharpe opposed.)

How many Commissioners would require that the ironwork be more traditional? 4/3.
(La Voie/Murray/Naylor opposed.)

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The commission greatly appreciates the efforts to make the building more Hispanic in style, but more attention needs to be paid to the mass of the building and the authenticity of the architectural expression. 2) Further study the incorporation of the existing iron rail on the stairway as the Commission is ambivalent about the retention of this non-traditional element.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: The applicant is to provide a landscape plan.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018
Application Number: MST2006-00750
Owner: Emily and Blake Jones
Architect: Peter Becker

(This structure was found to be eligible for City Landmark status and is to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The proposed changes are to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 699 square foot addition, 2,019 interior remodel, 100 square foot crawl space conversion for pool equipment and remodel of basement space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a new 220 square foot pergola with fireplace and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would include a remodel and window change. Staff Hearing Officer approval will be required for a modification for conversion of a non-conforming garage to an accessory space.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL FOR ZONING MODIFICATIONS.)

Present: Peter Becker and Christine Cunningham, Architects
Grant Castleberg, Landscape Architect

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support the expression of the pergola with plaster supports? 5/2.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments:**
1) The Commission supports the modification for the reason that there are no physical changes to the proposed accessory space element on the property and the conversion is being made at the request of the Transportation Department. **2)** The expression of the pergola should be with plaster supports. **3)** The Commission expressed enthusiastic support for restoration of the building with the elements proposed and for the landscape plan, with the exception of the removal of any skyline trees. **4)** The landscape plan is to be reviewed by the Commission's Landscape Architect. **5)** The project is ready for preliminary approval.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: Applicant is to submit the arborist's report to Staff for Commissioner Adams to review it.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

14. 1022 LAGUNA ST R-3 Zone

(4:14) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-022
 Application Number: MST2006-00269
 Owner: David S. and Laura M. Correia
 Architect: Murray Duncan Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,025 square foot residence and 300 square foot accessory structure and to construct a new 7,349 net square foot, three-story, two-unit residential condominium development with a rooftop deck on a 5,030 square foot lot. The project will include four covered parking spaces on the ground level. Staff Hearing Officer approval will be required for the Tentative Subdivision Map, the Condominium Development, and two Zoning Modifications for encroaching into the front and interior yard setbacks.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT, AND TWO ZONING MODIFICATIONS.)

Present: Murray Duncan, Architect
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m.

Anthony Miratti, neighbor, objected to the scope of the project because of its height and felt it would obstruct the public view. He stated he had letters from the neighbors who also oppose the project. He pointed out that the street is very narrow and there is no parking available on the street due to the proximity of the jury duty area and Santa Barbara High School.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 4:30 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The bulk, mass and scale are not yet acceptable and need to be reduced. 2) The architecture has improved, but could stand further simplification. 3) Look into burying the parking further into the ground to reduce the height of the building. 4) The front yard should not be paved so that the amount of landscaping is not reduced.

Action: Sharpe/Naylor, 5/0/2. (Curtis/Naylor abstained. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

15. 636 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00257
 Owner: Gallina Family Trust
 Applicant: Derrick Prodigalidad
 Architect: Kenneth Gruskin
 Business Name: Verison Wireless (Johnny's Greek Deli)

(Proposal for exterior alterations of the streetscape facade including changes to finishes, doors, and windows. Proposed new signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

(Second Concept Review.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at applicant's request in order to find materials requested by the HLC at its last hearing.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

16. 1829 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

(4:46) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-007
 Application Number: MST2004-00132
 Owner: Emmet J. Hawkes Family Trust
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a mixed-use development on two separate parcels (027-031-007 for 1829 State Street and 027-031-006 for 11 W. Pedregosa Street). The commercial portion of the project would be located on the first and second floors of the three-story building facing State Street consisting of 3,000 square feet of retail space and 1,600 square feet of office space, with one residential unit on the second and third floors. The remaining residential units would be contained in a three-story building facing Pedregosa Street. The proposed residential unit mix includes four, three-bedroom units and three, two-bedroom units. The project includes 21 parking spaces, 14 of which are open spaces to allow for shared use. In addition, an existing single-family residence on the Pedregosa Street parcel is proposed to be demolished. The project is currently under appeal at City Council and may require Planning Commission approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map and a Development Plan.)

(Fifth Concept Review of a project that has been redesigned so as to not require zoning modifications.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT CURRENTLY UNDER APPEAL AT CITY COUNCIL AND MAY REQUIRE PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND A DEVELOPMENT PLAN.)

Present: Irma Unzueta, City Project Planner
Tom Ochsner, Architect
Troy White, Dudek and Associates
Emmet Hawkes, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:11 p.m.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 5:11 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners agree with the size, bulk, and scale as proposed? 0/6. (All disagreed.)

How many Commissioners would agree that if the roof deck was smaller it would become more acceptable? (Most disagreed.)

How many Commissioners would agree that the problem is the mass of the elevator? 6/0. (All agreed.)

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**
1) The portion of the project proposed to be facing State Street: a) The size, bulk, and scale on the State Street elevation is generally acceptable. b) Landscaping on State Street is important and it is suggested to minimize hardscape to help mitigate the building size. c) Simplify the architecture. **2) The portion of the building proposed to be in the back:** a) In order to further reduce the height of the building, recess the garage further into the ground. b) Subterranean parking is requested. c) The majority of the Commission does not support the roof deck, particularly the mass of the elevator. **3) Provide a computer model of the building to help understand its massing.**

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 6/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

17. 222 W ALAMAR AVE R-3/SD-2 Zone

(5:36) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-213-008
 Application Number: MST2006-00318
 Owner: Kevin Fewell
 Applicant: Jim Donohoe
 Architect: On Design Architecture and Planning

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "McKain Residence." Proposal to demolish an existing 1,486 square foot single family residence and detached 220 square foot garage and construct three new condominium units totaling 2,627 square feet. Five parking spaces will be provided in three attached garages totaling 1,070 square feet. This approximately 6,000 square foot parcel is located outside of El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Staff Hearing Officer approval will be required for a front yard setback modification and a parking modification.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A FRONT YARD SETBACK MODIFICATION AND A PARKING MODIFICATION.)**

Present: Noah Greer and Justin Van Mullem, On Design Architects

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would agree that the roof pitch of the front porch should be shallower, but remain hipped? 6/0. (All agreed.)

How many Commissioners could support the dormer on the front elevation in the location where it is being proposed? 4/2.

How many Commissioners would agree with connecting the porches between Units C and D? 1/5. (Boucher/Curtis/La Voie/Murray/Naylor opposed.)

How many Commissioners would agree to relocate Unit B's entry door? 6/0. (All agreed.)

Public comment opened at 5:59 p.m.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 5:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and then return to Consent for preliminary and final approval with the following comments: 1) The project is worthy of preliminary approval and is to return to the Consent Calendar for final review. 2) The parking modification is supportable. 3) The modification to the front yard setback is supportable, mitigated by usable depth of the front porch contributing to the character of the neighborhood and usable open space for the inhabitants. 4) The roof pitch of the front porch needs to be shallower, but remain a hip. 5) Relocating the entry door on Unit B was recommended. 6) All other elements of the design are acceptable.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 6/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

18. 12 E MONTECITO ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(5:59) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-016
 Application Number: MST95-00044
 Applicant: Rodney James Shull Memorial Foundation
 Architect: Gregory Burnett and Michael Collins/Gensler
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(Proposal to construct an 11,091 square foot two-story youth hostel with 100 beds and 60 parking spaces on a vacant parcel.)

(Final Approval of the Project is requested.)

(ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT IS COMPLETE AND PROJECT HAS RECEIVED A SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE DETERMINATION.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 Michael Collins, Architect
 Philip Suding, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 6:26 p.m.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury, local resident, expressing opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 6:26 p.m.

Motion: Final approval with the following conditions and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for review of details: 1) The handicap access rail shall be relocated to the entrance. 2) The current HLC Landscape Architect shall review the landscape plans.

Action: Pujol/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Adams/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

A. 1 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-017
 Application Number: MST2007-00297
 Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust 12/3/03
 Architect: Larry Clark
 Business Name: Eladio's Restaurant

(Proposal for rooftop equipment screening with wrought iron grillework and bird netting.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Continued two weeks.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
Application Number: MST2005-00812
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: Machin and Associates, Inc.
Business Name: San Roque High School

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

(Reinstatement of expired Historic Landmarks Commission final approval granted on February 8, 2006.)

Reinstatement approved.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 801 GARDEN ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-029
Application Number: MST2007-00308
Owner: FBK Investments, LLC
Contractor: Gencon Development, Inc.
Business Name: Antioch University

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to remove an as-built second floor wrought iron railing and install a new wooden railing to match the existing Monterey style wooden railing at another location on the building. This is to abate violation ENF2007-00528.)

(Third Concept Review.)

Final approval as noted on the drawing.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

D. 118 E ISLAY ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-002
Application Number: MST2006-00629
Owner: Joseph G. Finegold
Architect: Peter Becker

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Howard House. Proposal for a second story remodel including interior work and the addition of two dormers and replacement of a rear deck on a 9,324 square foot lot.)

(Review After Final of proposed shed dormer to replace an existing skylight.)

Final approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

E. 1129 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2006-00197
Owner: 1129 State Street
Agent: Adam Geeb, SIMA Corporation
Architect: Douglas Keep
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and the California Inventory of Historic Resources: San Marcos Court Building. Proposed exterior renovations as follows: on the east elevation, remove existing first floor awnings, reconfigure entry, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, add cornice dental molding to match existing, add cornice band below second story windows, add new windows and entry doors, and repaint exterior. At the interior arcade off State Street, reconfigure windows and doors and add a tile wainscot. At the courtyard south wall, restore arched openings to match original design (currently filled in), restore existing paving material, reconfigure existing planting areas and add a low curb, and add new plantings in selected areas. At the west elevation, reconfigure stairs to combine 1123 and 1129 rear entrance, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, and remove existing tile roof appendage. This parcel is approximately 52,801 square feet and is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Review After Final of additional exterior changes.)

Final approval of Review After Final as noted on the drawing.

FINAL REVIEW

F. 31 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-001
Application Number: MST2007-00004
Owner: Due West, LLP
Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.
Architect: Backen Gillam
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
Designer: Ann Kale & Associates
Business Name: Hotel Andalucía

(Proposed door and window changes to the south elevation and *porte-cochère* and new light fixtures, awnings, and planters on the south and west elevations. Also proposed is to change out existing tile and add new tile in the *porte-cochère* and the addition of four decorative flags over the vehicle entry on Carrillo Street.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final approval of the project with the condition that the *porte-cochère* chandeliers shall return for Consent Review in two weeks.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:28 P.M. ****