



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 23, 2006

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, Chair, Absent
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair, Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER, Present
- STEVE HAUSZ, Present
- VADIM HSU, Present, left from 3:39 p.m. until 3:50 p.m., and left the meeting at 5:47 p.m.
- ALEX PUJO, Absent
- CAREN RAGER, Present
- FERMINA MURRAY, Absent
- SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present
- DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent
- ROGER HORTON, Present
- WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II, Present
- KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on August 18, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 9, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 9, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 5/0/2, (Rager abstained, and Hsu abstained from Item 8, 1926 Santa Barbara Street).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Chair La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following changes to the agenda:

- a) Chair Suding and Commissioner Murray will be absent from today's meeting.
- b) Commissioner Naylor will be stepping down on Items 2 and 19, 320 E. Victoria Street and 2300 Garden Street, respectively.
- c) Commissioner Rager will be stepping down on Items 7, 15, and 19, 1214 State Street, 1210 State Street, and 2300 Garden Street, respectively.

2. Chair La Voie acknowledged receipt and thanked Mr. William Mahan for the comparative analysis report on three-story buildings distributed to the Commission, and requested that a copy of the report be kept available to the Commission in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 333 S CANADA ST A R-3 Zone

(1:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-300-021
Application Number: MST2005-00682
Owner: Shannon Family Living Trust
Architect: Joseph Moticha

(Proposal to construct a new three-story duplex consisting of a 674 square foot two-car garage with a 1,143 square foot, duplex above and 156 square foot of balcony on a 5,000 square foot lot. The lot is currently developed with an existing 772 square foot, two-story residence with a 772 square foot, three-car garage which is proposed to remain unaltered. The site previously had a two-story duplex which was demolished under BLD2005-01336.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comment: Ms. Gantz stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.
Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 320 E VICTORIA ST R-3 Zone

(1:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-005
Application Number: MST2004-00511
Owner: Victoria Garden Mews
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(This is a second revision of the project description. Proposal to retain the front, two-story portion of an existing single-family residence, add a new porch at the street façade, remove the one-story portion at the rear of the house, and add a new two-story addition. Also proposed is to demolish an existing storage shed and garages at the rear of the property and construct three new residential units with four attached two-car garages accessed from the public alley. The new units are proposed to vary between 1,000 and 1,800 square feet each and total approximately 6,931 net square feet, including the new garages.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comment: Ms. Gantz stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.
Action: Hausz/Rager, 6/0/0, (Naylor stepped down, Suding and Murray absent).

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 526 W ANAPAMU ST

R-3 Zone

(1:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-152-008
 Application Number: MST2005-00311
 Owner: Mark Jacobsen
 Architect: Mark Wienke

(Proposal to construct five attached two-story condominium units. The proposed units include two 832 square foot two-bedroom units and three 518 square foot one-bedroom units, each with an attached two-car garage. A Modification is required to allow all five garages to encroach into the interior yard setback. Planning Commission approval is required for a Tentative Map for a one-lot subdivision. The project includes demolition of two single-family residences, a detached garage, a shed, and proposes 20 cubic yards of grading outside the main building footprint on the 10,199 square foot lot.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comment: Ms. Gantz stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public Comment opened at 1:36 p.m.

Ms. Celeste Barber expressed concern regarding the older rural California Bungalow style home in front, and opposed the options of either demolishing or moving specifically the older front home.

Mr. Jacobus determined that the home was not an exceptional example of a California Bungalow style home and the setting is predominantly large, multi-family developments; therefore, the house does not have any historic significance. However, due to public interest in the house, Staff has requested a Historic Structures/Sites Report currently pending to the Commission. A draft of the report indicates that the structure is not in as good a condition as it appears from the street, it is doubtful it could be moved, and it does not qualify for Structure of Merit or Historic Landmark status. Per Chair La Voie's request, Mr. Jacobus will notify Ms. Barber when the report is presented to the Commission for review.

Public comment closed 1:49 p.m.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.
 Action: Hausz/Rager, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 420 E ANAPAMU ST

R-3 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-005
 Application Number: MST2005-00442
 Owner: Glennon Mueller
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor
 Agent: David Stone

(The existing residence is Landmark-worthy. Proposal to construct two new condominium units adjacent to an existing single-family residence for a total of three two-story condominium units. An existing one-car garage is proposed to be demolished and replaced with three new two-car garages. A total of 3,770 square feet of living space and 1,377 square feet of garage space is proposed for the 9,044 square foot lot. Staff Hearing officer approval is required for a Modification for relief from the minimum dimensions for private outdoor living space, a tentative subdivision map, and the condominium development.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comment: Ms. Gantz stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report’s conclusions and recommendations.

Ms. Rager requested clarification on a typographical error on page 8 regarding the section “archaeological record search/field investigations,” and referenced the missing Figure 3 of the report which was duly noted and clarified by Ms. Gantz.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with noted grammatical corrections as stated.

Action: Naylor/Hausz, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

5. 817 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone

(1:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00667
 Owner: Manfred W. Schoepp
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser
 Agent: Heather Macfarlane

(Proposal for a two-story, mixed-use project consisting of five new condominium units totaling 7,728 square feet, one new 843 square foot commercial space and fourteen parking spaces on a 13,677 square foot lot. The existing 1,364 square foot one-story residence, 1,370 square foot garage and 599 square foot shed to be demolished.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)

Staff comment: Ms. Gantz, stated Dr. Glassow and Debra Andalaro, Environmental Analyst, have reviewed the report and do not agree with the Archaeologist’s recommended mitigation due to the low probability of resources being impacted and recommend standard site monitoring as appropriate and adequate.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the condition of site monitoring.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

***** THE COMMISSION RECESSED AT 1:54 P.M. UNTIL 2:01 P.M. *****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

6. 110 W SOLA ST C-2 Zone

(2:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-062-010
 Application Number: MST2006-00427
 Owner: Carmac & Associates, LLC
 Agent: Alexandra Cole

(Proposed demolition of a commercial building.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architect/Historian
John McManus, Property Owner/Representative

Staff comment: Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, has reviewed and agrees with the findings of the report that the building is Structure of Merit-worthy, and pointed out that the original photograph on page 6 of the report exhibited elegance and simplicity of design. Because there is no specific project analyzed in the report, the Commission has two alternatives: a) Accept the report as it is, without a project proposal and with the understanding that project plans shall be reviewed by the HLC; and an addendum shall be prepared by the historical consultant to be attached to the report; or b) Continue indefinitely until the conceptual plans can be reviewed by the historical consultant and the findings can be included in the report. Mr. Jacobus also pointed out the required Mitigation Measure No. 1 on page 17, which would allow the Commission to receive a second opinion on the actual proposal once it comes forward, or indefinitely postpone the report until it could be addressed in the report itself.

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest, interested party, commented that, since the Arlington Hotel (formerly the Arlington Garage) does not have many original structures remaining on the original site, this property should be protected since it is near the original site.

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

Motion: The report is continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Page 15 of the report contains a list of many criteria on why this is an important site. Examples of craftsmanship and detailing serve to emphasize and establish this structure as a familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, and a definite presence on the corner, and garners respect for what has been accomplished in the past. Therefore, an effort should be made to preserve such buildings in order to establish an architectural landscape for the neighborhood. 2) Since the building is eligible as a Structure of Merit, other opportunities should be explored besides the Spanish-Colonial or the expressed Mission Revival styles, in an effort to preserve some, if not all, of the building before final acceptance of the report. 3) Criteria F of the report mentioned some of the building's most historically significant architects of the period and adds somewhat to the historical significance of the building. 4) One Commissioner suggested that the parking garage at the corner of Ortega and Anacapa Streets may serve as an example of an historic building which was replicated in the process of building the façades. 5) There are characteristics and parts of the building which are worth saving, and other parts compromised by the building's checkered history; therefore this Commission's reticence to approve a demolition is understandable when it is not known whether a replacement will be forthcoming or what that replacement might be.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

7. 1214 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:17)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada Tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second-floor lobby area.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Principal Architect
 Monisha Adnani, Project Manager
 Tim Hazeltine from Post-Hazeltine Associates

Staff comment: Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, asked the Commission to request a revision under Required Mitigation Measure No. 4, Page 10, which reads as "The interior pilasters shall be retained if the buttresses are added to the exterior of the building." Staff requests the additional language of: "Before installation of the exterior buttresses, the applicant shall provide an engineer's report indicating that the interior pilaster columns are in good enough condition to be retained." Staff makes this request to ensure that interior pilasters will be in an acceptable condition despite exposure to the elements during restoration. Additionally, Mr. Jacobus requested the applicant clarify the issues of whether the concrete block applies to the egress addition on the south wall only, i.e., whether the new side and rear stage-fly walls will be board-free concrete, and whether the interior pilasters will be oval in shape or the present rectangle shape as presented on Floor Plan No. 3, Figure 5c.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following conditions: 1) The acceptance of the report is only for the south portion of the wall below the trusses. 2) One Commissioner will not accept an industrial solution to the building in place of architecture, especially to the rear of the building. The Commission would like to see the applicant exhibit a serious preservation effort of the Granada Theatre restoration; preferably without undue exposure to the elements. 3) The Commission does not accept the exterior exposed pilasters in their current design. 4) Prior to acceptance, the report shall include a letter from the proprietary engineer indicating that the process of wall coring to inject concrete into the cells of the block wall can or cannot be done. 5) Prior to acceptance, the report shall include a letter from the proprietary engineer or qualified architect indicating that the interior pilaster column's finish is in good enough condition to be retained.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 6/0/0, (Rager stepped down, Suding and Murray absent).

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

8. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:31) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and Units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Review of Letter Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report for Buildings 4, 25, 26, and 29 of Group K prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian
 Minh Pham, Ownership Representative

Staff comment: Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendation of the report. He stated that Sheet A.25.00, Building 25 Construction Floor Plan should be designated as Buildings 25 and 26, since both cottages are virtually identical and differ only in how the foundations meet the ground, which does not affect the nature of the report.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.
 Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

FINAL REVIEW

9. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and Units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Final Approval is requested for Buildings 4, 25, 26 and 29 of Group K.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION No. 057-04.)

- Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
Minh Pham, Ownership Representative
Alexandra Cole, Historian
- Motion: **ARCHITECTURE FOR GROUP K, BUILDINGS 4, 25, 26 AND 29:** Continued two weeks with the applicant to provide completed drawings including architectural details and matching elevations.
- Action: Hsu/Hausz, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).
- Motion: **LANDSCAPING:** Final Approval as submitted with the comment that one straight entrance walkway shall be slightly altered into a more graceful curve.
- Action: Pujo/Hausz, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2005-00490
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Architect: Henry Lenny
Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and Units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; THIS MAY REQUIRE ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
Minh Pham, Ownership Representative
Alexandra Cole, Historian

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern regarding the swimming pool's proximity to the cottage house versus the house and made some suggestions regarding an access pathway to the pool and the stonework.

Public comment ended at 3:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The applicant shall seriously reconsider the location, shape, enclosure, and axis of the pool. 2) If the shape of the pool is to be axial, then it needs a focal point and the axis defined and reinforced. 3) Making the pool smaller helped in the design. 4) The Commission appreciates the three-dimensional display model of the previous pool design presented, and hope such will continue to be presented as the design develops. 5) The view from Alameda Padre Serra needs to be reconsidered. 6) The Commission recommends the use of ashlar-cut sandstone, a reduction in the size of the buttress wall, a careful consideration of landscape screening, and the provision of vine pockets. 7) The size, bulk, and scale of the pool need to be reduced. 8) The Commission continues to be concerned with the imposition of a structure in the historic lawn, and would prefer a pool in the lawn as opposed to a structure. If any structures are added, they need to be a part of the composition, whether axial or other.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

11. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:38) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued review of proposed valet parking structure and tennis court of Group L.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; THIS PORTION OF THE PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
 Minh Pham, Ownership Representative
 Alexandra Cole, Historian

Straw vote: Is the Commission satisfied with the tennis court location and the demonstrated landscape screening? 2/2/1, (Naylor and Boucher opposed, La Voie abstained; Rager had a qualified vote pending further development of the design particularly the entry; Hsu, Suding, and Murray absent).

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission is concerned about the southwest corner and the entrance to the garage which needs to be unobtrusive and wonderful, and requested the applicant present a three-dimensional model for review. 2) The undergrounding of a human support staff continues to be a concern. 3) The landscape screening appears adequate but continues to be a concern, especially at the southwest corner of the site where there is a minimal amount of space to accomplish such adequate screening. 4) The Commission seems reassured that the whole north side will be perfectly hidden because it is underground and will no longer be a concern.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 6/0/0, (Hsu, Suding, and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW-PUBLIC HEARING

12. 630 ANACAPA ST

C-M Zone

(3:49)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-011
Application Number: MST2005-00798
Owner: James Craviotto
Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.
Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,155 square foot house, 506 square foot garage, and 5,507 square feet of commercial buildings, and construct a four-level mixed-use project (three stories above-ground and one story underground) with 11,507 square feet of commercial space and 10 residential condominium units (three studios and seven two-bedroom units). A total of 34 parking spaces will be provided with 18 spaces for the larger condominiums in separate two-car garages and 16 spaces for the studios and commercial use in an underground parking structure. The two parcels involved (031-151-011 at 630 Anacapa Street and 031-151-001 at 634 Anacapa Street) total approximately 21,000 square feet. The project will require a voluntary lot merger and Planning Commission approval of the Development Plan and for a Tentative Subdivision Map for the condominium development.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, A VOLUNTARY LOT MERGER, AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND APPROVAL OF THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect
Steve Fort, Agent for Tynan Group, Inc.

Staff Comment: Mr. Jacobus reported that a draft Historic Structures/Sites Report was received regarding this project and will be reviewed.

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern regarding the mass, bulk, and scale of the proposed four-story project, the height of the structure compared to the parking structure, and the canting of the building.

Public comment ended at 4:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:
1) The completeness and extent of the presentation, and particularly the inclusion of the model, was greatly appreciated by the Commission. 2) All of the Commissioners were concerned about size, bulk, and scale, and would like to see it reduced. 3) There was a mixed reaction from the Commission regarding the angle, and perhaps site landscaping might be a solution to the problem. 4) Almost all the Commissioners requested a simplification of the massing, to be less fractured and less complicated. 5) Requests by several Commissioners to reduce the story-to-story height. 6) Several comments by the Commission in support of the courtyard, but concerns were expressed regarding the building mass' infringement on the courtyard experience. 7) Appreciation was expressed on efforts to maintain the mountain view and to address the corner. 8) The Commission would encourage and support the Craviotto presence on the site, perhaps in a more public place than the courtyard, and address the adjacent properties in the design. 9) The Commission requested enhancement of the pedestrian experience along the street frontages.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW-PUBLIC HEARING

13. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:36) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
 Application Number: MST2006-00312
 Owner: Carlos Adame
 Agent: Lisa Plowman
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Concept Review only of a proposal for a new 5,390 square foot, four-story mixed-use development including the preservation of a structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Myers Cottage). The project will include new construction at ground level to provide commercial space and commercial and residential garages, a second level terrace to provide a platform for the raised historic structure housing office/retail space, and new construction at the rear housing two 3-bedroom condominiums. Staff Hearing Officer approval will be required for the Development Plan, a Tentative Subdivision Map for the condominium development, and a Modification for the 10% open space requirement.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; CONCEPT REVIEW REQUESTED. HISTORIC STRUCTURES/SITES REPORT NOT YET ACCEPTED AS OF THIS DATE. PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, A VOLUNTARY LOT MERGER, AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND APPROVAL OF THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect
 Gordon Bruier, Architect
 Lisa Plowman, Agent
 Carlos Adame, Property Owner

Public comment opened at 4:48 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern regarding preservation of the proposed project's cottage and historic stonework.

Mr. Fred Shriver expressed support of the proposed project since he had a similar project and was researching the City's review process.

Public comment ended at 4:50 p.m.

Motion: 1) The Commission does not support the proposed project, however it does appreciate the applicant's efforts to preserve the existing building. 2) The Commission does not find the size, bulk, and scale appropriate for this particular neighborhood, and does not support the loss of the stone wall which was identified in the Historical Report as being desirous to be retained.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW-PUBLIC HEARING

14. 1311 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(5:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-009
Application Number: MST2006-00479
Owner: Mark Huston
Architect: Doug Reeves
Applicant: Doug Reeves

(Proposal for a 792 square foot, two-story addition and façade alterations at the front and rear to an existing two-story 2,697 square foot restaurant. The project will require Staff Hearing officer approval of a Modification to reduce the required number of parking spaces.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A PARKING MODIFICATION.)

Present: Doug Reeves, Applicant/Architect

Staff Comment: Mr. Jacobus commented that the structure has been altered several times and therefore a Historic Structures/Sites Report is not required.

Public comment opened at 5:17 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest gave a brief historic background report of the original Edwards-Plunkett designed paseo with access to the rear of the proposed property which has altered from the original storefront Arlington design through the years.

Ms. Silvia Ronchietto, neighbor, expressed concern regarding parking and the pedestrian corridor of the proposed project. Chair La Voie referred her to the Staff Hearing Officer meeting of which she will also receive notice.

Ms. Leslie H. Lopez, neighbor, also expressed concern of maintaining the integrity of the original Plunkett design regarding the rear access, front recess, and stucco entrance of the proposed project, and respectfully requested consideration for a courtyard-type of garden.

Public comment ended at 5:20 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would like to see the building remain in its present configuration on the State Street elevation, i.e., symmetrical as per the original design? 6/1/0, (Hsu opposed, Suding and Murray absent).

Straw vote: How many Commissions would like the front elevations to remain the way it is currently? 5/2/0, (Hsu and Naylor opposed, Suding and Murray absent).

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support the front elevation as proposed on Sheet A7? 2/5/0, (La Voie, Rager, Hausz, Pujo, and Boucher opposed, Suding and Murray absent).

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support the front elevation as proposed on Sheet A7a? 3/4/0, (Rager, Hsu, Hausz, and Boucher opposed, Suding and Murray absent).

- Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer: 1) The Commission supports the encroachment towards the paseo with the condition that landscaping is added. 2) That the proposed building be set back from the property line by three feet by adequate landscaping buffer between the paseo and the building. 3) The Commission supports the modification with the encroachment to within three feet of the property line.
- Action: Hsu/Boucher, 7/0/0, (Suding and Murray absent).

FINAL REVIEW

15. 1210 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(5:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2005-00323
 Owner: Granada Tower, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs, adding rooftop dormers and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation of the Granada Tower. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION No. 043-06.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
 Rob Rossi, Property Owner
 Diana Kelly, Project Manager
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Staff Comment: Ms. Gantz gave a brief synopsis of the HLC review from May 17, 2006 regarding the proposed roofing materials.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support the material replicating the shingle style roof? 1/4/0, (La Voie, Pujo, Naylor, and Boucher opposed, Rager stepped down, Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would prefer the Fiberglas "Lincoln red" tile? 5/0/0, (Rager stepped down, Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

Motion: Final Approval of the synthetic fiberglass two-piece Mission style "Lincoln red" tile, with the stipulation that patination be applied to give them an aged appearance.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 5/0/0, (Rager stepped down, Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

Second

Motion: To remove the faux mansard cap of the elevator tower, and with historical findings that this determination was made for the preservation and continued use of this building.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 3/2/0, (Naylor and Boucher opposed, Rager stepped down, Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

16. 1811 STATE ST

C-2/R-4 Zone

(5:58)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-012
Application Number: MST2006-00468
Owner: 1811 State Street, LLC
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposed façade remodel of an existing two-story commercial building and minor third-floor addition of approximately 36 square feet to provide rooftop access.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) The Commission would be open to the applicant's further exploration of making the buttresses taller or add finials to the buttresses. 2) Bring the roof element closer to the chimney.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 6/0/0, (Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

17. 628 STATE ST

C-M Zone

(6:09)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-026
Application Number: MST2005-00584
Owner: Bernard Mac Elhenny
Architect: On Design
Business Name: The Habit

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a new trellis with retractable canopy to shade the rear patio and add 22 tables, 40 chairs, two umbrellas, two umbrella heaters, three gas heaters, and a new cover on an as-built awning.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely due to the absence of the applicant.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 6/0/0, (Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

18. 421 E FIGUEROA ST R-3 Zone

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-017
 Application Number: MST2004-00008
 Owner: Allen & Angela Zimmer
 Architect: Architects West

(This is a City Landmark: Arrellanes-Kirk Adobe. Proposal to demolish 1,000 square feet of an existing 1,810 square foot residence and add 2,330 square feet to the residence. Additionally, the applicant proposes to add two rental units totaling 5,335 square feet.)

(Review After Final of changes to exterior siding.)

Present: Allen Zimmer, Architect

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final to support the use of shingle in place of board and batten siding.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 6/0/0, (Hsu, Suding and Murray absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

19. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(6:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00311
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC c/o Price Postel Parma
 Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: Machin & Mead
 Contractor: Plant Construction

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed upgrade of site utilities including electrical, gas, and plumbing comprised of trenchwork on existing roadways and in front of the main building, new transformer on concrete pad, new switchgear, and four new fire hydrants. Accessibility improvements will be in conformance with current California Building Code to be implemented in phases related to building upgrades under separate permits. Some parking spaces are proposed to be either slightly shifted or relocated to accommodate accessibility route.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

Present: Mary Rose, Agent
 George Machin, Architect
 Alexander Cole, Architect/Historian

THIS ITEM LOST QUORUM: CONTINUED TWO WEEKS WITH NO MOTION OR ACTION; COMMENTS ONLY.

Commission

Comments: Continued indefinitely to Full Board due to loss of quorum with the following comments:
 1) Landscape lighting should be the less contemporary ground-mounted Teka Lighting Product No. 1130. 2) Applicant shall return with photometric details including wattage, and the pole fixtures should be the "champagne color" high pressure sodium.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

- A. 302 W MICHELTORENA ST R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-012
Application Number: MST2006-00448
Owner: Ruben Montes

(This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for construction of a patio cover, door alteration, and exterior utility hookups at an existing six-unit residential structure located on a 6,381 square foot lot.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Continued two weeks.

CONTINUED ITEM

- B. 301 PASEO NUEVO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-015
Application Number: MST2006-00472
Owner: Redevelopment Agency/Santa Barbara
Agent: Glen Morris
Applicant: Paseo Nuevo Assoc.
Business Name: Forth & Towne

(Proposal to paint the façade of a commercial building (formerly April Cornell retail store) located in Paseo Nuevo shopping mall.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Continued indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

NEW ITEM

- C. 1311 ANACAPA ST REAR HOUSE C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-007
Application Number: MST2006-00488
Owner: Wyman Family Trust
Contractor: Genesis Stoneworks

(Proposal to replace an existing concrete driveway and brick walkway with Genesis Stoneworks charcoal/moss colored pavers.)

Final Approval with the condition that the pavers shall have a tumbled edge.

NEW ITEM

D. 722 STATE ST C-2/P-R Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-037
Application Number: MST2006-00491
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Marck Aguilar
Architect: Campbell & Campbell

(This site is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: Location of Parma Company Groceries Building. Proposal to chamfer both sides of the top edge of the Storke Placita sandstone wall bordering the State Street sidewalk.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

E. 630 GARDEN ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-015
Application Number: MST2006-00489
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Mike Grimes, Facilities Mgr.
Applicant: Sean Thomas, Facilities Maintenance Supervisor
Business Name: Community Development Building

(Proposal to replace the existing deteriorated colored built-up roofing with state required Title 24 compliant white, 80 ml. Garland Cool Roof System.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:24 P.M. ****