



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, June 14, 2006**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

- PHILIP SUDING, Chair – Present at 1:40 p.m.
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair – Absent
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present , left 5:47 p.m. to 5:51 p.m.
- STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:36 p.m., left 4:36 p.m. to 4:38 p.m. 4:46 p.m. to 4:50 p.m., left 5:47 p.m. to 5:50 p.m.
- VADIM HSU – Present at 1:48 p.m., left 3:58 p.m. to 4:10 p.m.
- ALEX PUJO – Present, left at 5:22 p.m.
- CAREN RAGER – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
- DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
- ROGER HORTON – Absent
- WILLIAM MAHAN – Absent

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

**STAFF:**

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present, left at 5:54 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

*Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)*

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<p><u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &amp; neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing &amp; proposed structures, building &amp; area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading &amp; retaining walls, &amp; existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing &amp; proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete &amp; thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial &amp; multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees &amp; shrubs &amp; plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" &amp; detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings &amp; must be complete &amp; accurate.</p>
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting &amp; irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, &amp; plumbing where applicable.</p>

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on June 9, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

**GENERAL BUSINESS (1:37):**

## A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Mr. Kellam De Forest stated that Brinkerhoff residents are very concerned about the new proposed modern light fixtures described in a water bill insert and they would like something more historic in nature to be installed in their neighborhood.

Mr. Hausz responded that at today's Streetlights Subcommittee meeting a letter was presented from one of the Brinkerhoff residents, one of eleven responses to the water bill insert, and although there are no plans in the immediate future to install new light fixtures in the Brinkerhoff neighborhood, at some point it would be appropriate for Brinkerhoff neighbors to discuss this issue with the Historic Landmarks Commission.

## B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 31, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 31, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Rager, 6/1/0. Hausz abstained.

## C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Alex Pujo.

Action: Hausz/Rager, 7/0/0.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz announced the following changes to the agenda:

- a) Mr. LaVoie will be absent from today's and the next meeting on June 28.
- b) Mr. Hsu will be reviewing the Consent Calendar on June 28.
- c) Mr. Suding will be stepping down from Item 10, 316-324 State Street.
- d) Ms. Rager will be stepping down from Item 4, 2300 Garden Street; Items 11 and 12, 1210 State Street.
- e) The project at 2121 Garden Street, which was continued to today's hearing, has been postponed to the June 28<sup>th</sup> meeting at the applicant's request.
- f) The project at 803 Laguna Street, which was postponed to today's hearing from May 17<sup>th</sup>, has been postponed once again to the June 28<sup>th</sup> meeting while the arborist's report is being prepared.
- g) The project at 1214 State Street originally on the Consent Calendar has been referred to Full Board and will be the first project reviewed.

2. Ms. Rager announced she will be stepping down from Consent Item A that was referred to the Full Board.
3. Mr. Pujo announced he will be leaving today's meeting around 5:00 p.m. and will not be attending the next HLC meeting on June 28<sup>th</sup>.
4. Ms. Naylor announced she will be stepping down from Item 4, 2300 Garden Street.
5. Ms. Murray announced she will be stepping down from Item 8, 420 East Anapamu Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Ms. Boucher requested a status on the list of proposed landmarks. Mr. Jacobus responded that this is one of the projects on his task list to be worked on.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

**REFERRED FROM CONSENT CALENDAR**

A. 1214 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(1:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
 Application Number: MST2004-00005  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts  
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore  
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

**(Review After Final of revised entry doors.)**

Present: Steve Metsch, Architect

Motion: Final approval of the bronze doors with the condition that a clear coat not be applied to them.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 7/0/0. Rager stepped down.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 100 W ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-0RW  
Application Number: MST2005-00619  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Heather Diez  
Architect: Conceptual Motion

(Proposal to install pedestrian lighting, repair sidewalk, and enhance intersections such as curb extensions and crosswalks, and new landscaping.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Bryon Bass, Strata Science.)**

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with the recommendation that monitoring of earth moving by an archaeologist within a distance of 50 feet of the location is required.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.  
Action: Hausz/Boucher, 8/0/0.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

2. 824 E CANON PERDIDO C-2 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-007  
Application Number: MST2005-00504  
Owner: Canon Perdido Cottages  
Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal for a new two-story, four-unit condominium project comprised of three attached one-bedroom units (863 square feet each) with 774 square feet of garage space and one detached two-bedroom unit (1,328 square feet) with an attached 462 square foot two-car garage. A total of 3,917 square feet of habitable space is proposed on the 8,053 square foot vacant lot. Modifications are required to allow encroachments into the required front and rear yard setbacks and to provide fewer parking spaces than required.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)**

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions regarding the lack of potential for significant archaeological resources to be present.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.  
Action: Hausz/Boucher, 8/0/0.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

3. 822 E CANON PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-006  
 Application Number: MST2005-00506  
 Owner: CCCP, LLC  
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to demolish the two existing residential units totaling 2,073 square feet and construct four new two-story, three-bedroom condominium units totaling 6,692 square feet on an 11,210 square foot lot. The proposal includes three attached 1,605 square foot units with a 491 square foot two-car garage each and one detached 1,453 square foot unit with a 460 square foot two-car garage. One modification is requested to allow the required private outdoor space for one unit to encroach into the front yard setback and a second modification is requested to allow the garage of the detached unit to encroach into the required interior yard setback.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)**

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions regarding the lack of potential for significant archaeological resources to be present.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 8/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

4. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(1:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
 Application Number: MST2006-00311  
 Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC  
 Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates  
 Architect: Machin & Mead  
 Contractor: Plant Construction

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed upgrade of site utilities including electrical, gas, and plumbing comprised of trench work on existing roadways and in front of the main building, new transformer on concrete pad, new switchgear, and four new fire hydrants. Accessibility improvements will be in conformance with current California Building Code to be implemented in phases related to building upgrades under separate permits. Some parking spaces are proposed to be either slightly shifted or relocated to accommodate accessibility route.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

Present: Mary Rose, Ownership Representative  
 Chad Robert, Landscape Architect  
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:23.

Mr. Kellam De Forest asked how much lighting is necessary since there is not much activity at the school at night or on weekends and if the athletic fields will be lit.

Public comment ended at 2:24.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission supports the utility plan. 2) The Commission is very concerned about the accessible path and lighting and its cumulative impact on the site. 3) Keep lighting minimal, low level, and minimal in quantity. 4) The path should not necessarily mimic other paving patterns on site; consider alternative paving materials to make the path as diminutive as possible and the Commission emphasizes its importance in the design. 5) Continue to study the geometry of the path.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 6/0/0. Rager/Naylor stepped down.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

5. 226 E ANAPAMU ST R-O Zone

(2:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-006  
 Application Number: MST2006-00286  
 Owner: Tomas Castelo  
 Architect: Elisa Garcia

(Proposal to demolish two existing single-family residences totaling 4,290 square feet and construct a six unit condominium development on two separate lots at 226 & 228 E. Anapamu Street (APNs 029-162-006 & 029-162-007). The new three-story residential buildings will total 21,161 square feet. The first new building will be comprised of three, three-bedroom condominium units and the second new building will be comprised of three, two-bedroom condominium units, all located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The ground level of each building will be comprised of three two-car garages totaling 12 covered parking spaces. Two uncovered parking spaces are also proposed, for a total of 14 off-street parking spaces. Staff Hearing Officer's approval will be required for a modification to provide less than the required amount of open yard area.)

### **(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)**

Present: Gil García, Architect, JG Architects  
 Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio  
 Tomas Castelo, Ownership Representative

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has requested a Historic Structures Report because the Colonial Revival house is one of three almost identical houses on the street, one of which was designated as a Structure of Merit.

Staff Comment: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, stated that Staff is preparing a Preliminary Application Review Team (PRT) letter indicating to the applicant that Staff has concerns with respect to size, bulk, and scale and the number of modifications required for the project. Staff requested comments from the Commission in regard to the project's size, bulk, and scale, modifications required, and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment opened at 2:41.

Mr. Suding read into the record a letter received from Steve Hoegerman, neighbor, expressing opposition to this project.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern that Anapamu will be turned in to a “tunnel” of three-story buildings and commented that this project would not help the ambiance of the City.

Public comment closed at 2:44.

The Commission made the following comments and/or suggestions: 1) The project’s program is very ambitious, particularly with respect to the mass, bulk, and scale. 2) The building and its massing is out of character with the neighborhood. 3) The roof deck elevator is problematic and the roof deck may not be necessary. 4) Access to the rear buildings, particularly Building B, is problematic. 5) Open space needs to be maximized and more contiguous. 6) One Commissioner suggested looking at a previously reviewed project on East Victoria Street. 7) The Commission is looking forward to reviewing the Historic Structures Report. 8) Study an alternative parking design. 9) The Commission does not support the front yard modification or any of the lot area modifications to increase density. 10) The Commission is concerned with the zoning versus preservation requirements and conflicts.

## **IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

6. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone  
 (3:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: Project Solutions LLC  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(In-Progress review of exterior stairway revision and construction detail development for Group E and continued In-Progress review of exterior development of new cottages for Group K.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian  
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect  
 James Jones, Ownership Representative

Public comment opened at 3:33.

Mr. Kellam De Forest asked what happened to the Maxfield Parrish vases and the straight access path that went from the pool up to the pergola that is now shown as a curved path in the proposal.

Public comment closed at 3:34.

Group K

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Planting should be used for screening as opposed to walls and fences, particularly at the craftsman style cottages. 2) At least two Commissioners felt that the masonry building should use landscape as screening as opposed to the walls. 3) Proposed changes are not consistent with the preliminary approved plans. 4) The charm has been lost; size and quantity of windows have been changed. 5) Comparisons to previously reviewed designs need to be made if incremental changes are proposed. 6) Restudy: a) Building 28, the east elevation lower doors and windows. b) Building 28, north elevation building pattern. c) Building 29, west elevation in its entirety, especially the stair guardrail design. d) Building 29, the north elevation window patterns.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 8/0/0.

Group E

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The proposed pool does not have the charm and folly of the previous pool proposal. 2) An axial connection to the northern campus pergola is essential. 3) At least two Commissioners felt that the infinity edge and the railings are not acceptable as proposed.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 8/0/0.

**FINAL REVIEW**

7. 715 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone

(3:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-007  
 Application Number: MST2006-00279  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Historical Society  
 Architect: John Pitman  
 Contractor: Frank Schipper

(Proposal for a new parking lot, electrical enclosure, and landscaping to be installed after completion of separately permitted site remediation on two of three sites for the Santa Barbara Historical Museum (APNs 031-081-005 & 031-081-007) located at 715 Santa Barbara Street and 118 East De La Guerra Street. The third site at 136 E. De La Guerra is within the County's jurisdiction.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS)**

Present: John Pitman, Architect and Historical Museum's Representative  
 Amelia Coffey, URS Corporation, Southern California Edison  
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Staff Comment: Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst, stated that Staff reviewed the parking lot proposal and found that it would not result in significant effects. Based on analysis of the project under the City Master Environmental Assessment, along with prior CEQA reviews of the property by the State for the Southern California Edison remediation project and by the County for the prior museum expansion project, it is concluded that the current project will not result in significant archaeological or historical effects. Staff recommends that the Commission make Historic Resource Findings as part of its motion.

Public comment started at 3:56.

Mr. Kellam De Forest asked who has purview over the courtyard plants. Ms. Shelton responded that the County Planning and Development and the County Architect can be contacted regarding this issue.

Public comment closed 3:58.

Motion: Final approval of the proposal with the comment that the Commission deeply regrets the moving of the fountain and the loss of the trees in the central courtyard. Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 7/0/0.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

8. 420 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone

(4:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-005  
Application Number: MST2005-00442  
Owner: Glennon Mueller  
Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(The existing residence is Landmark-worthy. Proposal to construct two new condominium units adjacent to an existing single-family residence for a total of three two-story condominium units. An existing one-car garage is proposed to be demolished and replaced with three new two-car garages. A total of 3,770 square feet of living space and 1,377 square feet of garage space is proposed for the 9,044 square foot lot. Staff Hearing Officer approval is required for a modification for relief from the minimum dimensions for private outdoor living space, a tentative subdivision map, and the condominium development.)

**(Third Concept Review.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION FOR RELIEF FROM THE MINIMUM DIMENSIONS FOR PRIVATE OUTDOOR LIVING SPACE, A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, AND THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)**

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Lenvik & Minor Architects

Public comment opened at 4:15.

Ms. Laura Wilson, neighbor, expressed support for the project and commented that the plan is beginning to look too flat and simple and requested that previously proposed details be included again.

Public comment closed at 4:18.

Straw vote: How many of the Commissioners feel that the detailing of the porches as proposed is acceptable? 3/4. Naylor/Suding/Hausz/Pujo opposed.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission feels that the simplified east elevation is best; the one with the single dormer. 2) Previous west elevation is preferred; the one without the flat roof and with the pop-out. 3) Restudy the second floor porch sliding door proportions. 4) The Commission forwards the project to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments with respect to mass, bulk, and scale. 5) The Commission will resolve details at subsequent meetings.
- Action: Boucher/Hsu, 6/0/0. Murray stepped down.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

9. 518 STATE ST C-M Zone  
 (4:38) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046  
 Application Number: MST2005-00477  
 Owner: Charles & Georgetta Craviotto Trust  
 Owner: Jim Craviotto  
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(This is a revised project. Proposal to construct a new two-story mixed-use building with 2,438 square feet of commercial space on the first floor and two apartments on the second floor. The project will require Development Plan approval for 1,691 square feet of additional non-residential space and a modification to allow no onsite residential parking.)

#### **(Second Concept Review.)**

#### **(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION AND A DEVELOPMENT PLAN.)**

- Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis  
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio  
 Jeff Hornbuckle, Designer, Cearnal Andrulaitis
- Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission supports the project. 2) Restudy the s-curve of the stair guardrail/railing. 3) Restudy the cantilever porch making the corbels more substantial. 4) Study the termination and the return of the railing of the stair and porch. 5) The Commission would like to review all fenestration details. 6) The Commission supports the modification as proposed and sends positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer.
- Action: Hsu/Boucher, 8/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

10. 316-324 STATE ST C-M Zone

(4:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020  
Application Number: MST2005-00286  
Owner: 318 State Street Properties, LLC  
Applicant: Peter Lewis  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom, a.k.a. Andalucia Building." Proposal for a four story mixed-use development to include demolition of the existing 35,841 square-foot warehouse, construction of 23,091 square feet of nonresidential use, and 29 new residential condominium units totaling 42,507 square feet. The front arcade and 4,523 square feet of commercial space along State Street would be preserved. Also proposed is a 37,839 square foot, 97-space basement parking garage and 14,372 cubic yards of excavation. Planning Commission approval is required for the Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification for encroaching into the setback, and the Condominium Development.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR THE TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND A MODIFICATION FOR ENCROACHING INTO THE SETBACK.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Jeff Hornbuckle, Designer  
Peter Lewis, Applicant

Staff Comment: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, stated that the project has been revised to address some of the comments made by the Planning Commission (PC) at its March 9, 2006, meeting. She also announced that two members of the PC were in attendance to provide additional feedback to the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) regarding the PC's conceptual review of the project and the direction given to the applicant relative to the project's massing and protection of views.

Ms. Unzueta reported that the project has been reduced approximately two feet in height and 1,950 square feet have been pulled out of the commercial space to accommodate additional residential units that were originally part of the fourth floor. Staff has expressed concern to the applicant because, although a view corridor has been provided on the fourth floor, the massing of the building appears to be unchanged and views continue to be obstructed. Staff requested comments from the HLC with respect to the massing of the proposed building and specifically the fourth floor.

Public comment opened at 5:14.

Mr. Kellam De Forest, resident, asked if a Historic Structures Report has been provided and expressed concern that a three or four-story building would "bury" the significant buildings surrounding the site. Mr. Hsu responded that a Historic Structures Report has been approved by the Commission.

Harwood White, Planning Commissioner, highlighted the obvious importance of this structure as it stands in its place on State Street and in the city. Mr. White stated that the Planning Commission agreed that the fourth floor, if there is to be one, should not be obviously visible. He expressed appreciation for the nature of the use, the undergrounding of the parking, and the architecture. It was emphasized that it is the big units in the plan that become contributors to the amenities and take a large amount of volume.

Stella Larson, Planning Commission member, stated that there was a consensus by the Planning Commission about the request for a reduction or removal of a fourth-floor element, view preservation, and the restudy of the south elevation.

Public comment closed at 5:19.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) One Commissioner was opposed to a fourth floor. 2) The remaining Commissioners are generally supportive of a modulated and reduced fourth floor so long as it provides the modulation and relief from a "long, straight line" that a three-story solution would present. 3) There was a specific comment that Unit 23 is large and problematic; to restudy it might help the modulation of the fourth floor. 4) The Commission finds the project to be attractive, especially with the fourth floor reduction as presented. 5) Some Commissioners continue to support the Planning Commission's request to reduce the size, bulk, and scale; specifically through studying the modulation of the fourth floor and by the restudy and reduction of the plate heights. 6) One Commission felt that the northwest side of the building should have some/similar reduction. 7) There is a consensus that the plate height should continue to be restudied and reduced where possible. 8) Perhaps there is a design opportunity to extrapolate components of the front portion of the building to mitigate the bigger masses; specifically the proportion, scale, and materials. 9) It should be clarified that the building is historically referred to as the Alhambra Building. 10) Consider reintroducing hips on the south elevation as a modulating feature. 11) The Commission will expect to see mechanical equipment shown on the roof plan at the next review.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 6/0/0. Suding stepped down.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

11. 1210 STATE ST C-2 Zone  
 (5:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
 Application Number: MST2005-00323  
 Owner: Granada Tower LLC  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs access, adding rooftop dormers and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation of the Granada Tower. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

**(Continued review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This Addendum addresses rooftop improvements.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Rob Rossi, Owner  
Alexandra Cole, Historian  
Diana Kelly, Project Manager

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the project has been revised so that there are no projections above the roof on the building.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.  
Action: Naylor/Murray, 4/0/0. Rager stepped down.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

12. 1210 STATE ST C-2 Zone  
(5:49) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
Application Number: MST2005-00323  
Owner: Granada Tower LLC  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs access, adding rooftop dormers and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation of the Granada Tower. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

#### **(Fourth Concept Review.)**

#### **(COMMENTS ONLY: PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND MODIFICATIONS.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Rob Rossi, Owner  
Diana Kelly, Project Manager  
Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer.  
Action: Hsu/Boucher, 6/0/0. Rager stepped down.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

13. 1314 MORRISON AVE R-2 Zone

(5:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-020  
Application Number: MST2006-00222  
Owner: Gail Andrews Trust 4/13/04  
Applicant: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 460 square foot first and second story addition to an existing 847 square foot single-family residence with an existing detached 134 square foot accessory building and an attached one-car carport, all on a 4,500 square foot lot. The structure is located in the proposed Bungalow Haven Historic District.)

**(Continued review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan.)**

Present: Shelly Bookspan, Historian  
Edwin Lenvik, Architect

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the author of the Historic Structures Report has added more text regarding the setting of the building and has provided more photographs showing the building and its setting.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.  
Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

14. 1314 MORRISON AVE R-2 Zone

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-020  
Application Number: MST2006-00222  
Owner: Gail Andrews Trust 4/13/04  
Applicant: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 460 square foot first and second story addition to an existing 847 square foot single-family residence with an existing detached 134 square foot accessory building and an attached one-car carport, all on a 4,500 square foot lot. The structure is located in the proposed Bungalow Haven Historic District.)

**(Preliminary Approval will be contingent upon acceptance of the Historic Structures/Sites Report reviewed earlier on today's agenda.)**

Present: Shelly Bookspan, Historian  
Edwin Lenvik, Architect

Motion: Preliminary approval.  
Action: Hsu/Hausz, 7/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

15. 819 GARDEN ST C-2 Zone

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-011  
Application Number: MST2005-00439  
Owner: Steven & Julie E. Shulem Revocable Trust  
Applicant: Karl Kras  
Architect: DesignARC

(Proposal to demolish an existing 780 square foot office and construct a new four-story, 3,472 square foot mixed-use building on a 1,881 square foot lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. This development will be comprised of one 1,972 square foot two-bedroom unit, and 1,500 net square feet of office space. Four parking spaces will be provided: two on-site in a parking garage, and two on a separate parcel within 500 feet. A Zoning Modification is requested to provide less than the required 10% open space area.)

**(Fourth Concept Review.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY: PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION TO PROVIDE LESS THAN THE REQUIRED 10% OPEN SPACE AREA.)**

Present: Mark Shields, Architect, DesignARC  
Steven Shulem, Owner

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission forwards the project with positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer. 2) The massing above the Moorish arch on the third floor should be greater; perhaps an alternate window shape. 3) Study the detail of the second floor windows under the *mirador*. 4) The Commission supports the inclusion of more decorative tile work.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 7/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

16. 1329 GARDEN ST R-3 Zone

(6:11) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-072-005  
Application Number: MST2006-00270  
Owner: Michael Hartmann  
Architect: Joe Steuer

(Proposed residential alterations including the demolition of 14 square feet of existing first floor utility space, the remodel of a portion of an existing 695 square foot two story residence, and the conversion of 302 square feet of existing one-story utility space to residential space on a 6,654 square foot parcel located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Two covered parking spaces will remain.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect

Motion: Preliminary approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) The current proposal is better than previously presented; applicant is heading in the right direction. 2) Applicant shall simplify the siding detailing and fenestration on the gable end of the east elevation.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 7/0/0.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

A. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
 Application Number: MST2004-00005  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts  
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore  
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

**(Review After Final of revised entry doors.)**

Continued to Full Board.

### **FINAL REVIEW**

B. 101 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-071-013  
 Application Number: MST2006-00281  
 Owner: 101 East Victoria  
 Applicant: Eric Schott

(Concept Review for a proposal to construct exterior alterations to an existing commercial building and parking lot including planters, trellis, and front facade alterations. No new floor area.)

**(Final approval of details is requested.)**

Continued two weeks for further detailing.

**NEW ITEM**C. 317 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-221-018  
Application Number: MST2006-00317  
Owner: Vista De Carrillo LTD  
Agent: Camp Design

(Proposal to replace wood windows and repaint exterior of a three-story commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Final approval as submitted with the condition that new wood windows exactly match existing wood windows in size and configuration.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 501 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-011  
Application Number: MST2006-00149  
Owner: 501 State Street, Inc.  
Architect: Rex Ruskauff  
Business Name: Santa Barbara Brewing Company

(Proposal to add a wrought iron fence and canvas awning at the north elevation to enclose an outdoor drinking area between buildings as required by Alcohol Beverage Control.)

**(Review After Final of revisions to wrought iron details.)**

Final approval of Review After Final with the conditions that wrought iron be painted black green and the non-permitted "Brewery" sign on the side of the building be painted over so as to be removed.

**NEW ITEM**E. 21 W ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-004  
Application Number: MST2006-00335  
Owner: David Karpeles  
Applicant: David Shelton  
Architect: David Shelton  
Business Name: Karpeles Manuscript Library

(Proposal to install accessible exterior handrails at front entry stair and landing at the Karpeles Manuscript Library located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Final approval as submitted.

**NEW ITEM**

F. 716 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-020  
Application Number: MST2006-00343  
Owner: 710 State St Partners  
Applicant: Doug Keep  
Business Name: Proposed Mac Retail Store

(Proposal to replace the entry doors to comply with ADA requirements, remove and replace the existing entry facade base tile, replace lower storefront glass with new laminate glass, and paint all exposed wood (except corbels) leaving the existing plaster the same color.)

Preliminary approval and indefinite continuance for details.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

G. 800 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-010  
Application Number: MST2004-00472  
Owner: Westen Family Group  
Architect: B 3 Architects  
Business Name: Starbucks Coffee Company

(Proposal to remodel the exterior facade of the building, to construct a trash enclosure area and to rehabilitate the building's exterior. Work to include new plaster, replacement of windows like for like except for four windows which will be enlarged, replacement of doors, awnings, and add new wrought iron details. Additionally, the applicant proposes to replace roof tiles and extend the roof area of the building.)

**(Review After Final of revised trash enclosure.)**

Final approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**NEW ITEM**

H. 831 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004  
Application Number: MST2006-00348  
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties LTD  
Applicant: Laurie Zalk  
Business Name: Our Daily Bread

(Proposal for outdoor dining furniture to include five tables and 14 chairs at Our Daily Bread.)

Denied with finding that plastic is an unacceptable material in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

**NEW ITEM****I. 28 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-031  
Application Number: MST2006-00314  
Owner: People's Self-Help Housing Corporation  
Applicant: People's Self-Help Housing

(This is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: Victoria Hotel and Shops. Proposed private bicycle storage enclosure for tenants of the Victoria Hotel located at 24 E. Victoria Street.)

Continued two weeks to June 28, 2006, with comments.

**NEW ITEM****J. 415 E SOLA ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-022-021  
Application Number: MST2006-00353  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Tom Doolittle  
Business Name: Fire Station 3

(This is a Structure of Merit: Fire Station No. 3. Proposal to install a digital microwave network connectivity to La Cumbre Peak to support Fire Department in-station training capability. One 14" x 14" flat panel antenna will be mounted on the north side of the hose tower.)

Final approval as submitted with the condition that unit be painted to match exterior building wall.

**NEW ITEM****K. 630 GARDEN ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-015  
Application Number: MST2006-00354  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Tom Doolittle  
Business Name: Community Development Department

(Proposal to install a digital microwave network connectivity to La Cumbre Peak to support Fire Department in-station training capability. One 14" x 14" flat panel antenna will be mounted inside a parapet wall on the north side of the roof.)

Final approval as submitted.

**NEW ITEM**

L. 1400 DOVER RD

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-010

Application Number: MST2006-00333

Owner: Eisberg Family Trust 4/22/03

Contractor: Action Roofing

(Proposal to tear off existing built-up roof with white rock and one layer of 1/2" sound board and install new IB PVC roof system underlayment for Class A fire rating. A white "cool roof" system is proposed for energy conservation.)

Final approval as submitted.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:18 P.M. \*\***