



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 11, 2005

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- ANTHONY SPANN, Chair, Present, left at 4:30 p.m., returned at 6:15 p.m.
 VADIM HSU, Vice-Chair, Present
 STEVE HAUSZ, Present, left at 5:25 p.m., returned at 5:34 p.m.
 WILLIAM LA VOIE, Present
 ALEX PUJO, Present, left at 5:15 p.m.
 CAREN RAGER, Present, left at 2:07 p.m., returned at 2:08 p.m., left at 2:34 p.m., returned at 3:22 p.m.
 PHILIP SUDING, Present, left at 2:54 p.m., returned at 2:57 p.m., left at 3:36 p.m., returned at 3:44 p.m., left at 4:30 p.m., returned at 5:22 p.m.,
 FERMINA MURRAY, Present, left at 6:15 p.m., returned at 6:33 p.m.
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present
 DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent
 ROGER HORTON, Present at 2:55 p.m., left at 2:57 p.m.
 WILLIAM MAHAN, Present at 2:59 p.m., left at 4:30 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

- STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present.
 BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the <u>time of submittal & each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on May 6, 2005 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 27, 2005.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 27, 2005, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Pujo, 9/0/0.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Spann.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 9/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a) Item No. 14, 306 W. Cabrillo, has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Motion: Postpone Item No. 14, 306 W. Cabrillo, indefinitely.

Action: Rager/Suding, 9/0/0.

- b) Item No. 1, 1900 Block of Las Canoas, is an Archaeology Report and not an Historic Structures Report, as shown on today's agenda.

- c) Commissioner Rager will step down from Item No. 2, Item No. 5, and Item No. 6, 2300 Garden Street.

- d) A survey regarding green building incentives has been distributed on behalf of Heather Baker, Project Planner. Ms. Gantz requested the Commission complete the questionnaire before the end of the meeting and also invited any members of the public to partake in the survey if they are interested.

2. Chair Spann announced he will step down from Item No. 10, 901 E. Cabrillo Boulevard.

3. Commissioner Suding announced he will step down from Item No. 10, 901 E. Cabrillo Boulevard.

4. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, announced that a docent training was held for the Pearl Chase Society Historic Homes Tour. The Pearl Chase Homes Tour will be held on Sunday, May 22, 2005 between the hours of 11:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. and advance tickets (required) may be purchased by calling 961-3938 or by visiting the following website: www.pearlchasesociety.org. Mr. Jacobus related that the funds raised by the event will be used for preservation services within the City of Santa Barbara. Commissioner La Voie added that this will be an impressive tour which will include exploring three homes designed by George Washington Smith, one of which is the Immaculate Heart House which should not be missed.

5. Commissioner Hsu related his concern regarding a letter which was received from the applicant for the project located at 922 Garden Street. Mr. Hsu clarified the reason he rejected the color scheme was that the color proposed was a very bright yellow. A more subdued color was suggested, that was in the same color scheme, and which would have matched the color on a structure at the rear of the property. He encouraged the applicant to resubmit a proposal so that a color acceptable to everyone can be agreed upon.

6. Commissioner Pujo announced he will be leaving the meeting at approximately 5:15 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Hausz reported that he attended the Plaza De la Guerra Subcommittee meeting, where discussion ensued regarding parking and street design. Mr. Hausz explained that the subcommittee is currently in the decision making process regarding the choice of a designer.
2. Commissioner Suding reported that he attended the quasi-joint meeting of the Park and Recreation Commission/Historic Landmarks Commission Subcommittee of the Cabrillo Boulevard Sidewalk Replacement project. The Park and Recreation Commission and a great number of the public were very strong proponents of paving the parkway area between the sidewalk and the curb. Mr. Suding related that he was adamant regarding the Historic Landmark's Commission position that it should remain a planting area. No determination was made at the end of the meeting and Staff will be exploring alternatives, which will be presented at the next meeting.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **1900 BLOCK LAS CANOAS** A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-030-033
 Application Number: MST2005-00285
 Owner: Romana and Bernardi Graziano
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to construct a City water main in the roadway. The water main will be eight-inch HDPE pipe buried beneath asphalt road for assessor parcel numbers 021-010-019, 021-030-031, 021-010-043, 021-030-033, 021-030-020, 021-010-044 and 021-010-042.)

(Review of Archaeological Resources Report prepared by the Environmental Company.)

(2:06)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Hsu, 9/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. **2300 GARDEN ST** E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: John Poucher, Esq.
 Agent: Steve Yates
 Architect: The Conceptual Motion Company
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the Waldorf building, Infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

(2:07)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and recommends that the trenches in the area of the scatter of shellfish remains be dug with a backhoe rather than with a trenching machine. Also, he agrees with the report's recommendation that the backhoe trenching be monitored by an archaeologist and a Chumash observer. Additionally, the backhoe work should be done in depth increments of approximately 20 centimeters, so that if something is discovered, it would not be badly damaged.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with Dr. Glassow's recommendations.
 Action: La Voie/Naylor, 9/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. **533 W GUTIERREZ ST** R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-003
 Application Number: MST2004-00264
 Owner: Gonzalez Family Trust
 Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to demolish two, one-story single-family residences. The proposal includes the construction of two new buildings with five, two- and three-story apartments. The project will result in two, one-bedroom apartments, two, two-bedroom apartments, and one, three-bedroom apartment. The five apartments will total 8,802 square feet on an 11,418 square foot lot. The proposal also includes the construction of three, two-car garages, two, one-car garages, and one uncovered parking space.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D.)

(2:08)

Jose Esparza, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and finds that it meets the minimum standards set forth in the City of Santa Barbara's Master Environmental Assessment. In answer to a question from the Commission, Mr. Jacobus stated that the Commission was only reviewing the Historic Structures Report at this time, and that approving the report is not an approval of the proposed project. He further noted that the Commission has two courses of action. They could approve the report (as is) and forward a recommendation to the Architectural Board of Review that the building be offered for relocation as a condition of approval. Or, the Historic Landmark's Commission could require that the "Advisory Recommendation" to offer the house for relocation become a required Mitigation Measure as a condition of acceptance of the report.

Motion: The Commission approves the report as submitted.
 Action: Pujo/Naylor.

Motion withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Change the advisory recommendation on page 8 to a required recommendation and add a time frame of 60 days to the language. 2) The required mitigations clearly list a style sympathetic to and compatible with the existing style of the house. 3) Add an advisory recommendation that the existing structure be incorporated into the proposed design. 4) The mass, bulk, and scale of the first 10 or 15 feet of the house should be more in keeping with the original structure.
 Action: La Voie/Pujo, 9/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
 Application Number: MST2005-00123
 Architect: Laura Hanson
 Owner: Monte and Patricia Fligsten

(This is on the Potential Historic Resource List (Hall Cottage/Park Residence). Proposed first and second story addition of 1,551 square feet to an existing two story, 2,946 square foot residence. The project also includes a new 512 square foot second story deck, demolition of the existing 759 square foot garage, and construction of a new 750 square foot, three-car garage with a 459 square foot, second floor accessory space, all on a 25,425 square foot lot.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

(2:25)

Monte and Patricia Fligsten, Owners; Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus stated that Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations in the report. Mr. Jacobus also stated that the addition will be reviewed later in the day during the concept review of the project.

Commissioner La Voie stated that only licensed architects in the State of California may produce architecture or be an architectural designer, therefore, wording should be struck on page 1, second paragraph, and also in the title boxes of the drawings, that states "architectural designer."

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
 Action: Murray/Rager.

Motion withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the comment that there is disagreement with the conclusions that the addition is compatible with the existing architecture.
 Action: La Voie/Naylor, 9/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**5. 2300 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: John Poucher, Esq.
 Agent: Steve Yates
 Architect: The Conceptual Motion Company
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the Waldorf building, Infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Preservation Planning Associates.)

(2:34)

Alexandra Cole, Preparer; Steve Yates, Agent, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated the letter report has been prepared in response to some of the questions which the Commission posed at the last meeting regarding the initial phase of the project. A full Historic Structures Report will follow. Staff has read the report and believes that it does address the issues that the Commission discussed last time.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following comments: 1) One Commissioner disagreed with the findings on page 3, paragraph 4 in that glass doors do not "disappear" nor are they "invisible." The Commission suggested that the applicant meet with Brian Cearnal, Architect, for direction. 2) The Infirmary arcade exit doors should be restudied to be more of an arched design. 3) The Commission does not agree that the seismic work will not be visible from the exterior.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/1/1. Rager stepped down. Naylor opposed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

6. **2300 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: John Poucher, Esq.
 Agent: Steve Yates
 Architect: The Conceptual Motion Company
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the Waldorf building, Infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(2:41)

Alexandra Cole, preparer; and Steve Yates, Agent, present.

Motion: Final approval and a two-week continuance with the following comments and conditions: 1) The design of the arcade glass door (details 2 and 3 on sheet A2.03) is to return to the Historic Landmarks Commission. 2) Detail 5, sheet A6.01: The plaster is to continue below the weep screed. 3) Eliminate the gutter on the roof equipment well and paint the plaster ducts, and the roof equipment to match the roof material. 4) Match the built-up roofing in the roof well with the terra cotta roof tile. 5) Approval is subject to the Conditions of Approval Staff Memorandum dated May 11, 2005 which are a part of the environmental determination.

Action: Pujo/La Voie, 8/0/1. Rager stepped down.

The applicant stated that landscaping and lighting shall be submitted in the next phase of the project in February, 2006.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
 Application Number: MST2005-00123
 Architect: Laura Hanson
 Owner: Monte and Patricia Fligsten

(This is on the Potential Historic Resource List (Hall Cottage/Park Residence). Proposed first and second story addition of 1,551 square feet to an existing two story, 2,946 square foot residence. The project also includes a new 512 square foot second story deck, demolition of the existing 759 square foot garage, and construction of a new 750 square foot, three-car garage with a 459 square foot, second floor accessory space, all on a 25,425 square foot lot.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(3:22)

Monte and Patricia Fligsten, Owners; Lauren Hanson, Designer; and Molly Murphy, Associate, present.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments: 1) The mass and bulk is incompatible with the style of architecture. 2) The applicant is to study the Stick and American Gothic style of architecture for building compatibility; and mass of the garage should be appropriate for an addition to this structure which is more compatible with the style of architecture, recognizing the Secretary of Interior's Standards for differentiation of the addition from the existing structure.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 117 W DE LA GUERRA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-003
 Application Number: MST2005-00126
 Owner: John Dewilde
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects
 Designer: Ariane Risto

(Proposal to construct a mixed-use building composed of the following: commercial space of 2,000 square feet; nine residential condominium units to be located above the "podium" level garage. A portion of the existing facade at 115 W. De la Guerra Street will be preserved due to its historical importance. An historic structures report was previously reviewed and accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL.)

(3:44)

Detlev Peikert, Architect; John Dewilde, Owner; and Ariane Risto, Designer, present.

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m.

Bill Mahan, Planning Commission (PC), stated that the PC has been attempting to have parking below grade or partially below grade to lower the buildings for downtown developments and also that the PC likes to see a very strong pedestrian connection to the street.

Public comment closed at 3:56 p.m.

Staff Comment: Renee Brooke, Project Planner, stated that Staff has not yet evaluated the project.

- Motion: Conceptual Approval and continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates the changes that the applicant has made. 2) The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable. 3) One Commissioner thought the large negative space on the east elevation is lacking penetration. 4) The Commission appreciates the site layout and landscaping. 5) The Commission incorporated the comments from the previous motion into this motion.
- Action: Murray/Hsu, 9/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. **101 GARDEN** HRC-2/SP-2/SD-3 Zone
- Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-018
 Application Number: MST2004-00134
 Owner: Wright Partners
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The proposal consists of demolition of all existing structures on the sites and construction of 115 residential condominiums and 12 apartment units on four lots, totaling 5.3 acres. The site at 101 Garden Street is within the boundaries of Specific Plan #2. The proposal consists of a range of unit types, mix and affordability levels. Please refer to lengthy project description letter.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL, TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, MODIFICATION, AND A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

(3:58)

Bill Wright, Owner; Detlev Peikert, Architect; Gordon Brewer, Architect; and Dave Davis, Consultant, present.

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.

Bill Mahan, Planning Commission (PC), complimented the applicants on their design and stated he will relate positive comments to the PC regarding the substantial improvements.

Public Comment closed at 4:37 p.m.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) The Commission commended the applicant on the modulation of the project; the enhancement of the pedestrian passages through the site; and the substantial landscaping that goes down to the ground. The Commission expects continuation of these positive project elements. 2) The Commission is pleased with the design that accommodates all required parking. 3) The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable. 4) The architecture is generally acceptable. 5) Some Commissioners felt it would be advantageous to provide a commercial component to the project. 6) Return with larger scaled plans.
- Action: La Voie/Pujo, 9/0/0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**10. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
 Application Number: MST2004-00052
 Architect: Marks Bloxom Architects, Inc.
 Owner: Richard Gunner
 Architect: Anthony Spann
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal to enlarge the main entry of the hotel. The project includes removal and relocation of two bedrooms and the third floor sun deck. The net increase of new floor area is 876 square feet; however there is a net decrease of 361 square feet of Measure E square footage. This project has been revised from the original submittal.)

(Preliminary Review is requested.)

(4:30)

Philip Suding, Landscape Architect; Michael and Richard Gunner, Owners; Bernard Austin, Associate; and Bill Harrison, Architect, present.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission thanks the applicant for trying to respond to the difficulty of making the architecture work; however, the project is not moving in the right direction at this time. 2) Both the building and the site need to be fundamentally restudied, starting from the rear elevation, which is the most unacceptable. 3) Simplify the building along the southeast and southwest street frontage. 4) Completely restudy the rear and parking elevations. 5) The railings and the length of the rail are problematic in terms of some of the architectural elements. 6) Restudy the arches and the columns. 7) Restudy the embellishments and how they are used on the building. 8) The Commission continues not to support the current use of glass at the pool and requests that it be restudied. 9) Restudy the use of decomposed granite in the right-of-way. 10) The Commission will not support an encroachment into the park. 11) Restudy the entry arch and both the driving entry and pedestrian entry. 12) The CAD drawings do not match the sketches, and the proportions represented in the CAD drawings should be restudied to the greatest extent possible.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 6/0/2. Suding and Spann stepped down.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**11. 340 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-027
 Application Number: MST2001-00831
 Owner: George & Lena Dumas Trust
 Architect: Timothy Boe
 Business Name: USA Gasoline
 Architect: Jeff Gorrell

(The proposed project involves the demolition of an existing 1,330 square foot gas station with three service bays, and construction of a 1,701 square foot gas station/mini-market (2,038 square feet gross) with a 1,728 square foot pump island canopy and six parking spaces at the corner of Carrillo and Castillo Streets.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 009-03.)

(5:22)

Timothy Boe, Architect; Jeff Gorrell, Architect; Carol Robinson, Landscape Architect; and Lance Crow, USA Petroleum, present.

Motion: Final Approval of the project and a four-week continuance to the Consent Calendar with the following comments and conditions: 1) Return with a profile of the turning to the spindles on the Moorish window. 2) Return with a lighting plan. 3) Identify plant material for the planter pots.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 7/0/1. Spann stepped down.

The Commission recessed from 5:42 p.m. to 6:13 p.m.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

12. **625 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-005
 Application Number: MST2004-00721
 Owner: Jaime Flores
 Applicant: Karl Eberhard
 Owner: Sid Carrera

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to add the following to Chad's Restaurant: a 291 square foot storage area, an 894 square foot bar area and a 113 square foot restroom to the existing 1,935 square foot restaurant and to abate the violations outlined in ENF2004-00484 and ENF2004-00529. The project also includes reconfiguring the parking and expanding the outdoor seating. Two parcels (037-123-005 & 037-123-017) would be merged as part of the project.)

(Review of the following proposed revisions: relocation of fireplace and simplified chimney cap; storefront entrance; parapet, handrail, and guardrail details; gas heater design; canvas awning and wood shutters; and details on Sheet A5.1.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND A VOLUNTARY LOT MERGER. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(6:15)

Andy Roteman, Architect, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Remove the proposed shutters and awnings from the north neighboring building. 2) Restudy the use of the chimney and fireplace and eliminate the firebox from the outside of the building. 3) Restudy traditional detailing of the corrugated metal roof (ridge detail) on building C.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 6/1/1. Naylor opposed. Murray stepped down.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. **1829 STATE ST**

C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-007
 Application Number: MST2004-00132
 Owner: Emmet Hawkes Family Trust
 Applicant: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a mixed-use development on two separate parcels (027-031-007 for 1829 State and 027-031-006 for 11 W. Pedregosa Street). The commercial portion of the project would be located on the first and second floors of the three-story building facing State Street consisting of 2,849 square feet of retail space and 1,772 square feet of office space, with two of the residential units on the second and third floors. The remaining residential units would be contained in a three-story building facing Pedregosa Street. The proposed residential unit mix includes three, three-bedroom units, three, two-bedroom units, one, one-bedroom unit, and one studio unit. The project includes 18 parking spaces, eight of which are open spaces to allow for shared use. In addition, an existing single-family residence on the Pedregosa St. parcel is proposed to be demolished. The project requires Planning Commission approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map, modifications for parking and open space, and a Development Plan.)

(COMMENTS ONLY, PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, MODIFICATIONS, AND ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(6:33)

Emmet Hawkes I and Emmet Hawkes II, Owners; and Tom Ochsner, Applicant, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus stated the project proposed is to remove a brick house; however, it is in poor condition and there are severe structural problems with the house. Staff has determined the house is not historically significant and will not require an Historic Structures Report prior to demolition.

Staff Comment: Trish Allen, Associate Planner, clarified that the interior yard encroachments will affect the first and second floor only and require a modification. The third floor is set back 10 feet; therefore, it meets the setback requirement on the interior yard. Ms. Allen also stated a parking modification is being requested, which would reduce the parking requirement. Staff does not have a parking demand analysis at this time, but is supportive of the shared parking concept.

Straw votes:

How many Commissioners can support the massing of the State Street/Pedregosa corner? 5/2.

How many Commissioners can support the modifications requested against the R-4 property? 0/7.

How many Commissioners can support remanipulating the parking to accommodate more ground level planting? 8/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Increase the landscaping and study reducing the parking count and the ratio of hardscape to landscape. 2) Reduce the massing on the east property line. 3) Respect the adjacent residential unit on Pedregosa Street. 4) Minimize cantilevers. 5) Some Commissioners felt the mass, bulk, and scale should be reduced. 6) Punctuate the podium level to bring landscaping to natural grade. 7) The massing should follow the natural grade more closely.

Action: Suding/Hsu, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

14. **306 W CABRILLO BLVD** HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-091-013
 Application Number: MST2005-00187
 Owner: Theodore Smyth
 Applicant: Bob Pester
 Architect: Bob Pester
 Business Name: West Beach Inn

(Proposal to replace an (e) 2,101 square foot concrete swimming pool deck with a (n) 2,902 square foot swimming pool deck; add a 27 square foot entry portico; switch (e) swimming pool equipment room with (e) office (191 square foot remodel); extend (n) swimming pool equipment room by 18 square foot; add one guest parking space and (n) glass and plaster swimming pool enclosure; add 4'-0" high plaster privacy walls at two guest suites.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, A COASTAL EXCLUSION, AND A MODIFICATION TO ENCROACH INTO THE FRONT YARD SETBACK.)

Postponed indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

15. **318 STATE ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
 Application Number: MST2005-00286
 Owner: Howe Family Partnership
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
 Applicant: Peter Lewis

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a mixed use development to include demolition of the existing 35,841 square-foot warehouse, construction of 26,804 square feet of nonresidential use and 28 new residential condominium units. The front arcade and 4,523 square feet of commercial space along State Street would be preserved.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; CONCEPT REVIEW)

(7:23)

Brian Cearnal, Architect; E.B. Howe, Owner; and Peter Lewis, Applicant, present.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The mass, bulk, and scale is acceptable with the condition that the floor-to-floor ratios be reduced and the massing along the freeway side be modulated. 2) The Commission commends the setback to the interior court yard to allow light and air to penetrate and also commends the side-yard setback to allow for landscaping. 3) The Commission strongly supports the underground parking. 4) The Commission finds, on an early conceptual review, the addition acceptable to a landmark status building but would look forward to the comments by the historian. 5) The Commission would appreciate a photo-simulation from the Santa Barbara Roasting Company parking lot, the Staples parking lot, and from the turn out at Brooks Institute Jefferson Campus on the Riviera. 6) Incorporate some of the existing restrained Moorish architecture and detailing into the proposed addition.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 8/0/0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. **13 W HALEY ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-004
 Application Number: MST2003-00001
 Owner: Neil & Sue Ablitt
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Revised proposal to construct a 653 square foot, four-story residence with a 243 square foot attached garage on a 400 square foot vacant lot. A 129 square foot roof deck is also proposed. Modifications are requested for relief of the required setbacks and open yard requirement, and a reduction in the required parking.)

(Review After Final for revised tile color selection and paving material.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

B. **1000 BLK STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-028-0RW
 Application Number: MST2003-00073
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers

(Replace (15) fifteen existing handicapped ramps on State Street between Carrillo Street and Victoria Street, with ADA compliant ramps. Ramps will be colored concrete to match existing bricks.)

(Reinstatement of previous HLC approval which expired 2-05-04)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 315 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00471
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Brian Cearnal & Christine Pierron
 Designer: LNI Custom Manufacturing

(The Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara (HASB) is proposing to demolish the existing commercial structures and construct 61 efficiency units and one manager's unit. Each unit would be 216 square feet in size and restricted to affordable rental housing targeted to households at or below sixty percent (60%) of area median income. The building would be a maximum of three stories in height, contain 2,051 square feet of common building area for resident services, and have 5,759 square feet of landscaped courtyards. Seventeen parking spaces would be located in the parking ground level garage and 10 guest spaces would be provided off site.)

(Review after final changes including window alterations and location of electronic transformer location.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final changes to the window only. The Transformer is continued indefinitely for the applicant to prepare a Southern California Edison-approved landscape plan to screen the transformer.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 1214 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves rehabilitation of the Granada theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Final review of the project details.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04.)

Postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 401 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-020
 Application Number: MST2005-00170
 Owner: 401 East Carrillo Street, LLC
 Architect: Burnell & Jewett Architects

(Proposal for exterior alternations to north, partial west, and partial east facades for an existing commercial building. (This is Phase III of a remodel currently under construction.))

(Final review of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**F. 820 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-024
Application Number: MST2005-00251
Owner: EPP office Building, LLC
Applicant: Clay Aurell

(This is an enforcement case. Proposal to replace existing 36" box Mediterranean fan palm and install a new sago palm 36-42" box. The tree is to be located in the same locations as a previously removed tree and all other landscaping is to remain unaltered.)

Final Approval of the project as submitted.

NEW ITEM**G. 500 STATE ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-020
Application Number: MST2005-00273
Owner: RTK Associates
Architect: Doug Keep

(Proposal to renovate and expand the trash enclosure.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS SUBMITTED PRIOR TO THE MEETING.)

Final Approval of the project with the following conditions: 1) Eliminate the molded plaster cap on top of the new wall. 2) The size of the containers shall be four cubic yards.

NEW ITEM**H. 121 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
Application Number: MST2005-00284
Owner: Dennis Casad, Trustee
Applicant: Tom Bouakeo
Business Name: Hotel State Street

(Proposal to repaint the Hotel State Street with Arizona White for the main body of the building and the trim with Santa Barbara Blue.)

Final Approval of the project with the condition that the trim color shall be Frazee #8086A, "Green Wharf."

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:01 P.M. ****