



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 16, 2005 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **630 Garden Street** **1:31 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- ANTHONY SPANN, Chair, Present
- VADIM HSU, Vice-Chair, Absent
- STEVE HAUSZ, Present at 1:35 p.m.
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Present
- ALEX PUJO, Present
- CAREN RAGER, Present
- PHILIP SUDING, Present, left at 3:01 p.m., returned at 3:07 p.m.
- FERMINA MURRAY, Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON, Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present at 2:31 p.m., left at 2:49 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present
- BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.

- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final HLC approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final HLC approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on March 11, 2005 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the HLC will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Louise Boucher, local resident, stated her concern regarding the West Beach area. She stated that this area has not had a significant number of remodels and/or demolitions and suggested the Historic Landmarks Commission consider this be designated as an historic district.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 2, 2005.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 2, 2005, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/0/1. Suding abstained.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Spann with the exception of Item C, 2400 Bath Street, which was reviewed by Phil Suding.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 8/0/0. La Voie opposed Item E, 623 State Street.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Commissioner Rager announced that the discussion by Ossie DaRos has been changed to Thursday, March 24, 2005 at 5:00 p.m. at Arnoldi's.

2. Ms. Gantz announced the Historic Landmark Commission/Park and Recreation Commission joint meeting is pending.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, reported that the Cultural Resources section of the Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was distributed to the Designation Subcommittee for review. Because of the project scope, complexity, and requirement to meet the State mandated timeline for construction of the hospital, Staff determined that the Historic Structures Report should be peer reviewed by the EIR consultant, and subsequently, that peer review served to provide the analysis of the EIR with respect to Historic Structures. The Designation Subcommittee reviewed this chapter and generally agreed with the conclusions and findings of the analysis and recommended further that the Moreton Bay Fig tree (located at the corner of Castillo and Pueblo Streets) which is a remaining landscape tree from the original hospital to be designated as a landmark tree. It was also recommended by the Subcommittee that the Knapp building, located at 2400 Bath Street, be designated as a landmark structure. Staff has forwarded these recommendations to the Planning Commission as part of the Conditions of Approval. Ms. Unzueta concluded that there is a joint City Council and Planning Commission meeting scheduled for March 22, 2005, to provide information regarding the project. On March 24th, the Planning Commission will consider the project for approval, and at that time, the Planning Commission will consider these recommendations.

Jake Jacobus stated that Staff has scheduled a meeting of the Designations Subcommittee on March 30, 2005 at 10:00 a.m.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT1. **624 DEL MONTE AVE**

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-021-017
Application Number: MST2004-00740
Owner: Valentin and Esperanza Rodriguez
Architect: Vadim Hsu
Owner: Jason Thibodeau & Chad Ratliffe

(Proposal to convert an existing 858 square foot single-family dwelling to a two-bedroom condominium unit (Unit A); construct a new, two-story, 1,251 square foot, three-bedroom condominium unit (Unit B); construct a new, 413 square foot attached two-car garage with a 112 square foot utility/storage area; and, demolish an existing 260 square foot garage, all on a 5,000 square foot lot.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report by Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**(1:45)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. Ms. Gantz added that at Staff's request, the applicant has submitted an updated project description and statistics which supersede those found in the report. Because the proposed ground disturbance is identical, the conclusions in the report are not affected.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
Action: La Voie/Naylor, 8/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT2. **962 ISLETA AVE**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-242-012
Application Number: MST2005-00103
Owner: Sydney Gabriel

(Residential addition and new garage.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)**(1:47)**

Tim Hazeltine, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated that Staff agrees with the conclusions and recommendations in the report and recommended the following revision for clarification: Page 24, under "Discussion", third sentence, should read: "In order to make it more contextual, the open area below the deck should be covered with lattice work." Mr. Jacobus explained that the porch in question is shown in figure 5 and the existing porch, which has lattice work and is to be removed, is shown in figures 13 and 14. Mr. Jacobus also addressed a question asked by the applicant regarding the windows by stating that, prior to November of 2004, permits were not required to change windows if the size of the window openings were not changed and that the new windows were installed in January of 2005. The installer may have ordered the new windows prior to November and therefore may not have been told that a permit would be required.

- Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following comments and conditions: 1) The south side of the garage should be modified to have a flat, plainer wall with fewer dog-legs. 2) The report should reflect that the contractor who built the house also built the Granada Theatre. 3) Change the wording on Page 24 of the report, under "Discussion," third sentence, to read: "In order to make it more contextual, the open area below the deck should be covered with lattice work." 4) The Commission directed Staff to begin the process of designating the house as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. 5) Correct the wording on page 22, paragraph one, last sentence to read: "therefore, the effect of the proposed design for the proposed addition is considered to be less than significant."
- Action: La Voie/Suding, 7/1/0. Pujo opposed.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. **117 W DE LA GUERRA ST** C-2 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-003
 Application Number: MST2005-00126
 Owner: John Dewilde
 Architect: Peikert Group
 Applicant: Alexandra Cole
 (Historic Structures/Sites Report for 113-117 W. De La Guerra Street for review prior to the architectural renderings for a mixed-use project.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report from Preservation Planning Associates.)

(2:06)

Alexandra Cole, Preparer; and Ariane Risto, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated Staff agrees with the conclusions and recommendations in the report.

- Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
 Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0.

FINAL REVIEW

4. **721 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-006
 Application Number: MST2002-00405
 Owner: Chadwick Pacific LP
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects
 Applicant: Bermant Development Company
 (Proposal to demolish an existing 9,788 square foot commercial building and six residential units totaling 2,700 square feet, and to construct 9,788 square feet of commercial space, 29 residential units (including 12 bonus density units) totaling 43,357 square feet, and a 25,533 square foot on-grade parking structure.)

(Final Review of Details.)

(2:07)

John Anderson, Architect; and Carrie Bingham, Designer, present.

- Motion: Final Approval of the details with the condition that the gutter downspout leaderheads shall be located within five feet of the gutter on the wall and that, below the leaderhead, the piping shall be within the building frame and not exposed.
 Action: Pujo/Suding, 7/0/1. Murray abstained.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED5. **523 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-021
 Application Number: MST2004-00854
 Owner: Leon Olson
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal for seven residential condominium units and two commercial units. The total net residential square footage is proposed at 17,538 square feet and the commercial units are 1,288 and 1,064 net square feet each, for a total of 2,352 square feet.)

(Second Concept Review prior to PRT process.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

(2:16)

Leon Olson, Owner; and Jeff Shelton, Architect, present.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support eliminating the third level bridge? 4/4.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The size, bulk, and scale is going in a positive direction. 2) The Commission would like to see sections, especially through the Brinkerhoff District and how it relates to the building. 3) Return with a landscape plan for the courtyard. 4) The majority of the Commission would like to see the architecture simplified. 5) If the courtyard is to remain on the second level, the staircase should become more important. 6) Include in-ground planting opportunities in the courtyard.

Action: La Voie/Rager, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW6. **517 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: Montecito Bank and Trust, Trustee
 Applicant: Peikert Group Architects, LLP

(PRT for a new mixed-use project consisting of 3,000 square feet of commercial and six new condominiums, one of which is bonus density. The proposal encompasses two lots.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

(2:49)

Straw vote: How many Commissioners agree that the project can be forwarded to the Planning Commission with comments? 5/3.

Detlev Peikert, Architect; and Gordon Brewer, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jessica Grant, Associate Planner, stated the project is currently submitted for pre-application review. Ms. Grant requested the Commission comment on the two separate access points off Chapala Street and the alley, as well as the mass, bulk, and scale of the project and the courtyard area.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) The Commission generally accepts the site plan as presented. 2) Establish pedestrian access to the alleyway. 3) Provide an adequate or sufficient planting area to allow for skyline trees on the reference north and alley elevations. 4) The Commission supports the double entrance from Chapala Street and the alley. 5) The size, bulk and scale are generally acceptable. 6) Fine tune the architecture to bring the project into compliance with the Zoning Ordinance. 7) The tucked-under handicapped parking space needs to be carefully considered as part of the whole design because of its visibility from the street. 8) The driveway shall be designed to emulate a Paseo and be pedestrian scaled to be feasible.
- Action: La Voie/Hausz, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. **734 E ANAPAMU ST** R-3 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-191-001
 Application Number: MST2005-00128
 Owner: Evans Stout
 Agent: Tim Steele

(This is a City Landmark. Proposal for "as-built" changes including exterior paint colors and two new gates on the "Little Granada" single-family residence. To abate ENF2004-00238.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCES FINDINGS.)

(3:27)

Tim Steele, Representative for the applicant, present.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project and an indefinite continuance with the following conditions and comments: 1) Remove all of the blue paint from the plaster surfaces. 2) The gate is approved as installed.

Action: Pujó/La Voie, 4/4/0. Hausz, Naylor, Murray and Rager opposed.

Motion failed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Repaint all plaster surfaces to match the white body paint of the wall eliminating the dark green trim. 2) Redesign the gates and provide documentation of previous installations in the "Little Granada" area.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. **206 CASTILLO ST** HRC-1/SD-3 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-031-016
 Application Number: MST2005-00139
 Owner: Harborside Inns of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Julio Veyna
 Business Name: Colonial Beach Inn

(Proposal to change the architectural style of an existing motel, parking lot redesign to meet room and ADA requirements, and construct four open arbors for a combined total of 1,250 square feet.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND COASTAL REVIEW.)

(3:38)

Julio Veyna, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Rob Dayton, Transportation Planning Supervisor, approved the plan as presented but that the HLC needs to make a finding that equivalent or sufficient landscaping is being provided on site due to the finger planter requirement not being met.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners can support the proposed Monterey style if it is modeled correctly? 8/0.
How many Commissioners can support the existing colonial style? 3/5.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission can support the Monterey style if it is modeled correctly. 2) If the Applicant pursues the colonial style, then a Historic Structures/Sites Report will be required. 3) Restudy the hardscape and landscape detailing. 4) Relocate the sign. 5) Provide the actual materials.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 8/0/0.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM**

A. **1232 DE LA VINA ST** P-R Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-005
Application Number: MST2003-00024
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Robert Grant

(This building is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to remodel the Louise Lowry Davis Center to comply with ADA and CALDAG requirements, including a new entrance, hardscape, and landscape.)

(Review of details.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

Final Approval of the details with the following conditions: 1) The parking lot light fixture is to be 75 watts maximum high pressure sodium. 2) The Concrete shall be plain and uncolored. 3) Historic Resource findings: The improvements will not be a detriment to the Historic Resource and will enhance and further improve the Historic Resource.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

B. **2121 GARDEN ST** E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003
Application Number: MST2003-00748
Owner: Steve & Tamar Handleman
Architect: Derrik Eichelberger

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Resources for Designation. Proposal for a new 660 square foot detached three-car garage, driveway, hedge, and garden improvements on a 25,464 square foot lot located in the Mission Area Special Design District. The proposal includes converting the existing two-car garage into an accessory space, some landscape plan changes, revised paving, and the removal of the existing driveway. Abatement of existing violations and re-roofing are being processed under a separate application.)

(Remove proposed swimming pool and privacy wall; revise paving and add hedge.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 2400 BATH ST**

C-O Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-061-015
 Application Number: MST2004-00019
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Permit Processing
 Business Name: Cottage Hospital
 Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham, Arcadia Studios

(This building is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal to add two new exterior doors on the east elevation, extend the retaining wall on the north elevation, increase the number of accessible parking spaces from one to six, and alter the existing exterior mechanical area of the Knapp Building. Additionally proposed are roof tile repairs, a new ramp and railing for accessible entrance, and a new emergency exit door.)

(Review After Final to increase landscaping improvements on Bath Street frontage.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the comment for the final drawings to show sizes and quantities of the Japanese Maple trees.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 651 PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2004-00162
 Owner: Redevelopment Agency/Santa Barbara
 Agent: Glen Morris
 Agent: Louis Lazarine
 Business Name: Paseo Nuevo Mall

(Proposal to install six freestanding/removable kiosks to be located in Paseo Nos. 3 and 5 to be utilized for retail sales in the Paseo Nuevo Shopping Mall. The proposed kiosks are 4'-6" deep by 5'-8" wide by 8'-7.5" high. Each kiosk has four light fixtures to be installed under the canopy.)

(Review of final details.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final details with the condition that the valance shall be heavily distressed and the crown shall include strapped connections.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 623 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-006
 Application Number: MST2004-00802
 Owner: Chaffee Family Survivor S Trust
 Applicant: Brandon Mix
 Designer: Sam Linhardt
 Agent: Raymond Appleton
 Architect: Peter Hunt

(Revised proposal to remove two single existing entrance doors located on either side of the storefront and construct a centered, recessed, double-doored entrance, and make interior tenant improvements to create a 1,300 square foot coffee shop. The existing tiled facade and stained glass transom will be studied for possible alteration.)

(Final Review of pilaster capital Detail 7/A-3.)

Final Approval of the detail as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**F. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST** E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002
Application Number: MST2004-00830
Owner: Marliynn Jorgensen & Errol Jahnke

(This residence is a City Landmark and the garden is a separate City Landmark. Solder two leaves of existing iron gate on Los Olivos Street frontage to create a larger opening. Proposed landscape and other improvements including minor window alterations, replacement of gutters, leaderheads, and downspouts, roofing tile replacement, and repair of damaged site wall.)

(Final Review of landscape details.)

Final Approval of the details as submitted.

NEW ITEM**G. 18 E CANON PERDIDO ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-003
Application Number: MST2005-00137
Owner: David and Julieanne Hybert
Business Name: Spa Medicus

(Proposal to replace the existing brick and cinder block siding with waterproof stucco siding; repaint exterior of a commercial building in the El Pueblo Viejo District.)

Final Approval of the project with the condition that the plaster finish shall match the existing plaster and the comment that Staff has found this to be a non-historic building due to previous alterations.

****MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:03 P.M.****