



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, August 3, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)

SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician

KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Cung, Hopkins, Miller, Poole, and Wittausch (present until 6:00 p.m.).

Members absent: Gradin and Tripp.

Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 20, 2015**, as amended.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung abstained, Gradin/Tripp absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 27, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 3, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- 1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Board member Tripp will be absent from the meeting.
 - b) Board member Wittausch will be leaving the meeting at approximately 6:00 p.m.
 - c) Board member Miller will be stepping down from Item #1, 6100 Hollister Avenue, and presenting for that item.
 - d) Item #7, 1200 Block Cliff Drive were continued two weeks to the August 17, 2015 meeting, at the Applicant's request.
- E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no reports made.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 6100 HOLLISTER AV

A-I-1/SP-6 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2014-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Applicant: Direct Relief
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 152 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing six main buildings and five outbuildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-Area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan (SP-6). The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet (and reservation of 30,000 square feet) of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan Approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Vice-Chair Hopkins read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, SEPPS Agent; Judy Partch, Director of Human Resources, Administration and Compliance for Direct Relief; Mark Linehan, Board member for Direct Relief/Building Committee Chair; Michael Holliday, Architect for DMHA; and Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study incorporating trees that will break up the height of the high tilt up parapet walls.
- 2) The Board finds the tilt up panel design with knock-out panel elements to be a creative solution.
- 3) Study incorporating additional design elements as needed to mitigate the massing of this very large building. Consider tectonic joining and overlapping of concrete panels and at the corners as seen in the architecture of Stephen Holl. The design, finish, and

variety of the tilt-up portion of the building will be extremely important, whether exposed aggregate, plain and/or smooth, stained and/or other natural material.

- 4) Study opportunities to breaking up the continuous nature of the tilt-up parapet line with, for example, angled panels or some other architectural treatment. Also, study the parapet height in relation to the floor-to-floor height for the commercial portions, etc. to add interest to the building.

Action: Cung/Poole, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller stepped down, Gradin/Tripp absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 15 S HOPE AVE

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-058
 Application Number: MST2015-00010
 Owner: Johnman Holding, LLC
 Architect: R & A Architecture & Design, Inc.
 Agent: Dudek

(Proposal to demolish an existing 8,368 square foot commercial building and construct a four-story mixed-use development. New development would consist of 2,206 square feet of commercial space on the ground level and 48 residential units totaling approximately 35,570 square feet on the second, third, and fourth floors. There would be 11 commercial spaces and 8 residential parking spaces provided on the ground level, and 40 residential spaces in an underground garage. This project is being reviewed under the Priority Housing Overlay of the Average Unit Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. Planning Commission Concept Review is required.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Note the project description has been revised and updated to reflect current proposal.)

Actual time: 4:01 p.m.

Present: Darren Embry, Director of Community Development for Faring Capitol, and Jason Illoulilian, Founder and Head of Faring Capitol; John Cuykendall, Agent for Dudek; Benjamin Anderson, R & A; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Address the disconnectivity of the creek side area to the building. Some Board members found only a limited number of units benefited from a creek view and access to the street, and other units faced the parking lot or faced north to the adjacent three-story building and had limited access to natural light. Study other Santa Barbara buildings for reference.
- 2) Consider relocating the courtyard so that it faces the creek rather than a parking lot, which could be redeveloped and would not block light to the courtyard.
- 3) Restudy the pedestrian circulation through the site and to the creek, and from hallways to courtyards.
- 4) One Board member commented that the retail portion is small and doesn't seem to fit with the residential community; it seems to complicate the project, which might be more successful if it were just residential.
- 5) One Board member suggested using rooftop areas as outdoor space.

- 6) Study introducing more modulation and adding more sculptural design elements. For a large, boxy design such as this to work in Santa Barbara, the materials need to be exquisite.
- 7) Provide the exact heights and photographs of the neighboring buildings.
- 8) Provide photographs and site context imagery from a birds-eye view, different angles, and from street level or a pedestrian perspective for the Board to assess the overall context of the existing buildings with the neighborhood. Evaluate the architectural design, context, layout and elevations, and how the building fits into the site for neighborhood compatibility.
- 9) It's difficult to tell what the building will look like. Provide less busy sketches; clarify and simplify the west elevation drawings. The elevation drawings don't represent the material choices shown. One Board member found the whimsical imagery and designs acceptable.
- 10) Provide accurate and precise materials board. A majority of the Board found the proposed use of materials was acceptable.

Action: Cung/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 3925 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(4:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-021
 Application Number: MST2015-00252
 Owner: GRI Regency, LLC
 Applicant: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Initial Concept Review of a proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building in the Five Points Shopping Center (former Carl's Jr. and Green Burrito). The work will include dividing an existing 141,574 square foot commercial building into two tenant spaces and alterations to the building façade. The alterations include new awnings, entries, window replacements, and roof change from mansard to parapet wall and cap. Twenty parking spaces will be converted to compact parking spaces but the total of 571 parking spaces will remain unchanged. A new landscape plan is also proposed, including new pedestrian access from State Street, new 464 square foot dining patio, and new bicycle parking. No new square footage is proposed.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project last reviewed on June 8, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:56 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis and Rogelio Solis, Architects; John Nahas, Senior Manager for Regency Centers; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Study adding some landscaping between the outer edge of the patio and the parking lot.
- 2) Provide a paving sample at Consent Review.
- 3) Provide profiles, levels, and elevations in the detail drawings.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 806 ALBERTA AVE****R-2 Zone**

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-241-012
Application Number: MST2015-00093
Owner: Mary Martinez
Architect: Jyl Ratkevich

(Proposal to demolish an existing 182 square foot, 1-car garage and chain link fence with gate and to construct a 633 square foot, 2-story accessory dwelling unit and two, attached 1-car garages of 210 square feet each at the rear of the site. The existing 650 square foot dwelling unit at the front of the site will remain unchanged. Total development on this 5,061 square foot parcel will be 1,703 square feet. One additional uncovered tandem parking space is proposed for a total of three parking spaces. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2015-00308.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on July 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:04 p.m.

Present: Jyl Ratkevich, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m.

- 1) James Hurst, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, backyard privacy, property value declines, water, sewer, and street parking density issues, unacceptable side yard and rear yard setbacks; over population affecting services in the area, and requested a one story design instead of the proposed two story structure since there is sufficient space.
- 2) David L. Hale (adjacent neighbor), opposition; expressed concerns regarding privacy and property value declines, parking density, neighborhood compatibility, and lack of communication with the neighborhood.

A letter of concern from Ms. Catherine "Lily" Bastug Vincenti was acknowledged.

Board comments:

Some Board members clarified that certain issues are beyond the purview of this aesthetic design review Board, such as changes in property values, future vacation rental and home sharing rental, and whether second story additions which that comply with the Ordinance should be allowed or not. The ABR can only address aesthetics, mass, bulk, scale, landscaping, screening, site circulation, and accessibility to/from the project site.

One Board member acknowledged the modest and diminutive nature of the proposed project and noted that is sufficiently set back from the rear and side yards. It was also noted that the Applicant has complied satisfactorily with previous requests from the ABR to remove windows due to privacy concerns from adjacent neighbors, even though the change eliminated positive aesthetic potential from the proposed project.

Board member Miller asked the Applicant if there had been any communication with adjacent neighbors. Ms. Ratkevich replied that she had previously attempted to speak with several members of the neighborhood but was either rebuffed or spoken to in appropriately, and therefore ceased efforts to

contact them. However, she clarified there has been some minimal, though unhelpful, communication during and after recent design review meetings.

Public comment closed at 5:15 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Study the windows in the stairwell.
 - 2) Relocate the balcony on the second floor plan over the bracket so that the balcony fits the stationary bracket and still remains functional. Add the eyebrow not shown on the plans.
 - 3) Provide paneled garage doors with glass lights to provide light to the garage and as an aesthetic improvement.
 - 4) Add a cottage treatment or character-giving details to the front door and garage doors to match the rest of the building, including various details such as corbel and wood stucco details.
 - 5) Provide a color board.
 - 6) Provide additional landscaping.
 - 7) Board member Wittausch read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."
- Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW

5. 818 OLIVE ST

R-3 Zone

(5:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-031-034
 Application Number: MST2015-00179
 Owner: DeBusk Family Trust
 Architect: Bryan Pollard AIA

(Proposal to construct a new, detached, 816 square foot one-story dwelling unit and new detached 2-car carport on a 7,965 square foot parcel. Two existing dwelling units totaling 1,850 square feet will remain unchanged. Total development on site will be 3,085 square feet. One 6" diameter avocado tree is proposed to be removed, and a paved trash area is proposed next to the new carport. No grading is proposed outside of the building footprint.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 11, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:36 p.m.

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect; and Allison DeBusk, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review for landscape details with comments:**
- 1) Provide additional landscape plan details, such as sizes, spacing density, and extent of planting area for all plant material (especially the area between Units B and C).

- 2) Provide the standard three inches of mulch and all other Ordinance landscaping requirements.
- 3) Study the detailing of the wood awning construction.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Tripp absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:51 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:20 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 3771 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(6:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-049
 Application Number: MST2015-00301
 Owner: Yun-Pei Yeh
 Architect: Armet Davi Newlove & Associates, AIA
 Applicant: The Tasty Group
 Business Name: Dunkin' Donuts

(Proposal for tenant improvements to an existing 1,927 square foot fast food outlet. The project includes changes to the façade and parapet walls, a new trellis, awning, outdoor bar height seating, gas fire pit, and new paint and finishes. Site alterations include new landscaping and the removal of an existing 16' tall willow tree. Also proposed is to restripe the existing parking lot with no new parking proposed. An as-built storage building will either be retained or removed. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Third Concept Review; Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed July 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:21 p.m.

Present: Paul Deppe, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion 1: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed stone material and colors are not acceptable; study either incorporating a more natural sandstone material with a natural color or alternatives or remove entirely.
- 2) Propose an alternate color for the cornice.

Action: Cung/(no second), 4/0/0. **Motion failed.** (Gradin/Wittausch/Tripp absent).

Motion 2: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Return with a more acceptable stone material and cladding of the free-standing columns.
- 2) The Board strongly suggests removal of the stone at the pilasters on the east elevation.
- 3) Study matching the paint color and the stone color.
- 4) Remove the dark red cornice color or propose an alternate color.

Action: Poole/Miller, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Wittausch/Tripp absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1200 BLK CLIFF DR**

(6:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-003-156
 Application Number: MST2015-00334
 Applicant: Verizon Wireless

(Proposal for a new wireless communications facility. The project includes a new antenna to be mounted on top of an existing utility pole located within the City right-of-way on the south side of Cliff Drive near Vista Pacifica. The antenna will increase the height of the utility pole from 28'-6" to 31'-0". Also proposed is a new equipment cabinet to be mounted on a concrete pad, new remote radio units and GPS mounted on a new H-frame, new hand hole, and co-axial cable. The area of work will be 3'-6"x13'-0". A Public Works encroachment permit is being tracked separately under PBW2015-00514.)

(Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works encroachment permit. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Postponed two weeks at the Applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**8. 317 W CANON PERDIDO ST****R-4 Zone**

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-032-004
 Application Number: MST2015-00276
 Owner: Alan and Genice Gallegos
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning

(Proposal for additions to an existing 3,020 square foot, 2-story four-unit apartment building. The work will include a proposed 46 square foot first story addition, approval of an as-built 402 square foot second story addition, and a proposed 13 square foot second story addition. This project will result in 461 square feet of additions and a total of 3,481 square feet of development on a 6,250 square foot parcel.)

Actual time: 7:01 p.m.

Present: Sarah Bromstad for Vanguard Planning; and Alan Gallegos, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:06 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued one week to Consent Review for Final details with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the simulated window lights are unacceptable for historic accuracy; provide true divided light windows or remove the mullions entirely.
- 2) Address the baluster and handrail to match the original decorative style at the front porch. Study a solid rail or a picket design to match the front porch.

Action: Miller/Poole, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Wittausch/Tripp absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:19 P.M. ****