



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 18, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room, 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
GARY MOSEL
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by the Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Mosel, Gradin, Cung, Hopkins, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Boughman, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 4, 2013**, as amended.
Action: Mosel/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 11, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Kirk Gradin.
Action: Poole/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The Consent Calendar of **March 18, 2013, was cancelled.**

- D.** Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- 1) Mr. Boughman announced that Item #2, 222 N. Milpas Street applicant may be late and agenda items may need to move up in the agenda or a break may be taken.
 - 2) The following Board members announced they would be stepping down from specific agenda items:
 - a) Board member Mosel from Item #1, 517 N. Milpas Street;
 - b) Board member Hopkins from Item#4, 1419 De La Vina St.; and
 - c) Board member Cung from Item #7, 632 E. Canon Perdido Street.
- E.** Subcommittee Reports. There were no reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 517 W FIGUEROA ST

R-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-250-020
Application Number: MST2011-00426
Owner: Steven A. Johnson
Architect: Alex Pujo

(Proposal for a new 17,475 square foot, three-story six unit apartment building. The building consists of one 3-story, 3-bedroom unit and 20 parking spaces on the ground level. Above the parking level are four two-story five-bedroom units. Attached storage units and bicycle parking are provided on grade. A tree removal, bioswale, and retention basin are proposed. The 20,247 net square foot vacant project site was created through a lot split approved by the Planning Commission in 2005 with a development envelope and a limit of ten units. A 10-foot wide bike path easement, 25-foot creek setback, and a 50-foot railroad setback apply to this project. Preliminary Approval by the ABR in 2008 for a similar building containing nine units has expired. Minor architectural changes have been made by the new architect.)

(Project was last reviewed on January 23, 2012. Project requires Tier 3 SWMP compliance, and conformance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 009-05.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Alex Pujo, Architect; Steven A. Johnson, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was acknowledged.

Staff reminded the Board that the applicant must address the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements, and conformance with the Planning Commission Resolution No. 009-05 prior to approval.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study providing additional asymmetric character to the Figueroa Street elevation and to portions of the west elevation; including greater shifts in massing, material changes, color changes, and/or window sizes.
- 2) If possible, portions of the lower floor of the west elevation should be brought to the ground or possibly larger columns on the face to help ground the project on the west elevation.
- 3) Provide a landscaping plan for the lower west side floor.
- 4) Provide color and/or material shifts on the east elevation to provide the appearance of further massing articulation on that elevation.
- 5) Extend the overhang of the canopies past the last support.
- 6) Provide Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements before returning for final review.
- 7) Study the rhythm of the openings along the garage at the east elevation.
- 8) Study the awning at the window that is closer to the roof parapet on the west elevation.
- 9) Provide depth of the framing to be more substantial and similar to the canopies.
- 10) Provide wall light fixture details.
- 11) The vinyl windows are acceptable due to the quality of the details, amount of recess provided at the windows, and the color of the windows.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Mosel stepped down, Wittausch/Cung abstained).

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

FINAL REVIEW**2. 222 N MILPAS ST****C-2/C-P Zone****(3:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-051-002
 Application Number: MST2012-00412
 Owner: Scolari Properties, LLC
 Architect: Jose Cervantes
 Applicant: Jose Cervantes
 Business Name: The Fresh Market

(Proposal for a remodel and tenant improvements to the existing 29,953 square foot one-story grocery store building. The project consists of a new front façade, interior remodel to divide the building into three tenant lease spaces, an approximately 150 square foot addition under the new front arcade for the grocery store, new outdoor patio seating, new mechanical equipment, and minor alterations to landscaping. The existing 137 parking space parking lot is to remain.)

(Project was last reviewed on March 4, 2013.)

Actual time: 5:14 p.m.

Present: Keith Weik, The Fresh Market; and Jose Cervantes, Architect/Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Final Approval of the project with the following conditions and continued indefinitely to Consent for final approval of details:

- 1) Remove the corbels at the new plaster façade that protrude out from the plaster walls; however, the corbels that exist on the Montecito Street side of the project and that are part of the existing structure are to remain; all others are to be removed.
- 2) Provide additional information on the plans how the tiles will turn the corner at the columns.
- 3) Provide concrete color details on the plans, and provide a chamfer at the column bases.
- 4) If not permitted, the existing wall pack light fixtures shall be removed; and if permitted, all are to conform to current building code requirements.
- 5) All of the columns shall be of the same depth at 18-inches throughout the project.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**3. 1080 COAST VILLAGE RD****C-1/SD-3 Zone****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-212-012
 Application Number: MST2013-00087
 Owner: Hanna Family Trust
 Applicant: Jeff Minelli
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building including the following: replace façade, new landscape and hardscape, and restriping an existing parking lot to provide five parking spaces. Coastal review is required.)

(Concept Review.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; Jeff Minelli, Applicant/Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Staff requested the Board focus on review of the architecture because parking and site planning issues are unresolved as of now.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The proposed project is headed in the right direction.
- 2) Provide trash enclosure location details.
- 3) Provide more details of the front architecture, including the stone work and the archway; some Board members would like to see the entryway increased in height or more variation between the parapet and the new entryway façade.
- 4) Provide information on how the changes in the parking affect the landscaping and site planning.

Action: Mosel/Poole, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:36 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:41 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

4. 1419 DE LA VINA ST

R-4 Zone

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-061-011
Application Number: MST2013-00085
Owner: David Gerrity
Architect: Gordon Brewer

(Proposal to rebuild two non-conforming buildings that were destroyed by fire in 2011. The 24,750 square foot site is non-conforming to residential density, parking, setbacks, and building separation and the buildings must be replaced like-for-like. The two buildings are a 2,033 square foot two-story five-unit building, and a 900 square foot single unit. There are a total of 15 units and 5 single-room-occupancy units approved on this property, in addition to 3 covered parking spaces and 20 uncovered parking spaces. No alterations are proposed for the potentially historic 14-unit Desmond Building on the site.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Gordon Brewer and Jeanni Daniel, Architects; and David Gerrity, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Heather Widen, Project Planner, provided a landscape memo regarding replacement of burned palm trees and one other unidentified burned tree; status of "large camellias" adjacent to the palm noted on the 2006 plan; provide detailed plantings proposed for area to the east of new walkways; staff to verify with Public Works a 80% water-wise landscape requirements due to fire area and effect on plantings such as lawns; and documentation on plans on fenced private areas adjacent to staircase for existing two-story 14-unit building.

Staff clarified what may, and may not be, altered for "like-for-like" replacement of the non-conforming buildings.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan that replaces the landscape plan originally approved in 2006. Confirm compliance or exemption from current requirements.
- 2) Provide a color board that replicates the originally approved colors in 2006.
- 3) Change the siding on the west elevation of Building A to horizontal for the original portions of the building.
- 4) Study adding windows where possible.
- 5) Provide fire prevention sprinkler backflow device details and screening, if required.
- 6) Provide separate meter details and screening from public view, if necessary.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 3880 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(5:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-240-046
 Application Number: MST2012-00422
 Owner: Sumida Family, Ltd Partnership
 Architect: LMA Architects

(Proposal to construct 13 new apartment units in a 13,323 square foot two-story building at the rear of the site near Via Lucero. The project consists of the demolition of 2,152 square feet of commercial structures for the existing nursery. The existing two-story commercial building fronting on State Street will remain unchanged. The new apartment building will be attached to the existing 5,442 square foot one-story office building at the center of the site. The project includes two attached carports for 13 spaces, and a 262 square foot trash enclosure. Parking on the site will be reconfigured with 117 total spaces with 39 of the spaces provided on an adjacent parcel to the west with an off-site parking agreement. The entire site will be made accessible with a new ramp at State Street, a pedestrian lift at the center of the site, and right-of-way improvements at Via Lucero. Pedestrian sidewalk improvements were required at Via Lucero resulting in the proposed building and private outdoor living space for two units being too close to the right-of-way. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is requested for the building to encroach into the SD-2 setback and for the private outdoor living space to be less than 10 feet from the front lot line.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of modifications.)

Actual time: 6:05 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged; and Philip Beguhl submitted and discussed with the applicant a few written questions regarding effect of the proposed project upon the adjacent apartment complex at 100 N. La Cumbre Road.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the proposed plate heights at the overall height of 32 feet? 3/4 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The reduced setback along Via Lucero is visually acceptable and will have minimal visual impact.
- 2) A majority of the Board found that the proposed building height should be reduced.
- 3) If it is feasible to not have a sidewalk since there are no connecting pedestrian sidewalks on either side of the project; no sidewalks would be acceptable in order to increase the landscaping along Via Lucero.
- 4) The addition of continuous landscaping along the sidewalk.
- 5) Study removing the overhead storage under the carport parking.
- 6) The Board understands that a 5 to 6-foot fence along the rear is part of the proposal.

Action: Gradin/Mosel, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 601 SAN PASCUAL ST****R-3 Zone****(6:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-101-014
Application Number: MST2013-00019
Owner: Dario Pini
Architect: Bryan Murphy

(Proposal to construct a new two story duplex building 1,297 square foot six-car garage with an attached 45 sq. ft. laundry room and two new units (2 bedroom each) above to Building C, construction of a 114 sq. ft. first floor addition and a 400 sq. ft. second story addition resulting in a two-story duplex for Building B, four uncovered parking spaces and relocating the back stairs and entry porch to an existing one story two bedroom single family dwelling to demolish an existing 355 sq. ft. two-car garage and 78 sq. ft. shed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:44 p.m.

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect; Dario Pini, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:54 p.m.

Sally Foxen, opposed; expressed concerns regarding parking impacts, residential density, bedroom windows & privacy, and back fence proximity to the adjacent garage.

A letter of concerns from Miguel Garcia in opposition was read by staff. The letter expressed concerns regarding parking, residential density, bedroom windows & privacy, back fence proximity to the adjacent garage, trash enclosure proximity, open balcony elimination or screening, and tree screening concerns.

A letters of concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the roof areas and massing and their connection to the exterior deck and front entry at Building C.
- 2) Study or provide additional information showing the screening of the exterior deck and the impact to the adjacent neighbors.
- 3) For Unit C, resolve the siding that turns the corner.
- 4) Provide an updated landscape plan that shows the new building configurations; including all exterior lighting, cut sheets, color boards, and exterior details.
- 5) Provide cut sheets and exterior details of the roof elements, roof deck; and how the multiple roofs coming together at the same point of the deck area and the entry.
- 6) Study alternatives to the plaster wall at the private outdoor spaces along San Pascual Street.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch opposed.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 632 E CANON PERDIDO ST****R-3 Zone****(6:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-032-017
Application Number: MST2013-00080
Owner: Boys Club of Santa Barbara, Inc.
Architect: LMA Architects

(Proposal to construct a new, two-story, 13,465 square foot addition for new permanent classrooms and administration offices at the Providence Hall campus on a 2.20 acre parcel in the R-3 Zone. The site is currently developed with 16,789 square feet of existing permanent structures and 7,200 square feet of temporary portable units for a total of 23,989 square feet of existing on site development. The proposal includes the removal of the 7,200 square feet of temporary portable classrooms, and with the proposed addition of 13,465 square feet of permanent structures, the project will result in a net addition of 6,265 square feet to the site, and will result in a total of 30,254 square feet of on-site development, below the allowable 25 percent F.A.R. The site currently includes 24 parking spaces, and the proposal includes the addition of 9 new spaces, for a total of 33 parking spaces. The project requires Planning Commission review for Development Plan Approval for new non-residential square footage, a Conditional Use Permit for continued non-residential use in the R-3 Zone, and a parking modification.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of new non-residential square footage, a Conditional Use Permit, and a zoning modification.)

Actual time: 7:19 p.m.

Present: Jeff Gorrell, LMA Architects; Jim Turner, Agent for Boys & Girls Club; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 7:38 p.m.

- 1) Mike Eby, expressed concerns regarding increased requested square footage; and tree and foliage removal if the field is moved; requested information on the grandstands and lighting relocation to the south side of field.
- 2) David Bolton, opposed; concerns regarding 13,000 plus square foot proposed project compared to nearby school at 6,502 square feet.
- 3) Terry Bartlett (for Massimo & Angela Lala), opposed; with concerns regarding adjacent "temporary" structures are not being removed but moved to the play field; new construction should be moved to the play field to reopen previous private views of the foothills.
- 4) Peter Bolhlinger, in support of design and collaboration effort.
- 5) Jim Turner (Board member of Boys & Girls Club), in support of concept review; would like to see permanent buildings on site and to have the modular buildings removed.
- 6) David Edelman, in support of collaborate partnership with Providence Hall and removal of temporary housing; and the fund programs for kids for Boys & Girls Club; perfect mix of groups for a larger project with shared space (gym, yard, and art, music and dance rooms).
- 7) Kelly Vanderer (Providence Hall), in support of a quality facility and programs of Boys & Girls Club that will work excellently in partnership with the Providence Hall.
- 8) Tim Loomer (Providence Hall Principal), in support of square footage and partnership with Boys & Girls Club with Providence Hall and community; proximity to Santa Barbara High School and SB Junior High School.

An email of concern from David Bolton (property owner of both 605 and 619 E. De La Guerra Street); and a letter of concern from Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:54 p.m.

Heather Widen, Project Planner, provided landscape requirement hand-outs for the Board regarding parking lot tree requirement compliance; trees in relation to reducing lighting glare for play field, new planter details, and proposed planting vines on fencing consistency with ABR landscape guidelines.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board made the comments regarding Compatibility Analysis as follows:
 - a) The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter passage, and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b) The proposed project design is compatible with the City, and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
 - c) The project size, bulk, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood given the complexity with the comments provided.
 - d) The project poses no adverse negative impacts to views, adjacent landmarks or historic resources, and does not block established scenic public vistas of oceans or mountains; and
 - e) The project provides appropriate open space.
 - f) There was no review of landscaping at this time.
- 2) The Board looks forward to comments from the Planning Commission regarding the intensity of the use of the site, parking demand, circulation, and noise concerns.
- 3) Study the proposed storage area in the front setback.
- 4) Study the fenestration of the windows on the west elevation second-floor classrooms; the Board suggests the use of obscured glass or tall landscaping or fixed windows.
- 5) Provide photometric information for the night lighting at the ball field and parking lot.
- 6) Study planting fingers at every eight parking spaces.
- 7) Provide 5-foot minimum landscaping at Quarantina Street.
- 8) Provide details of the retaining walls at the northwest corner of the ball field.
- 9) Some Board members feel that additional improvements should be made to the existing Boys & Girls Club building to bring it up to par with the new building. One example would be to replace existing vinyl windows with metal windows to match the new.

Action: Mosel/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung stepped down).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:42 P.M. ****