



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 12, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair – ABSENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair – PRESENT
- CLAY AURELL – PRESENT AT 3:50 P.M.
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT AT 4:03 P.M.
- CAROL GROSS – ABSENT (RESIGNED FROM BOARD)
- GARY MOSEL – PRESENT
- KEITH RIVERA – PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO – ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) – ABSENT

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) – ABSENT

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT  
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician – PRESENT  
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary – PRESENT

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required <u>at the time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised.</u> <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would have been postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- \*\* All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final ABR approval.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in ABR meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr) **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 extension 4551, or by email at [mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov](mailto:mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov). Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

1. That on Thursday, July 8, 2010, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr).
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review was broadcast live on City TV-18, or could be seen on personal computers via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr) and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:10 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:**

Members present: Sherry, Mosel, Zink, Aurell (present @ 3:50 p.m.), Rivera, and Gilliland (present @ 4:03 p.m.).

Members absent: Manson-Hing.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:****A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

**B. Approval of Minutes:**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **June 28, 2010**, as submitted.

Action: Mosel/Zink, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Rivera abstained, Manson-Hing, Aurell, and Gilliland absent.)

**C. Consent Calendar:**

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 6, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing, Aurell, and Gilliland absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 12, 2010**. The Consent Calendar Item B was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with additional landscaping review Items C and D by **Chris Gilliland**.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing, Aurell, and Gilliland.)

**D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.**

1) Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:

- a) Board member Manson-Hing will be absent from the meeting.
- b) Board member Carol Gross has formally resigned from the Board.
- c) Chris Gilliland has been reappointed as a member on the Board.
- d) Board members Gilliland and Aurell will be arriving late to the meeting.

**E. Subcommittee Reports.**

None.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****1. REVIEW OF DRAFT MINOR REVISIONS TO THE ABR GUIDELINES.****(3:15)**

(25 MIN) The minor revisions increase consistency between the ABR Guidelines, the Historic Landmarks Commission Rules and Procedures and the recently updated Single Family Design Board Guidelines. Minor adjustments to staff administrative approval criteria, such as tree removal and landscape plan alteration standards are included in the minor revisions. The minor revisions also include updates in response to recent ordinance changes which affect ABR procedures, including project time extension procedures and required compatibility analysis criteria.

Staff: Heather Baker, City Project Planner, and Jaime Limón, Senior Planner.

(3:15)

Mr. Limón and Ms. Baker clarified for the Board newly revised ABR Guideline standards regarding:

- a) historic neighborhood preservation (exp: sandstone walls, etc.);
- b) affordable housing “total cost” evaluations;
- c) landscape alterations and requirements;
- d) traditional material use;
- e) uniformity of proposed improvements;
- f) square footage for licensing requirements;
- g) simplified noticing procedures;
- h) public visibility restrictions;
- i) second and third time extensions restrictions;
- j) compatibility analysis findings;
- k) increased cursory plan reviews;
- l) comprehensive/detailed file and plan reference check services and new fixed and hourly rate fees;
- m) reconsideration request restricted to be conducted before or during the next meeting;
- n) prohibition on applicants from requesting Board member abstentions from reviews; and
- o) selection of visual aid requests by the Board.

**Discussion held.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****2. 1820 DE LA VINA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-022-022  
 Application Number: MST2009-00536  
 Owner: Maldonado Living Trust  
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architects  
 Engineer: Mario Alarcon

(Proposal to construct a new two-story, 22,775 square foot residential care facility for the elderly, to include 40 studio units varying between 294 to 376 square feet, on a proposed 27,217 square foot lot. The proposal involves the demolition of 8,251 square feet of existing on-site development, comprised of five existing residential units and all garages and other related structures, the removal of seven existing trees, and 2,800 cubic yards of grading. A total of 19 on-site parking spaces are proposed. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Voluntary Lot Merger of three lots, a Conditional Use Permit to allow a Residential Care Facility, and three Zoning Modifications for the required common open yard area, a reduction in the required number of parking spaces, and over height walls within the required front setback.)

**(Third Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review.)**

(3:43)

Present: Jay Blatter and Julie McGeever, Hochhauser Blatter Architects; David Black, Landscape Architect.

Mr. Blatter clarified for the Board that Stacey Wilson, Assistant Transportation Planner gave the Transportation Division's approval for the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m.

The following public comment spoke of various concerns regarding the proposed project:

- 1) Ben Spencer expressed concerns regarding neighborhood impacts, size, bulk and scale, and parking.
- 2) Peg Browning expressed concerns regarding massing and safety issues.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:08 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Compatibility Analysis is as follows:
  - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
  - b. The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
  - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, given compliance with the comments provided here.
  - d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or established public views of mountains or ocean.
  - e. The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
  - f. The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
- 2) The Board appreciates the reduction in mass, bulk, and scale of the proposed project.
- 3) Study the treatment to the bay windows on the north and south elevations to add additional relief to the roof line.
- 4) Consider revising the north elevation gable to be consistent with the other gable treatment in the project.
- 5) Study a different architectural expression of the second floor conservatory on the rear east elevation to be more porch-like.
- 6) Study the feasibility of adding an additional street tree.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Zink/Gilliland abstained, Manson-Hing absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****3. 224 W MICHELTORENA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-221-017

Application Number: MST2010-00194

Owner: Mstislav W. and Frances Kostruba Survivor's Trust

Architect: Pujo &amp; Associates

(Proposal to construct a 366 square foot, second story addition to an existing 849 square foot single story residence located at 228 W Micheltorena Street. The existing 7,000 square foot lot is currently developed with two single family residences. The existing 1,097 square foot, single story residence at 224 W Micheltorena Street and the 287 square foot storage building are to remain unaltered. The parcel is currently legal non-conforming to parking with two existing uncovered parking spaces. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a building separation modification.)

**(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer review for a building separation modification.)**

(4:18)

Present: Alex Pujo, Pujo &amp; Associates, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury and an email of concerns from Linda Jones were acknowledged by the Board.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The requested modification has no aesthetic impact on the project.
- 2) Study the window proportion and detailing to be consistent with the original windows of the existing house.
- 3) Study the materiality and use of siding of the upper floor addition to be more consistent with the existing house.
- 4) Compatibility findings could not be made at this time.

Action: Aurell/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent).

**\* THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:36 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 4:52 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****4. 130 N CALLE CÉSAR CHÁVEZ****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-030-005  
Application Number: MST2010-00067  
Owner: Kenneth James, LLC  
Agent: Roy Harthorn  
Architect: Joseph Moticha

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" construction of 2,909 square feet of commercial buildings on an existing 1.88 acre lot which is currently developed with 21,355 square feet of commercial buildings. The "as-built" construction is composed of an addition of 250 square feet to building 1, a 575 square foot addition to building 17, a 720 square foot addition to building 18, a 520 square foot addition to building 19, a 133 square foot addition to building 20, a 1,186 square foot addition to building 28, and a 560 square foot canopy addition to building 15. The proposal includes permitting an "as-built" trellis and deck for the existing building 22, new accessible parking spaces, paths of travel, alterations to the site landscaping, and restriping the existing parking area. A total of 52 parking spaces are proposed on-site, which includes 12 parking spaces per an existing parking easement for the property at 208 N. Calle César Chávez. The proposed additions require Development Plan Approval by the ABR for 2,909 square feet of non-residential square footage.)

**(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval.)**

(4:52)

Present: Joseph Moticha, Architect; Roy Harthorn, Agent; and Kenneth James, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Provide drawings of all proposed additional elements such as HVAC screens, trash enclosures, electrical enclosures, etc.
- 2) Provide color and materials for the proposed painting and ramp elements.
- 3) Provide a replacement for the removed tree.
- 4) Provide a streetscape view of the street frontage along Calle Cesar Chavez.
- 5) Study the new accessible ramp at the deli and the interface with existing deck for a more appropriate solution.
- 6) Provide a proposed lighting plan with a cut sheet of the proposed fixtures.
- 7) Provide a cut sheet on the proposed bike racks.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent).

**ADJOURNMENT:**

**The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:33 p.m.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR****REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****A. 1298 LAS POSITAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-034  
Application Number: MST2010-00117  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to install a 525 square foot treatment pad and 4 gas extraction wells for landfill gas collection and control system at Elings Park North. The equipment will be enclosed within a 6 foot tall concrete masonry unit (CMU) wall with a stucco finish, with chain-link dual access gates, and screened with existing and new landscaping.)

**(Review After Final for revised gates and the addition of a cable fence on top of the retaining wall.)**

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

**Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****B. 3940 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-233-029  
Application Number: MST2010-00197  
Owner: Franchise Realty Interstate Corporation  
Architect: Chipman Adams

(Proposal to remove the existing roof top mechanical equipment and replace with new equipment, installation of new screen walls around the new mechanical equipment and replace and repair the existing flat roof with like material. The existing parapet roof is proposed to remain. The proposal will include abatement of enforcement case ENF2009-01328.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

**Continued one week with comments:**

- 1) Return with view angles from rear landscaped area and opposite side of State Street, and move the units accordingly to not be visible from these angles.
- 2) Provide curb detail and unit specifications with the height of the selected mechanical units.

**REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****C. 505 WENTWORTH AVE****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-143-010  
Application Number: MST2007-00345  
Owner: Wentworth Investors, LLC  
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza  
Landscape Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects

(Proposal to construct three new two story residential condominiums on an existing 6,500 square foot vacant lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal includes 2 two-bedroom units totaling 2,128 square feet and 1 one-bedroom unit totaling 1,042 square feet. An attached 438 square foot two-car garage is proposed for each unit. The proposal includes 256 cubic yards of grading.)

**(Final Approval of architecture was granted on July 6, 2010. Final Approval of landscaping is requested.)**

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

**Final Approval as submitted of landscaping.**

**NEW ITEM****D. 900 CALLE DE LOS AMIGOS****A-1/E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-440-016  
Application Number: MST2010-00201  
Agent: Studio 1030 Architects, Craig Burdick  
Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West

(Proposal for new site landscaping located at 1038 Calle Sastre, within the Valle Verde Retirement Community.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Continued one week.**

Item B on Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with additional landscaping review for Items C and D by **Chris Gilliland**.