



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Tuesday, September 8, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:
 CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT
 CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
 CAROL GROSS – PRESENT
 GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
 PAUL ZINK – ABSENT
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT UNTIL 4:58 P.M.
 KEITH RIVERA – PRESENT UNTIL 4:58 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT FROM 3:07 – 4:58 P.M.
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, September 3, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry, Mosel, Gross, Aurell, Rivera (present until 4:58 p.m.), and Gilliland (present until 4:58 p.m.).
Members absent: Zink.
Staff present: Jaime Limón (present from 3:07 – 4:58 p.m.), Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **August 24, 2009**, as amended.
Action: Rivera/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 31, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with the exception of landscaping for Items B and E, reviewed by **Carol Gross**.
Action: Aurell/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 8, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with additional landscaping review for Items A and B by **Carol Gross**.
Action: Aurell/Gross, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:
 - a) Board member Zink will be absent from the meeting.
 - b) Board member Sherry will be stepping down from agenda Item #2, City-wide.
 - c) Item #4, 140 S. Hope Avenue has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.
 - d) Board member Gilliland will be stepping down from Item #3, 421 E. Cota Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**1. 3222 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-332-031

Application Number: MST2009-00377

Owner: Anthony and Yani Osehan, Trustees

Applicant: Chris Sewell

(Proposal for a conceptual review for a minor facade remodel at the Agave Inn to include an "as-built" wood decorative element along the street facade and an "as-built" exterior color change.)

(Comments only; Conceptual Review.)

(3:09)

Present: Chris Sewell, Applicant.

Staff clarified that the grey sign background for "Days Inn" is pending revision by the applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board feel the proposed wood trellis element is unacceptable.
- 2) Propose a more acceptable facade based on the comments from the Board.
- 3) Choose a more earth tone color or texture for the concrete curve of the planter.

Action: Gross/Gilliland. Motion withdrawn.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board feel the proposed wood trellis element is an improvement to the existing building; however, the Board requests the applicant return with a solution to incorporate the proposed decorative wood trellis element at an additional location on the property to provide continuity.
- 2) Eliminate the portion of the trellis at the gable roof.
- 3) Return with a different proposal for the color of the window trim and at the guardrail on the two-story element to the rear of the property.
- 4) Resolve the corner condition, at the pedestrian entry, at the trellis element to resolve the discontinuity.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Provide an embellished landscape plan that would compliment the architecture.
- 2) Provide a more earth tone color or texture for the concrete planter or paint it the same color as the exterior plaster.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Mosel opposed, Zink absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. CITY-WIDE****ROW Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 000-000-0RW
 Application Number: MST2009-00367
 Applicant: HP Communications, Inc.
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal by NextG Networks for the installation of a new city-wide fiber optic cable, antennas, and equipment network system to be located within the City right-of-ways at 50 locations Citywide. 50 antennas will be located on existing utility poles located within city right-of-ways. Six locations are within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:49)

Present: Patrick Ryan, Outside Council; Heidi Payne, Project Manager, Sharon James, Program Control Director, and Chris Price, Representatives for NextG Networks.

Mr. Limón clarified the City's purview with regard to communication facilities and whether they meet the City's standards when proposed to be attached to City fixtures or placed within the pedestrian right of way. He also requested the Board review the proposed locations so as to minimize any adverse visual impacts.

Mr. Limón also read the September 2, 2009, comments and motion made by the Historic Landmarks Commission, and clarified the proposed shroud elements

Public comment opened at 4:10 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

The Chair also read an opposition letter with comments from Board member Paul Zink who was absent from the meeting.

Straw vote: How many of the Board would support any proposed equipment on the existing utility poles? 1/5 (failed/only 1 in favor).

Straw vote: How many of the Board would accept any proposal which includes ground furniture? 0/6 (failed/none in favor).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the provided mock-ups and the elimination of proposed equipment additions to City light fixtures; however a majority of the Board cannot accept the current proposal for equipment mounted on street utility poles and the Board cannot make the Findings of no Adverse Visual Impact.
- 2) The Board welcomes the applicant to return with a revised proposal with all equipment underground to minimize visual impact to the existing street utility poles.
- 3) Only one Board member could support a proposal that includes a minimal amount of equipment on street utility poles.
- 4) None the Board members found ground-mounted equipment acceptable.
- 5) The Board finds that the project as proposed greatly adds to the visual impacts of the community and does not find that this type of proposal is moving in a positive direction to minimize visual impacts and increase the aesthetics of the community.

Action: Mosel/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry stepped down, Zink absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 421 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-010
Application Number: MST2009-00250
Owner: Transition House
Architect: Mark Wienke
Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal to demolish the existing 7,566 square foot two-story mixed-use building and construct a new 9,142 square foot two-story mixed-use building, comprising of 8 affordable residential apartments (six, two-bedroom and two, three-bedroom units, totaling 7,208 square feet) and a 1,934 square foot day care center. The existing 14,080 square foot, two-story mixed use building, comprised of 8 residential apartments (6,175 square feet) and 7,905 commercial square feet, will remain. A total of 715 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The parcel will result in two two-story mixed-use buildings, with a combined total of 16 affordable apartments (13,383 residential square feet) and 9,839 commercial square feet, on a 42,221 square foot lot. A total of 37 uncovered parking spaces are proposed. The project received Staff Hearing Officer Approval on 8/12/09 (Resolution No. 070-09) for a requested zoning modification for a reduction of the required parking.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution 070-09.)

(4:58)

Present: Christine Pierron, Architect; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board feels that the project as proposed is adding to the starkness of the Cota Street elevation and requests the applicant to study the following:
 - a) Study a more celebrated entry paseo.
 - b) Study a central element to the building to break down the overall scale of the building.
 - c) Study the circular window forms for compatibility with the building's architectural style.
 - d) Study the plant-on plaster window sills for compatibility with the building's architectural style.
 - e) Study the shed roof element at the upper level porch above the main paseo entry facing the southeast.
 - f) Study the detailing of the upper level east-facing apartment balcony.
 - g) Study the placement, proportion, and sizes of all the windows on the south elevation.
- 2) The Board would like to see a subtle massaging of the building elements, such as staircase stepping or parapet walls, that would enhance the character of the building's architecture.

Action: Sherry/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland stepped down, Zink/Rivera absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 140 S HOPE AVE A-4****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-007

Application Number: MST2009-00394

Owner: Riviera Dairy Products

Architect: Arc Vision, Inc.

Applicant: Greg Miller

(Proposal for a facade remodel for the proposed new Game Stop at La Cumbre Plaza. New signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate sign application.)

(Project requires compliance with the La Cumbre Plaza Tenant Design Criteria.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 5:59 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 560 ARROYO AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-241-020
Application Number: MST2003-00822
Owner: Eric & Eve-Martee Andresen
Architect: William La Voie

(Proposal for additions to an existing two-story 1,774 square foot single-family residence on an 8,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The additions consist of enclosure of the existing 380 square foot porch, a 278 square foot basement addition, 152 square feet of deck additions, and improvements to retaining walls and a new 210 square foot carport.)

(Review After Final for alterations to the retaining wall and elimination of landscaping at the northern side of the retaining wall on the east elevation.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued one week with comments:

- 1) Revise grade to show correct wall height to not exceed 8-feet in height.
- 2) Provide planting opportunity to install planting per the original landscape plan.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 630 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-121-020
Application Number: MST2008-00120
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Thomas Moore

(This is a revised project for a Review After Final for proposed alterations to include 595 cubic yards of grading (imported fill) to comply with the base flood elevation requirements, the addition of new retaining walls along Ortega Street, new stairs and ramps, and the relocation of the trash enclosure and accessible parking spaces. The original proposal, which received final approval by ABR on 5/4/09, includes the construction of two one-bedroom apartments totaling 1,477 square feet in a one-story duplex configuration on an existing 13,200 square foot lot. The lot is currently developed with four three-bedroom apartments designed in two, two-story duplexes which total 4,740 square feet. The proposal will result in a total of 6 residential apartments to total 6,217 square feet and include 6 existing uncovered parking spaces. No alterations are proposed for the existing units. This is a Housing Authority project and all units will be maintained as apartments in the affordable apartments housing stock.)

(Review After Final to raise the building base flood elevation, the addition of new retaining walls, stairs, and ramps, and relocate the trash and accessible parking spaces.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar Review with comments:

- 1) Correct height of retaining walls on site plan (dimensions are incorrect on plans).
- 2) Retaining wall in front setback is stone veneer with stone cap and not to exceed 42-inches in height.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan at the area of work.
- 4) Relocation of trash enclosure is acceptable, however, revise the roof design of the trash enclosure and provide landscape screening.
- 5) Verify whether any existing trees and/or landscaping is proposed for removal.

NEW ITEM**C. 710 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-101-023
Application Number: MST2009-00383
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Dwight Gregory, AIA
Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal to demolish two existing trash enclosures and construct two new trash enclosures with a trellis above each enclosure. The proposal also includes the removal and replacement of the sidewalk and the addition of a new light fixture at the trash enclosure accessed from Olive Street. The property is currently developed with affordable multi-family residential apartments on a 1.6 acre lot.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely with the comment to provide architectural details and colors for the trash enclosure.

NEW ITEM**D. 825 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-023-011
Application Number: MST2009-00382
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Dwight Gregory, AIA
Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal to construct a new trellis over an existing trash enclosure located next to an existing four-plex. The property is currently developed with affordable multi-family residential apartments on a 28,674 square foot lot.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely with the comments:

- 1) Resolve site plan issues and include:
 - a) a complete site plan;
 - b) resolve the distance between the existing building and the proposed trash enclosure and whether a modification will be requested; and
 - c) label all proposed project elements (i.e. the trash enclosure doors, the trash enclosure foundation) as existing or proposed.
- 2) Verify whether the pedestrian access is required for the bulletin board and whether ADA access is required.
- 3) Use either tube steel or wood posts, not both.
- 4) Provide architectural details and colors for either option, but wood is preferred.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 29 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-123-014
Application Number: MST2009-00259
Owner: McDonald's Corporation
Architect: George Sladek

(Proposal for a façade remodel and a 300 square foot addition at the existing McDonald's Restaurant. The addition will result in a 4,497 square foot building (including the existing 1,305 square foot basement) on a 26,212 square foot lot in the C-2 Zone. The existing 47 parking spaces and all existing landscaping are to remain. Any proposed signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 6/29/09. Final Approval is requested.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Revise trellis details at entries to be more Spanish style in nature.
- 2) Colors as presented are acceptable; however if the applicant should choose to use white as the body color, this would be acceptable.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with additional landscaping review for Items A and B by **Carol Gross**.