



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 13, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:04 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair – PRESENT @ 5:53 P.M.
 CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
 CAROL GROSS – PRESENT @ 3:47 P.M.
 GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
 PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT
 KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p>Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, July 9, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry (present at 5:53 p.m.), Mosel, Zink, Gross (present at 3:47 p.m.), Aurell, Rivera, and Gilliland.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **June 29, 2009**, as amended.
Action: Zink/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Gross absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 6, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.
Action: Zink/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Gross absent).
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 13, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.
Action: Rivera/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Gross absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Pending schedule for PC and SHO agendas: PC has been cancelled for July 16th and SHO will be reviewing 617 Bradbury Avenue.
2. Ms. Bedard announced that Board member Sherry will be in attendance at the meeting at approximately 4:30 this afternoon.
3. Board member Gilliland announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #2, 421 E. Cota Street, and that he will be absent from the August 10th meeting.
4. Board member Rivera announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #3, 705 Norman Firestone Road.
5. Board member Mosel announced that he will be absent from the August 10 and August 17, 2009, meetings.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Member Rivera reported on the Upper State Street Study will return for review before the ABR in August 2009.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**1. 124 LOS AGUAJES AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-007
Application Number: MST2004-00725
Owner: Mark Edwards
Architect: Peter Ehlen
Agent: Fermina Murray
Agent: Compass Rose

(Proposal to demolish an existing 887 square foot single-family residence and a 400 square foot garage and to construct three new condominiums consisting of a 1,454 square foot two-bedroom residential unit, a 1,310 square foot one-bedroom unit and a 1,087 square foot one-bedroom residential unit. The project will result in a three-story 3,851 square foot structure with 1,120 square feet in garages on a 6,000 square foot lot located in the Non Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. A design waiver is requested to allow a garage to be located within three feet of the interior property line. Modifications are requested to allow encroachments into the required interior and front setbacks.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Coastal Development Permit, and zoning modifications.)

(3:14)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect; Mark Edwards, Owner; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:26 p.m.

Robert Maxim, opposition: expressed concerns regarding the size, bulk, and scale.

Kellam de Forest, opposition: expressed concerns regarding compatibility and size, bulk, and scale.

Public comment closed at 3:31 p.m.

Straw vote: How many of the Board feel that the project is ready to continue to the Planning Commission to resolve the requested modifications? 1/6 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board does not feel that the project has progressed enough for the project to move forward to the Planning Commission as some elements still needs to be resolved.
- 2) Refine the front elevation, the stairs at the first and second floor, and the glass pop-out elements at the third floor. The board felt that the floor area could be refined and reduced to be more efficient and therefore not need the second and third floor modifications.
- 3) Refine the stairway on the roof.
- 4) Minimize the trash bins.
- 5) Carry forward previous comments from the June 1, 2009 ABR motion: #3) The project needs further refinement of the architectural style, including reducing the amount of plaster on the front elevation, which is contributing to the front mass, bulk and scale; and #4) Create a more pedestrian-friendly street frontage.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/2/1. Motion carried. (Mosel/Manson-Hing opposed, Aurell abstained, Sherry absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 421 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-010
 Application Number: MST2009-00250
 Owner: Transition House
 Architect: Mark Wienke

(Proposal to demolish the existing 7,566 square foot two-story mixed-use building and construct a new 9,142 square foot two-story mixed-use building, comprising of 8 affordable residential apartments (six, two-bedroom and two, three-bedroom units, totaling 7,208 square feet) and a 1,934 square foot day care center. The existing 14,080 square foot, two-story mixed use building, comprised of 8 residential apartments (6,175 square feet) and 7,905 commercial square feet, will remain. A total of 715 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The parcel will result in two two-story mixed-use buildings, with a combined total of 16 affordable apartments (13,383 residential square feet) and 9,839 commercial square feet, on a 42,221 square foot lot. A total of 37 uncovered parking spaces are proposed. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification for a reduction of the required parking.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification.)

(4:21)

Present: Mark Wienke, Architect; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect; and Dan Gullett, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:**

COMPATIBILITY ANALYSIS:

- 1) The Board finds the project is in compliance with the City Charter, Municipal Code, and consistent with the Design Guidelines.
- 2) The project is compatible with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood.
- 3) The project is of an appropriate size, mass, bulk, height and scale.
- 4) The project is sensitive to adjacent landmarks and historic resources.
- 5) The project does not affect public views, and has an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
- 6) The Board feels there are no aesthetic impacts to the requested modification for a reduction in parking count, and the modification for the reduction in the ground floor patio sizes.

ARCHITECTURE:

- 1) The Board feels the direction for the architecture is successful and the Board looks forward to further refinements in architecture and landscaping.
- 2) Show how the storage issue will be addressed at the Day Care Center for exterior activities.
- 3) Provide shade for the outdoor area of the Day Care Center.
- 4) Study the articulation of the Day Care Center enclosure wall to respond to the concerns regarding mass, bulk and scale on the street.
- 5) Study incorporating masonry elements that would relate to the neighborhood context.

Action: Riviera/Zink, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Gross opposed, Gilliland stepped down, Sherry absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 705 NORMAN FIRESTONE RD

A-F/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003

Application Number: MST2008-00524

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Goleta Sanitary District

Architect: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 400 square foot pump house, an 8-foot tall block wall that encompasses a 57 foot by 80 foot area around the pump house, and new landscaping on the City Airport property. The pump house will provide a permanent replacement of the forced main at the Firestone Road Lift Station. Project requires Planning Commission Review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(5:08)

Present: Jennifer Welch, Agent, Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.; Katie Poitress, Civil Engineer; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The project is ready for Preliminary and Final Approval.
- 2) The plans are to reflect the exterior metal work to include the pipe color as “*Mexican Tea*” and the exhaust fan and louver color are to be included on the plans as the “*REL*” color.

Action: Zink/Gross, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera stepped down, Sherry absent).

**** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:22 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 5:53 P.M. ****

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

4. 3855 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 051-010-010
 Application Number: MST2009-00210
 Owner: Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara
 Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC
 Applicant: The Vons Companies, Inc.
 Architect: Courtney & Le Architects
 Agent: Little Div Architectural Consulting

(Proposal for an exterior facade remodel at the Vons in the La Cumbre Plaza. The proposal includes re-striping parking stalls, the addition of accessible stalls and pathways per city requirements, new roof top equipment, exterior lighting, and landscaping.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with La Cumbre Plaza Tenant Design Criteria.)

(5:53)

Present: Winnie Bautista, Little Diversified Architectural Consulting; and Brian Brad, Realtor for Vons Stores; and Honda Cherng, The Vons Companies Inc.

Public comment opened at 6:03 p.m.

Chuck Davis, Macerich La Cumbre, LLC, expressed support for approval and for the project to move forward.

Public comment closed at 6:06 p.m.

Straw vote: How many of the Board would prefer the wood eave corbels? (majority passed).

Straw vote: How many of the Board would prefer the refined shed roof option? (majority passed).

Straw vote: How many of the Board would prefer the stone infill between the columns, column caps, and the plaster columns to extend to the ground? (majority passed)

Straw vote: How many of the Board would prefer the curved wrought iron gate option rather than the straight gate option? (majority passed).

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with conditions:

- 1) Applicant to return with a complete set of architectural details for Final Approval.
- 2) The Board prefers Option 2 of the shed roof.
- 3) The Board prefers Option 1 detailing of the plaster columns with the integration of the stone, and the use of stone planters on both sides of the entry way.
- 4) The Board prefers Option 2 use of the wood eave corbels at the roof.
- 5) The Board prefers the arched top wrought iron (curved) gate as proposed at the June 29, 2009, Architectural Board of Review meeting.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Staff Notes: Staff reported that the applicant was already informed of the possibility that it may take several successive Consent Reviews before Final Approval is given.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 120 S HOPE AVE H-123

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
 Application Number: MST2008-00550
 Owner: Patricia S. Nettleship, Trustee
 Owner: The Macerich Company
 Applicant: The Conceptual Motion Company
 Business Name: Yves Delorme

(Proposal for a facade remodel to an existing tenant space (H123) at the La Cumbre Plaza. The proposal includes a new entry element, new paint, shutter detailing, and awnings.)

(Project requires compliance with La Cumbre Plaza Tenant Design Criteria.)

(6:31)

Present: Edward DeVicinte, The Conceptual Motion Company.

Public comment opened at 6:39 p.m.

Craig Reynolds, Macerich Company, expressed support for approval and for the project to move forward.

Public comment closed at 6:40 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary and Final Approval with the condition that the Applicant is to provide a hardy plant selection for the in-ground planter.

Action: Aurell/Riviera, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

6. 3759 STATE ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-053
 Application Number: MST2009-00227
 Owner: Regency Realty Group, Inc
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
 Landscape Architect: Guillermo Gonzalez
 Business Name: Whole Foods

(Proposal for a façade remodel for three existing commercial buildings in the C-P/SD-2 Zone. The proposal includes the addition of an outdoor seating area, a new trellis and awnings, grading and re-striping the existing 258 space parking lot, ADA improvements, 37 bicycle spaces, and landscape alterations, including the addition of bio-swales. All of the existing trees are proposed to remain.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 6/1/2009. Final Approval is requested.)

(6:49)

Public comment opened at 7:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Adam Cunningham, Cearnal Andrulaitis.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:ARCHITECTURE FOR WHOLE FOODS BUILDING:

- 1) At the stone veneer columns, provide traditional stone cap details with minimum 4-inch vertical height thickness.
- 2) At the plaster wall caps on (transformer enclosure) Detail A, Drawing A1.7E, provide a stone cap to the wall that has a sandstone veneer finish.
- 3) Add all exterior wood trellis elements.
- 4) Provide all hidden connections at the trellis structures.
- 5) Add all stone veneer work and provide traditional stone veneer jointing with no corner miters.
- 6) Eliminate the existing deteriorating wood glue LAM beam on the west end and a portion of the south side of the Whole Foods building.
- 7) Regarding Drawing A1.0E, correct the stone wainscot to a 4-foot height.

ARCHITECTURE FOR BUILDING #1:

- 1) Regarding Detail #10 and #5, Sheet #A501, revise the third story metal finish pilaster to the windows to have all equal dimensions.
- 2) On the third floor, behind the stairwell on the west elevation, paint the drywall behind the exterior glazing at the stairwell black in color.

ARCHITECTURE FOR BUILDING #2:

- 1) The Board had no comments regarding Building #2.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Replace all the Sycamore trees with Olive trees.
- 2) Replace all the Loquat trees, especially by the transformer, with Chinese Fringe trees.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 7:54 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****A. 1309 BLANCHARD ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-391-034
 Application Number: MST2008-00535
 Owner: Jose Luis Gonzalez
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct a new 600 square foot, two-story, one-bedroom accessory dwelling unit with an attached 447 square foot two-car garage; a new 223 square foot second story addition, with a 62 square foot second story deck, to the existing 967 square foot main residential unit on a 5,125 square foot lot in the R-2 Zone. The proposal includes demolition of an existing 241 square foot studio unit and an existing detached 298 square foot, legal non-conforming, one-car garage. The proposal will include a total of three on site parking spaces, provided in a two-car garage and one uncovered tandem space. Also proposed is 200 cubic feet of lockable storage space, for each unit, located inside the proposed two-car garage.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 2/9/09. Final Approval of Architecture and Landscaping is requested.)

Continued one week to Consent Calendar with comments:**ARCHITECTURE:**

1. Revise the roof tile to be a two-piece mission tile to match the existing house.
2. Provide a sectional garage door with a more wood and plank Spanish style.
3. The proposed light fixtures are unacceptable. Propose new light fixtures at the garage.

LANDSCAPING:

1. Study paving and planting materials between the existing and proposed residence.
2. Add one canopy tree in the front yard.
3. Substitute the rear tree for one double trunk palm tree.
4. Provide a method for a car-stop for the uncovered parking space.
5. Add a note for lawn rehabilitation in the parkway.

NEW ITEM**B. 322 LADERA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-033
 Application Number: MST2009-00306
 Owner: Peoples Self-Help Housing Corp.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design

(Proposal to resurface the existing 40-unit multi-family residential apartment parking lot with asphalt and enhanced concrete paving, in an 8 x 8 slate pattern, and the addition of a new 3-foot landscape planter and plantings along the east property line. The proposal also includes the removal and replacement of four Brisbane box 15-gallon trees. The existing 45 parking spaces will remain.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Preliminary Approval and Final Approval as noted on plans:

1. Introduce three (3) 1-gallon vines at the existing wrought iron fence along Ladera Street.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.