



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, August 10, 2016**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
ANTHONY GRUMBINE  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

JASON DOMINGUEZ

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian  
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician  
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC) by clicking on Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:38 p.m.), La Voie (absent 2:08 p.m. to 2:55 p.m.), Mahan, Murray (absent 2:08 p.m. to 2:52 p.m.), Orías, Suding, and Veyna (at 1:32 p.m.)

Members absent: Shallanberger

Staff present: Limón, Hernandez (until 3:38 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

## B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 27, 2016, as amended.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 5/0/2. (Drury and Veyna abstained. Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Commissioner Drury requested to join the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program ad hoc subcommittee.
2. Mr. Limón announced that he will staff the AUD subcommittee and will schedule a meeting.
3. Commissioners La Voie and Murray announced that they will step down on Item 5, 15 E. De La Guerra Street.
4. Mr. Eng announced that Commissioner Shallanberger will be absent.
5. Chair Suding reopened announcements to note that Peter Becker, Santa Barbara architect, recently passed away, stating that the Commission appreciated working with him throughout the years.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Orías reported on the joint meeting of the ABR and HLC on July 28 to discuss the draft wireless ordinance (Commissioners La Voie and Drury also attended). The ability of design review boards/commissions to ask applicants to restudy alternative locations through an independent consultant review was discussed; Commissioner Orías asked the HLC to bear this in mind during review of these projects.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM****1. 208 WEST QUINTO ST**

**(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-022-012

Owner: Larry S. Moriarty

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider designating the Bitterly House located at 208 West Quinto Street as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:41 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-6 to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Bitterly House located at 208 West Quinto Street.

**Action:** Mahan/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

#### **2. 402 PLAZA RUBIO**

**(1:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-001

Owner: SWHI, LLC

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider designating the Lewis House located at 402 Plaza Rubio as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if the screening wall in front of the house is original.

Public comment closed at 1:45 p.m.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-7 to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Lewis House located at 402 Plaza Rubio.

**Action:** La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

#### **3. 424 PLAZA RUBIO**

**(1:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-005

Owner: SWHI, LLC

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider designating the Spoor House located at 424 Plaza Rubio as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked why these houses are being considered for Structure of Merit designation and not as City Landmarks, and whether a collective historic district has been considered.

Ms. Hernandez replied that a historic district is planned for this area; in the meantime, the owner is requesting Structure of Merit designation in order to pursue extensive rehabilitation under the Mills Act.

Public comment closed at 1:50 p.m.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-8 to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spoor House located at 424 Plaza Rubio.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

#### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

##### **4. 219 WEST ARRELLAGA ST**

**(2:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-221-003

Owner: Thomas Whitaker

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider designating the Fredericks House located at 219 West Arrellaga Street as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-9 to hold a Public Hearing on September 7, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Fredericks House located at 219 West Arrellaga Street.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:55 P.M. TO 2:08 P.M. \*\***

#### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

##### **5. 15 E DE LA GUERRA ST**

**C-2 Zone**

**(2:05)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-027

Application Number: MST2016-00343

Owner: Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation

Architect: William R. La Voie

(Proposal for a six-foot high fence enclosure of the Casa De La Guerra courtyard, including fence gates and piers with new guardrails at the porch. This property is a California Historic Landmark, listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and a designated City Landmark: "De La Guerra Adobe/Casa De La Guerra.")

**(Project Design Approval is requested.)**

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: William La Voie, Architect; and Michael Imwalle, Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation

Chair Suding read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory statement:

The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present or explain architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Commissioner La Voie is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of his client.

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

1. Lanny Ebenstein expressed concern about the proposal, stating that there is no demonstrated need for a fence, and that piers and wrought iron are incompatible with this location.
2. Kellam de Forest inquired why a fence is necessary and if there are alternative barriers that would not mar the cultural landscape.
3. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Fran Galt, Susan Chamberlin, and Paulina Conn.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Grumbine disclosed his participation on a subcommittee for the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation and that he has previously reviewed this proposal. He stated that his review at the HLC would not pose a conflict of interest.

Public comment closed at 2:22 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Commission requests a focused letter report addressing the potential impact of this change to the resource; the letter report should incorporate historical photographs of fences at this location. In addition, the Commission requests a report explaining the problem that necessitates a fence.
2. The transparency of the fence is preferable to a solid wall.
3. There should be less sophistication to the fence, especially in the design of the spears; explore round shafts for the spears instead of square.
4. The capitals on the piers should be more massive.
5. Simplify the fence posts.
6. Study a material other than iron; if iron is used, it should appear more rustic and hand-crafted.
7. The spears as proposed may present a safety liability.
8. Gates should be open during daytime hours for public access to the site.
9. The proposed low stone wall is appropriate.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Murray stepped down. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:49 P.M. TO 2:52 P.M. \*\***

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****6. 1130 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(2:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-020  
 Application Number: MST2013-00237  
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.  
 Architect: Kupiec Architects  
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio  
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Art

(Proposed addition and alterations to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art, consisting of a 7,944 net new square foot one- and two-story addition [primarily within the existing building volume] and the renovation of an existing four-story 64,511 net square foot building. Also proposed are a new approximately 1,420 unenclosed square feet public rooftop pavilion, garden and terrace area with associated access elevator and stairway, and new rooftop mechanical equipment and skylights. A new art receiving facility will add 402 square feet to the building footprint, and a 5-foot long low curb wall at the northerly corner of the building will encroach onto City Central Library grounds. Miscellaneous site structure demolition will occur to support implementation of the proposed design. Two oak trees are proposed for removal, with replacement of one oak tree on site and two others off site. A new electrical power transformer would be located on City property at Public Parking Lot No. 7. The net new square feet of new floor area will result in 72,455 net square feet of development. Construction staging would occur on the adjacent City Library property. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Santa Barbara Museum of Art.")

**(Review After Final is requested to increase the floor area of the rooftop pavilion by 414 net square feet and to allow for two new accessible restrooms and storage space on the east side of the structure. A revision to the roof material includes a "cool roof" above the mansard roof line and barrel clay tile to match the existing museum roof. Project was last reviewed on April 6, 2016.)**

Actual time: 2:52 p.m.

Present: Bob Kupiec and Dale Suttle, Kupiec Architects; and Trish Allen, Applicant

Staff comments: Marck Aguilar, Project Planner, provided background on the project. The applicant is proposing additional square footage on the rooftop pavilion. If the HLC grants an approval, staff requests that it be conditioned upon a Substantial Conformance Determination by staff.

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted with condition:**

1. This approval is conditioned upon a Substantial Conformance Determination by staff.

Action: Grumbine/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****7. 821 CORONEL ST****E-1 Zone**

**(2:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-243-013  
Application Number: MST2016-00292  
Owner: Adam Ross  
Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal to construct a 589 square foot first-story addition, a 527 square foot second-story addition, and a new 500 square foot two-car garage at an existing 2,450 square foot single-family residence. The project includes 108 square feet of covered porches and 27 square feet of storage. The proposed total of 4,093 square feet of development on a 16,970 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This structure is a designated City Landmark: "Hunt-Stambach House.")

**(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment. This is a one-time concept review to explore design alternatives including the siting of the new additions.)**

Actual time: 3:03 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Architect; and Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that a draft of the Historic Structures Report has been prepared, but there were zoning concerns about the proposed design. Consequently, several design options will be presented today, and after the HLC review, the report will evaluate the chosen direction for the project. Ms. Hernandez also reminded the Commission that this property has a Mills Act contract.
2. Mr. Eng stated that the project as proposed was not approvable according to zoning standards. The architect has presented alternatives and is looking for comments about a direction that would meet zoning and HLC standards.

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m.

Kellam de Forest posed several questions about the original location and configuration of the house and the boundaries of the Landmark designation.

Public comment closed at 3:12 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. The project is not approvable as presented because it diminishes and obscures the historic resource.
2. The carriage house addition is too large; it should be more subordinate.
3. Any addition should be sensitive to the historic resource.
4. The architecture needs to be simplified; explore carriage house-style architecture.
5. The "hyphen" (as the Commission described the footprint of the proposed addition, comprising the addition that is connected to the main building by a narrow link) should be a hyphen as proposed in the first option and not connected by a large room as proposed in option 2.
6. Try to enhance the entry experience to the existing resource's main entry, in response to the apparent dominance of the new addition's entry in relation to that of the original Landmarked building.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:38 P.M. TO 3:44 P.M. \*\***

## **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

### **8. 634 ANACAPA ST**

**C-M Zone**

**(3:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-001  
 Application Number: MST2015-00300  
 Owner: Georgetta Craviotto, Trustee  
 Owner: Craviotto Primo Investments, LLC  
 Applicant: Anatega Partners, LLC  
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish two existing commercial buildings totaling 5,520 square feet and an existing 1,850 square foot single-family residential unit and detached garage to construct a new three-story mixed-use building on two lots [630 and 634 Anacapa Street] totaling 28,145 square feet. The new project consists of 4,955 square feet [net] of ground-level commercial space. Residential space is comprised of 8 studios, 13 one-bedroom units, and 9 two-bedroom units for a total of 30 units. A parking garage accessed from Ortega Street will provide 32 parking spaces. This is an Average Unit Density [AUD] Incentive Program Priority Housing project with a proposed density of 63 dwelling units per acre [du/ac] and an average unit size of 733 square feet. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a zoning modification to allow the project to exceed the allowed density.)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 046-16. Project was last reviewed on June 29, 2016.)**

Actual time: 3:44 p.m.

Present: Jeff Hornbuckle, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Martha Degasis, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, on behalf of case planner Jessica Grant, provided background on the project and stated that if the project receives approval, staff requests that the existing Conditions of Approval be included, as well as an added condition about rental housing and a finding for CEQA exemption.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with comments and conditions, and continued indefinitely to the Full Commission:**

1. The corrugated metal siding as presented is not approvable in the El Pueblo Viejo district.
2. The commemorative anvil in the courtyard is approvable.
3. The iron horizontal awnings are too contemporary.
4. Columns on the trellises are too slender; the trellises are too contemporary and need more detail.
5. The fenestration on the corner half arch needs more traditional detailing.
6. The west elevation storefront window openings need a corbel and/or other detailing.
7. The scrolled privacy walls should be thicker than the proposed 12 inches.
8. The corbels on the garage entrance should be as thick as the wall to which they are attached.

9. Study sun protection on the west and north elevations.
10. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
11. This approval is subject to the Conditions of Approval imposed by the Staff Hearing Officer on August 3, 2016.
12. This approval is also conditioned upon the following: The owner of real property developed with Rental Housing in the Priority Housing Overlay must record a written covenant, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney, by which the owner agrees to maintain the rental housing use for as long as the property is developed and maintained at the incentive densities provided in SBMC Section 28.20, Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

#### **9. 321 E CABRILLO BLVD**

**P-R/SD-3 Zone**

**(4:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-011  
 Application Number: MST2016-00298  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Nathalie Gensac

(Proposal for temporary artwork to be installed on approximately 225 linear feet of existing wood fencing around a construction site at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. This proposal has been reviewed by Visual Arts in Public Places.)**

Actual time: 4:22 p.m.

Present: Nathalie Gensac, Media4Good, Inc./Youth Interactive

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

1. Kate Schwab, of Downtown Santa Barbara, spoke in support.
2. Sarah Rubin, Executive Director of the County Arts Commission, spoke in support.
3. Robert Adams, Chair of the Arts Advisory Committee, spoke in support.
4. Kellam de Forest asked how long the murals will be displayed, and if they will be reused or available elsewhere for public view afterward.

Public comment closed at 4:36 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:**

1. The Commission commends Youth Interactive, the Fess Parker family, and the Mayor for their efforts on this project.
2. The murals shall be bordered by a four-inch wide flat black frame.
3. Acknowledging the one-year limitation on approvals typically granted for temporary public art projects, the Commission grants this project an approval of three years; a new approval will be required should the murals be displayed beyond three years.

Action: La Voie/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:43 P.M. \*\***