



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 13, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
 MICHAEL DRURY
 ANTHONY GRUMBINE
 WILLIAM LA VOIE
 BILL MAHAN
 FERMINA MURRAY
 JUDY ORÍAS
 JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
 NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:36 p.m.; absent from 1:47 to 1:50 p.m.), Suding, and Veyna (at 1:31 p.m.)

Members absent: Grumbine

Staff present: Limón (until 1:58 p.m.), Hernandez (until 1:55 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 29, 2016, as presented.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 4/0/2. (Murray [Items 1-4] and Drury abstained. Grumbine, Shallenberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Item 4, 2112 Santa Barbara Street, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.
- b. Commissioner Grumbine will be absent from today's meeting.
- c. A joint ABR and HLC meeting is requested and tentatively scheduled for July 28 or 29 to discuss the City's wireless antenna ordinance. Staff will send a meeting invitation.
- d. The Chair of the Planning Commission (PC) has extended an invitation to ABR and HLC members to attend the PC meeting of July 21 to discuss the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. The purpose of the meeting is to review whether objectives are being met and whether amendments should be considered.

Commissioners Drury, Mahan, Orías, and Shallenberger indicated they would attend.

- e. At the Planning Commission meeting of July 7, the AUD project at 1032 Santa Barbara Street was reviewed. The PC provided comments in response to HLC concerns about parking, density, setbacks, and support services. The project will return to the HLC.

Commissioner Mahan suggested that when forwarding projects to the Planning Commission, the HLC should be very precise in its comments.

Mr. Limón added that the PC questioned why the project was forwarded. Staff has encouraged the HLC to make decisions about AUD projects and request changes from the applicant if the HLC has concerns about any design elements in its purview.

2. Mr. Limón announced that a large-scale poster of City sites and landmarks, designed by Steve Hausz and produced by the Santa Barbara Conservancy, was posted in the Community Development lobby.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Paseo Nuevo Subcommittee meeting of June 30, stating that the design team is making progress; with the exception of a few elements, the design is ready for review by the Full Commission.

Commissioner La Voie agreed that great strides have been made toward an approvable design.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

1. 1116 GARDEN ST

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-172-001

Owner: Kathy Spieler, Paul A. Spieler, and Cory Spieler

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on July 27, 2016 to consider designating the Queen Anne style house constructed c. 1880 located at 1116 Garden Street as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Chair Suding expressed appreciation to the owners for their restoration efforts for this building.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-4 to hold a Public Hearing on July 27, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the house located at 1116 Garden Street.

Action: Murray/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

2. 1919 SANTA BARBARA ST

(1:50) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-381-007

Owner: Julia Collier Emerson

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on July 27, 2016 to consider designating the Craftsman style house constructed in 1903 located at 1919 Santa Barbara Street as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner La Voie commented that characterizing this building as a hybrid Craftsman style is perhaps more appropriate and asked that this be addressed in the Staff Report.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-5 to hold a Public Hearing on July 27, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the house located at 1919 Santa Barbara Street.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 541 MOUNTAIN DR

A-1 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-103-007
Application Number: MST2016-00255
Owner: Friden Family Trust
Applicant: Greg Aragon

(Proposal for zoning modification to demolish the existing 417 square foot garage, construct a new 493 square foot garage, and relocate the garage door to meet the requirement for two covered parking spaces. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow the new garage to be located within the required front setback. This proposal is exempt from Design Review and will abate all prior zoning and building violations.)

(Review of Phase 1 Archeology Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek; and Greg Aragon, Applicant

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.
Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST

E-1 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-008
Application Number: MST2016-00297
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Applicant: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to permit two new wrought iron driveway gates at Santa Barbara Street and one new wood gate on Padre Street. This is a City Landmark: "Hodges House.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Applicant is requesting an exception to the fence and screen height standards per SBMC 28.87.170. Determination required for consistency with neighborhood character.)

Item postponed at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item.
Action: Orías/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 414 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-027
 Application Number: MST2016-00190
 Owner: John & Martha Peterson
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 3,200 square foot commercial building and construct a new four-story, mixed-use development with 4,002 square feet of commercial area, and 22 rental units on a 15,823 square foot parcel. The residential component is being developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program and proposes a unit mix comprising one studio unit, 17 one-bedroom units, and 4 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 800 square feet. There will be a total of 26 parking spaces located within a ground-floor garage. The project requires a Concept Review by Planning Commission for the AUD development in the priority housing overlay and on a lot greater than 15,000 square feet in size.)

(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on June 1, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:07 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Brad Vernon, and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLP

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** **Continued two weeks with comments:**
1. The Commission feels this is a nice project and appreciates the applicant's response to comments.
 2. Study the use of awnings on the south elevation to add more variety.
 3. The Commission appreciates the minimizing of the fourth-floor massing.
 4. Consider transposing the common open space and Unit 301 to give the former a better view of the ocean.
 5. Continue to develop the fenestration, attempting to add more variety and poetry.
 6. Study the depth and interplay of the windows and shade and shadow.
 7. The second-floor awnings on the west elevation should not be continuous.
 8. Pay attention to the corner view from Chapala Street looking north; make it a signature, special element.
 9. Show more of the pedestrian experience from across Chapala Street, paying attention to the scale.
 10. The massing is appropriate to the district and neighborhood.
 11. The two massing blocks at the Chapala Street elevation appear too modern.
 12. Study the interplay and transparency of the bridge over the automobile entrance/exit, as well as the massing behind.
 13. Show the model drawings without landscape.
 14. Landscape trees should be tracery trees, not necessarily palm trees.

Action: Shallanberger/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:45 P.M. TO 2:49 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone****(2:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
Application Number: MST2016-00284
Owner: American Tradition, LLC
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
Architect: Mike Niemann

(One-time concept review of a new proposal for a 43-room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard [APN 017-680-009], and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez [APN 017-113-020]. The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District [EPV] and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site and will comprise no less than 26 rooms in two-story attached casitas and no less than 17 rooms configured within a two to three-story "Inn" building complex located along the northern property line. The proposed square footage on this lot is 82,723 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 2:49 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant; and Mike Niemann, Architect

Staff comments: Allison De Busk, Project Planner, stated that there is an approved project still valid at this site; the applicant has received a Development Agreement that extends the approval and provides the opportunity to pursue a smaller project.

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the well done, comprehensive presentation.
2. The opening up of public views to the mountains is commended.
3. The architecture at the intersection of Calle Cesar Chavez and Cabrillo Boulevard needs to have more importance; the corner and Chase Palm Park should have a civic interface.
4. The massing models as shown will be difficult to translate into El Pueblo Viejo-appropriate architecture.
5. Horizontal, large massing can be problematic; the massing character does not fit El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines. Use variety instead of repetitiveness.
6. Study reflecting the curvilinear character of the Cabrillo/Chase Palm Park sidewalk.
7. Study the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines, Olmsted Plan for Cabrillo Boulevard, and the Cabrillo Bath Pavilion for inspiration.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:24 P.M. ****