



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 23, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:33 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Murray (until 6:13 p.m.), Orías, Shallanberger (at 1:31 p.m., until 4:00 p.m.), Suding, and Veyna

Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 9, 2016, with correction.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that Commissioner Murray will leave at 5:45 p.m.

2. Commissioner Murray and Commissioner Orías requested that staff set a meeting with City Council or the City Attorney to start work on the implementation of the Historic Element of the General Plan. Commissioner Murray urged sending a letter immediately, in advance of the upcoming joint Planning Commission and City Council meeting, to convey that this is a high priority for the Commission.

Later, Commissioner Murray announced that the Pearl Chase Society 2016 Historic Homes Tour will take place on May 15.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 200 HELENA AVE****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-052-018
 Application Number: MST2015-00289
 Owner: Funk Zone Parking, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,663 square foot, one-story commercial building [900 square feet permitted and 763 square feet unpermitted] and to construct a new 2,833 square foot, two-story commercial building with a third-story rooftop patio. An existing permitted 147 square foot detached wood storage shed will be demolished. The proposal will include a new parking lot with nine parking spaces, bicycle parking, and landscape improvements, and a valet parking lot. New sidewalk, curb, and utility improvements are also proposed. Requires Staff Hearing Officer Review of a Development Plan and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. Specifically, he agrees that an archaeologist should monitor earth-

moving activities associated with the proposed construction, given the property's location where significant archaeological deposits may be present.

Public comment opened at 1:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Orías emphasized the importance of carrying forth the conditions outlined on page 8-1.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Murray/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 922 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(1:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-023

Application Number: MST2016-00050

Owner: Ronald & Nancy Hays, Trustees

Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal for fire repairs with interior and the following minor exterior alterations to the rear of an existing commercial/office building: a new 192 square foot, second-story rear deck and new 90 square foot detached storage shed. This building is a Designated City Landmark: Nardo Building.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone and Heather McDaniel.)

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. He agrees that some possibility exists for the existence of remains of historic structures on the property, and if present, these have the potential of being quite significant.

Public comment opened at 1:43 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comment:

1. Include a photograph of the State Street façade.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FULL BOARD – FINAL REVIEW HEARING**3. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL****E-1 Zone****(1:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: SGN2015-00132
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Heidi Jones

(This is a revised project description. Review of a wayfinding sign program for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. A total of 354.7 square feet of signage is proposed throughout the Museum property. Proposed signage consists of identifying, directional, and promotional ground, hanging, wall, pole, and banner signs. All signage is non-illuminated. Exceptions are requested to allow pole signs, banner signs, and to exceed 90 square feet of signage on the Puesta del Sol frontage. This location is a Designated Structure of Merit.)

**** The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. ****

b) (Exception findings required. Project last reviewed on November 11, 2015.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; Wayne Hunt, Hunt Design; Heidi Jones, SEPPS; and Barbara Barker, Project Manager, Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History

****The Commission recessed from 2:17 to 2:20 p.m. to view the proposed colors in the sunlight. ****

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn, resident, expressed concern about the color of the signs. She stated that the location map and the inventory are not consistent. She is opposed to the banners in the hallway and most of the proposed signage in the parking lot. Chair Suding also acknowledged Ms. Conn's e-mailed comments of concern.
2. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Fran Galt.
3. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Kellam de Forest.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Roseanne Crawford.
5. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Barbara Lyon.
6. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Susan Chamberlin.

Public comment closed at 2:29 p.m.

Commissioner comments: The Commission in its majority expressed appreciation for the reduction in the amount of signage with this proposal.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The design approach is too contemporary; make the signage look old, to be more in keeping with the building, and minimize the amount of signage surface.
2. Reduce the width of the announcement banners on the front of the building to be more appropriate to the wall space.
3. The use of horizontal banners is not appropriate to this style of architecture.
4. Reduce the size of the wayfinding signage in front of the building and construct in sheet metal.
5. Interior wall signs should be wood.
6. The pole signs as presented are not acceptable; an increased number of reduced-size signs distributed throughout the parking lot may be appropriate.
7. The Commission favors the darker red color (Indian Red Oxide) presented on the sample board.
8. The Columbus Regular and Myriad Pro Regular fonts are appropriate.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Motion: To postpone the item.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:27 P.M. TO 3:32 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 32-36 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(2:40) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-281-028
 Application Number: MST2016-00076
 Owner: Carrillo Pacific, LLC
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP
 Applicant: Laura Benard

(Proposal to demolish an existing 5,917 square foot one-story building [former Greyhound Station] and all associated site development and construct a total of 10,900 square feet of new non-residential buildings, including a two-story 9,972 square foot retail/office building, and a one-story, 928 square foot retail building. The application requires a lot merger and Planning Commission review of a Development Plan. A total of four covered and 11 uncovered on-site parking spaces are provided for the proposed 19,468 net square foot parcel located in the 100% Parking Zone of Benefit. The proposal also includes outdoor patios and revised site landscaping, including the removal of two existing trees.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental analysis and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Laura Benard, The Cearnal Collective, LLP

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that parking design issues exist that need to be resolved with Transportation, but these can be dealt with at a later review level.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The scale of the building and fenestration are acceptable.
2. The Commission suggests enlarging the finial and studying the slope of the roof to increase the amount of exposed tile area.
3. The south elevation needs to be simplified in some way; study the horizontal awnings and their connections to the wall.
4. The proportions of the round tower should be studied, though the Commission is fairly satisfied with the round element.
5. The scalloped stair railing should be thicker.
6. The trash enclosure should be restudied and enhanced.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 8/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

5. 1118 E CABRILLO BLVD

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(3:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00248
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jill Zachary
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(This is a City Structure of Merit: "Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa." The proposal includes façade repair/renovation, changes to existing windows and doors, structural upgrades, and upgrading of mechanical, plumbing, and electrical systems. Also proposed are site improvements including: improvements to meet accessibility [ADA] requirements, restoration of the beach-level promenade, installation of a boardwalk connecting the promenade to the beach, installation of a walkway along the west parking lot, renovation of site landscaping, addition of new outdoor showers, replacement of playground equipment, restoration of the stoa [covered walkway], removal of approximately 16 trees, relocation of approximately 32 trees, and 8 new trees, enlargement of the trash enclosure, and addition of a mechanical equipment enclosure. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

**** The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. ****

b) (Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 014-15. Project last reviewed on October 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:59 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Associate Planner, Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara; and Dawn Ziemer, Mark McFarlin, and Julie Wendt, Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

**** The Commission recessed from 4:17-4:19 p.m. to view the proposed colors in the sunlight. ****

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments, with landscape and other remaining details continued indefinitely:

1. The Commission commends the applicant for a sensitive and excellent design.
2. The proposed colors are acceptable and commended.
3. Emulate the West Beach harbor sea wall.
4. Restudy the posts on the trash enclosure to be more substantial from the ground to the eave.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Letter Report prepared by Alexandra Cole. The report concludes the following meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards and will not have a negative impact on the resource: 1) north elevation revisions at Cabrillo Blvd. entrance; 2) lowering of portico ceiling and addition of patio heaters; 3) addition of promenade gates; 4) addition of electrical transformer; 5a) alteration of roof line at enclosed terrace, 5b) alterations to windows & doors at enclosed & outdoor terraces, 5c) alteration of second-floor roof; 6) promenade wall; and 7) tile roof at trash enclosure.)

Actual time: 4:36 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she reviewed the addendum report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the CEQA guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comment:

1. The Commission commends the historian for her work.

Action: Murray/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**6. 530 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00006
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Owner: Post Oak, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to renovate a historic commercial building for commercial/office use. The project would preserve the existing 3,810 square foot building while adding a 2,565 square foot second story. Four parking spaces are required. The proposal includes reconfiguring the parking lot for 11 spaces and installing new landscaping. A total of 2,565 square feet of nonresidential additions are proposed. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Dal Pozzo's Tire Corporation Building.)

**** The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. ****

b) (Review After Final for changing the hardscape to permeable paving, reducing the storefront and adding a structural wall, and changing the second-floor balcony doors to windows. Project last reviewed on November 4, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills and Ed de Vicente, DMHA; and Courtney Miller, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners favor a darker color for the permeable pavers? 4/4

Motion: Approval of Review After Final, with the following details continued two weeks to the Consent calendar:

1. The north wall of the trash enclosure shall be masonry with a stucco finish to match the building.
2. Add engaged pier on the shear wall, matching the existing pattern.
3. The landscape plan and paving materials are acceptable as proposed.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Letter Report prepared by Alexandra Cole. The report concludes that the change of hardscape to permeable pavers, the removal of the second-floor patio on Cota Street and the change of French doors to windows, and the reduction of the storefront and the addition to a new structural wall on the west elevation meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not have a negative impact to the resource.)

Actual time: 4:55 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she reviewed the addendum report. She initially had a concern about the permeable pavers but thinks the applicant has resolved it well. She agrees with the conclusion of the report that the project meets the CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:06 P.M. TO 5:12 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL

E-1 Zone

(4:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00511
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Nat History
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. It also includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a Designated Structure of Merit.)

**** The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. ****

b) (Project Design Approval is requested for the Puesta Del Sol right-of-way improvements. Project must comply with City Council Resolution No. 15-029 adopted on March 24, 2015. Right-of-way improvements last reviewed on January 27, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:12 p.m.

Present: Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; Susan Van Atta, Van Atta Associates, Inc.; and Suzanne Elledge, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 5:28 p.m.

1. Nancy Martz, resident, supports the pedestrian walkway for walkers and drivers in the area.
2. Tyrena Chin, manager of the Museum's camps program, expressed support for the pedestrian walkway for safety reasons.
3. Paulina Conn, resident, stated that she likes the landscaped part of the walkway but believes that at the narrowing of Puesta del Sol, the path needs to be moved to the north side for safety. She expressed concern about several other elements, including the lighting and landscaping. Chair Suding also acknowledged Ms. Conn's e-mailed comments of concern.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Michael Imwalle.
5. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from John O'Brien.

6. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Barbara Lindemann.
7. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Don Olson.
8. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Carole Daneri.
9. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Fran Galt.
10. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Pamela Boehr.
11. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Alexandra Mahto.
12. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Susan Chamberlin.
13. A letter of support from Lila Anne Bartz was received via USPS.

Public comment closed at 5:41 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The current proposal is a great improvement to the last.
2. Study adding stone benches to the pathway.
3. The lighting needs study to be more in keeping with the character of the area; the Commission is not opposed to the light fixture locations.
4. Study using a more natural material for paving the pathway; old asphalt may be acceptable.
5. Restudy the plant palette to be more varied, and the placement more natural and wild.
6. The two 14-foot light fixtures are preferred over the single of 20-foot fixture.
7. Anything that clutters the façade of the Scottish picket wall should be avoided.
8. The Commission commends Public Works for its sensitivity to this particular site.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

a) (Review of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes that the proposed right-of-way improvements have a less than significant impact to the resource.)

Actual time: 6:13 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the CEQA guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Public comment opened at 6:14 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn, resident, believes the HSSR is incomplete and requires more analysis about project impacts. Chair Suding also acknowledged Ms. Conn's e-mailed comments of concern.
2. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Roseanne Crawford.

Public comment closed at 6:18 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.