



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 24, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding, and Veyna
Members absent: Grumbine and Shallanberger
Staff present: Hernandez, Kaufman, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 10, 2016, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/1. (Drury abstained/Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A, C-F, I), Julio Veyna (Items A-B, G-H), and William La Voie (Items B, G-H).

Action: Mahan/Orías, 5/0/2. (La Voie and Suding abstained on Item A. Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a. Commissioners Grumbine and Shallanberger will be absent.
- b. The Wireless Ordinance public workshop will take place today in this room at 5:00 p.m.
- c. Jason Dominguez is the new City Council liaison to the HLC.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced the progress of the paint removal from the brick building at 10 East Yanonali Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Drury reported on the Arts Advisory Committee-Visual Arts in Public Places (VAPP) Committee meeting of February 18. The “Working Harbor” artwork, originally placed on the sidewalk at West Beach, had been moved because of a gas pipeline replacement; copies were made by the two original artists for replacement at the original sidewalk location. The original artwork will be placed on a wooden walkway near the welcome center for cruise ships. In addition, the “Crescent Crossing” artwork was safely and successfully removed and staged at the Amtrak station. The reconstruction is planned for April 4. A rededication ceremony is also planned, for a date to be determined.

On March 3, from 5:00-8:00 p.m., the American Institute of Architects will host talks by architects whose award-winning designs are currently on display at the Channing Peake Gallery.

2. Commissioner Murray reported on the Designations Subcommittee meeting of February 24, 2016. The subcommittee chose two buildings and the Rattlesnake Canyon Bridge for the next batch of designations. There was also a request from citizens to expand the boundary of the Mission Park Landmark designation; the item was tabled until the subcommittee members can research the proposal and a more in-depth discussion can take place.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 2121 GARDEN ST****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003

Owner: Zohar & Danna Ziv

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark Designation of "The Olives," a Craftsman style residence located at 2121 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt the resolution recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark "The Olives" residence located at 2121 Garden Street.

Action: Drury/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 33 E SOLA ST****(2:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-072-007

Owner: Archdiocese LA Ed/Welf Corp

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark Designation of the Our Lady of Sorrows Church located at 33 East Sola Street.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt the resolution recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark Our Lady of Sorrows Church located at 33 East Sola Street, with revisions:

1. "Norfolk Pine" shall be revised to "Norfolk Island Star Pine."
2. The Landmark designation boundary shall include the elegant palms, except the windmill palms (*Trachycarpus fortunei*), which are not original to the site.
3. The following notation was added to the Staff Report on page 3: ". . . for most of the Middle Ages to the modern period, the altar was to the east, front door to the west. In Alta California, the Spanish built their churches with the altar to the west, and the main entrance door to the east."

Action: Murray/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 33 E MICHELTORENA ST****(2:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-014

Owner: Archdiocese LA Ed/Welf Corp

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark Designation of the Notre Dame School located at 33 East Micheltorena Street.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

Rafael Marin-León, pastor of Our Lady of Sorrows Church and Notre Dame School, stated that the Archdiocese of Los Angeles would like the buildings to be designated as places of interest, not City Landmarks, due to remodeling concerns.

Public comment closed at 2:10 p.m.

Motion: To adopt the resolution recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark Notre Dame School located at 33 East Micheltorena Street, with revision:

1. Change the name of the Landmark designation to "Dolores/Notre Dame School" to reflect the history of the building.
2. There shall be communication between the owner or the owner's representative and the Urban Historian.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**4. 100 BLK STATE ST****(2:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-066

Application Number: MST2016-00064

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Public Works

Engineer: Alex Ubaldo, Public Works

Architect: Andrew Sokol

(Proposal for right-of-way improvements at the intersection of State Street and Yanonali Street, comprising the extension of an existing curb to allow for new self-closing pedestrian swing gates adjacent to the railroad tracks, the alteration of sidewalk approaches to the railroad tracks to be ADA compliant, and the removal of approximately 75 feet of Amtrak station platform. This project is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project must comply with Tier 3 SWMP requirements.)

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Derrick Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer, and Alex Ubaldo, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Andrew Sokol, Architect, STV, Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions, with any revisions to return to the Consent calendar:

1. The brick paving should extend north to Yanonali Street.
2. Use the Cabrillo Street railing in the Malaga green color.
3. Curve the walkway between the platform and the State Street sidewalk.
4. Minimize the size of the equipment for the pedestrian crossing and the lighting, and shield the lighting from the neighborhood to the extent possible.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:53 P.M. TO 3:06 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

5. 29 E VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00087
 Owner: Tioga Holdings, LP
 Contractor: Total Heating & Air
 Architect: Studio 1030 Architects
 Business Name: Ca' Dario

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to address violations of enforcement case ENF2014-01029 and permit "as-built" exterior alterations on an existing commercial building, including two [2] on-demand water heaters, lot line fence, and additional decorative elements. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Spanish Colonial Revival building designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings c. 1922.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on February 10, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:06 p.m.

Present: Michael Chenoweth, representative of the Owner; and Craig Burdick, Studio 1030 Architects

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m.

1. Jesse Swanhuysen, representative of the neighboring Rehling family, expressed frustration about lack of time to review plans and questioned whether the HLC could move forward per its guidelines. Regarding the proposed wall, he expressed concern about sound attenuation and screening, especially sound from the windows, and the structural integrity of the existing block wall.
2. Valerie Rehling ceded her time to Jesse Swanhuysen.
3. William Rehling, neighbor, presented historical pictures of the wall and expressed concerns about safety.

Public comment closed at 3:23 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman clarified that the HLC guideline referenced by Mr. Swanhuysen, 3.2.4-B, does not apply in this case. This is not a plan substitution; these are resubmittal plans for a continued item from two weeks ago.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with comments:

1. The wall as proposed is acceptable, with the assumption that the architect will exercise due diligence to ensure structural stability at the building permit stage.
2. The Commission supports the applicant's request to relocate the water heating equipment to inside the west parapet wall.
3. The clerestory windows on the north elevation in any restaurant area shall be double-glazed by the use of internal storm windows, to further reduce noise.

Action : La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL

E-1 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00511
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(This is a revised project description. Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History: This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. It also includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 3:44 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez clarified that the Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report cannot be approved today, as the sections regarding Puesta del Sol road will be modified. Today the Commission will comment on the other sections of the report and continue the item.

**** The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. ****

b) (Conceptual review; comments only. Comments will not include Puesta del Sol right-of-way improvements. Project requires environmental assessment. Project last reviewed on January 27, 2016.)

Present: Suzanne Elledge, SEPPS; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect; Walter Schacht, Schacht Aslani Architects; and Heather Smith, Lighting Designer

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn, resident, stated that the fence is looking nice. She highlighted several elements of concern, including project process and lighting.

Chair Suding acknowledged Ms. Conn's e-mailed comments of concern.

2. Roseanne Crawford, resident, stated that any proposed lighting should be limited to Museum property with automatic sensors that do not contribute to light pollution in this semi-rural area; she also expressed concerns about project process.

Chair Suding acknowledged Ms. Crawford's e-mailed comments of concern.

3. Lanny Ebenstein, resident, emphasized that decisions regarding the Museum should come before the HLC and be considered carefully. He also stated that the nomination of the Scottish picket wall at the Designations Subcommittee meeting may have an impact on this project.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern about Puesta del Sol road, an aspect of the project not being considered today, from Pamela Boehr, Sylvia Sykes, Fran Galt, and Vasanti & Joel Fithian.
5. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Barbara Lyon and Kellam de Forest.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Commissioner Drury commented that the boardwalks on the west side will blend successfully into the landscape, and he is generally in favor of the boardwalks. Regarding the butterfly enclosure, the weight of the arch and the ratio of space at the entrance need to be restudied. Regarding lighting, the wall lamps are generally acceptable, and he encourages the use of dimmable and controlled lighting. He is unsure about the shape of some of the bollards.
2. Commissioner Mahan stated that the dark brown color proposed for the boardwalks is too dark, and he prefers the lighter color option presented. He also questioned how the curving boardwalk will be achieved and would like to see a curb detail. He cannot support a boardwalk up to the entrance. Regarding the butterfly enclosure entrance, the height of the arch is out of human scale, and the arch needs to have voussoirs that are appropriately scaled to the arch entrance. He would like to see ironwork drawings for detailing. He found the lighting acceptable.
3. Commissioner Murray does not find the key lighting compatible with the building and stated that the bollard lighting seems very contemporary.
4. Commissioner La Voie agreed with all of Commissioner Mahan's comments, except those about the lighting. He emphasized that the building deserves better lighting and suggested a design based on an existing light or creating an alternative solution.
5. Commissioner Orías favors the separation of the boardwalk from the MacVeagh House. She stated that the gates on the butterfly enclosure need to be restudied, and that the lighting needs to be in harmony throughout the project, as some fixtures are not compatible with others.
6. Commissioner Veyna suggested more creativity for the lighting, to prompt a nostalgic feeling relative to the woody element. He also stated that the proposed color of the boardwalk needs to be mottled or shaded to soften its appearance.
7. Chair Suding concurred with Commissioner Mahan's comments but expressed concern about the lighting as proposed.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

a) (Review of revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Report last reviewed on January 27, 2016.)

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn, resident, is concerned about Puesta del Sol road and landscaping and would like to see these elements addressed more fully in the report.
2. Roseanne Crawford ceded her time to Lanny Ebenstein.
3. Lanny Ebenstein, resident, emphasized the importance of historical consideration and the concern of residents about urbanization of the area.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern about the report from Susan Chamberlin.

Public comment closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:53 P.M. ****