



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 27, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine, Mahan, Murray (until 5:08 p.m.), Shallanberger, Suding, and Veyna
Members absent: La Voie and Orías
Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 13, 2016, with correction.

Action: Mahan/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna.

Action: Murray/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced the following:

- a. Commissioners La Voie and Orías will be absent.
- b. The Commission received an invitation to a lecture at Antioch University on February 19: “Light Pollution and the Ecological Consequences of Artificial Night Lighting,” by USC Professor Travis Longcore, Ph.D., GISP.
- c. The “Crescent Crossing” artwork has been relocated from State Street to the train depot.

2. Ms. Hernández announced the following:

- a. The owners of the building at 10 East Yanonali Street, a large warehouse constructed in 1918 and on the Potential Historic Resources List, have been doing in-depth investigations for the past year with the Urban Historian to remove the white paint to expose the rich red brick. The original brick is very rough and made for industrial use. The paint removal is due to begin on February 1.
- b. The 2016 California Preservation Conference is in San Francisco on April 16-20. Any Commissioners interested in attending should let staff know.

3. Mr. Limón announced the following:

- a. Regarding the appeal of the listing of 29-37 E. Victoria Street on the Potential Historic Resources List, City Council voted to uphold the HLC decision, with one Councilmember in opposition. The City ordinance will likely be amended in the future to include other ways to list properties. In the meantime, Commissioners should submit requests for properties to be listed or request a Historic Structures/Sites Report.
- b. A new wireless ordinance has been drafted to oversee small-cell applications and wireless facilities. A public workshop will be held on February 24 for the public and wireless industry representatives.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported on the last meeting of the Visual Art in Public Places committee. There was a great deal of discussion about the relocation of “Crescent Crossing” without prior notice. In addition, the Museum of Contemporary Art and Hotel Indigo are joining forces again for an outdoor piece of art in 2016.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**1. 33 EAST SOLA STREET****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-072-007

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a public hearing on February 24, 2016 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the Our Lady of Sorrows Church at 33 East Sola.)

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-01 to hold a Public Hearing on February 24, 2016, to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of Our Lady of Sorrows Church located at 33 East Sola Street.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 33 EAST MICHELTORENA STREET****(1:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-014

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a public hearing on February 24, 2016 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the Notre Dame School at 33 East Micheltorena Street.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest questioned the extent of the Landmark designation of the property.

Ms. Hernández described the proposed boundaries of the City Landmark designation as listed in the Resolution of Intention.

Public comment closed at 1:49 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-02 to hold a Public Hearing on February 24, 2016, to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of Notre Dame School located at 33 East Micheltorena Street.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**3. 2121 GARDEN STREET****(1:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a public hearing on February 24, 2016 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of "The Olives" Residence at 2121 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m.

Kellam de Forest wondered whether the notice of intention should indicate the parts of the property being considered for Landmark designation.

Ms. Hernández clarified that the Resolution of Intention does include the proposed boundaries of the City Landmark designation.

Public comment closed at 1:52 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-03 to hold a Public Hearing on February 24, 2016, to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of "The Olives" Residence located at 2121 Garden Street.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orias absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 600 BLK W ANAPAMU ST 1906 SEG ID****(2:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-906

Application Number: MST2014-00386

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove and replace the Anapamu Street Bridge over Old Mission Creek. The existing single-span bridge is approximately 36 feet wide and 38 feet long and was constructed in 1926. A new single-span bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials [AASHTO].)

(Review of an Archaeological Survey Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.
Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

5. 600 BLK W ANAPAMU ST 1906 SEG ID

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-906
Application Number: MST2014-00386
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove and replace the Anapamu Street Bridge over Old Mission Creek. The existing single-span bridge is approximately 36 feet wide and 38 feet long and was constructed in 1926. A new single-span bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials [AASHTO].)

(Review of a Historical Resources Evaluation Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc. The report concludes that none of the five structures reviewed are historically significant.)

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: Colleen Hamilton, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets CEQA Guidelines and the MEA.

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with revisions to be verified by staff:
1. Research the involvement of Frank Van Schaick, Camp Conestoga director, and incorporate into the final report as necessary.
2. Forward to the Architectural Board of Review the HLC's desire to keep the oak trees.
Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL****E-1 Zone**

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00511
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(This is a revised project description. Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. It also includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

a) (Review of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Report concludes that cumulative impacts to significant historic resources would be less than significant.)

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's standards and CEQA guidelines. She had a reservation about the proposed railing outside of the McVeigh cottage, as it is very different from a Victorian railing, though this is mitigated by it being separated from the cottage. In addition, the use of natural sandstone for the sidewalk is preferred to faux.

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest commented that on page 27, the report does not indicate that the paved street ran to the "stegosaurus" (Hazard) wall; this should be included in the report.
2. Paulina Conn, local resident, stated that this is a landscape with many historic features, so the Puesta del Sol road proposal needs to be examined carefully. She mentioned several elements of concern regarding this proposal.
3. Lanny Ebenstein, local resident, expressed concern about the planning process and the community being allowed sufficient time to consider the report.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Susan Chamberlin.

Public comment closed at 2:17 p.m.

**** The Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report review was tabled until after the project review. ****

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Correct typos as denoted on pages 26 and 28.
2. Study the impacts of the Puesta del Sol improvements, specifically the use of sandstone versus faux sandstone and how an edging affects the Scottish picket (Hazard) wall.
3. Study the effect of the permeable pavers on the integrity of the site and how the plastic or recycled decking impacts the historic resource.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Orías, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

b) (Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on October 21, 2015.)

Present: Heidi Jones, SEPPS; Luke Swetland, President & CEO, Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History; Susan Van Atta, Van Atta Associates; Walter Schacht and Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; and Vince Tarango, Lighting Designer

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn, local resident, stated that the Puesta del Sol road proposal should be considered separately from the rest of the project and requires more public input. She mentioned several elements of concern.
2. Lanny Ebenstein, local resident, stated that the project plans are not ready to be finalized. He emphasized that there has not been sufficient time for consideration and input from the community.
3. Tom Jacobs read a letter of support on behalf of Don Olson of the Mission Heritage Trail Association.
4. Francesca Galt, local resident, expressed concern about the proposed changes to the Puesta del Sol road, naming several as inappropriate for the unique street setting.
5. Kellam de Forest favors the use real sandstone curbing to fit the historic ambiance.
6. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Barbara Lindemann on behalf of the Mission Canyon Association.
7. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Paulina Conn.
8. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Francesca Galt.
9. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Lanny Ebenstein.
10. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Roseanne Crawford.
11. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Nancy Bull.
12. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Barbara Lyon.

Public comment closed at 3:22 p.m.

Planning Commission liaison comments: Sheila Lodge stated that the Planning Commission felt strongly that a pedestrian walkway is needed along Puesta del Sol.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Commissioner Drury stated that the curb sections must be sandstone. He prefers the two existing streetlamps across the street to remain and leaving the front of the Museum clear of any City standard streetlights.
2. Commissioner Mahan stated that the pedestrian walkway is important. The aesthetics of the area are also important, and faux sandstone is not compatible. Moreover, the configuration of the planters seems artificial; they should be bounded by something natural and appropriate to the area. The curvature in the road also needs to be bounded by something more appropriate, perhaps a retaining wall. The proposed light fixtures are an improvement to cobra lights.
3. Commissioner Murray stated that the current configuration of the pedestrian walkway is unacceptable. The width and the linear way of it impact the rural landscape, making it appear urban. She proposed finding another way to delineate the pathway, possibly with a low shrub or meandering garden.
4. Commissioner Grumbine stated that the curb on the walkway creates a parking lot rather than pathway feel. He proposed differentiating the asphalt and the driving area, perhaps with permeable pavers.
5. Commissioner Veyna is concerned about the curb as a liability. He favors maintaining the rural look of the area. He also questioned the necessity of the proposed parking along Puesta del Sol.
6. Commissioner Shallenberger stated that conceptually, a walkway in front of the wall is approvable, but it needs some refinement. True sandstone is the only acceptable material. The walkway is oversized and too linear, and he proposed breaking it up, perhaps with sandstone boulders.
7. Chair Suding stated that the current design is counter to universal access with respect to the cars that will park along Puesta del Sol. He emphasized that there are some inherent problems that need to be overcome with more creative solutions.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Orías, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:08 P.M. TO 4:20 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**7. 29 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00087
 Owner: Tioga Holdings, LP
 Contractor: Total Heating & Air
 Business Name: Ca' Dario

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to address violations of enforcement case ENF2014-01029 and permit five (5) "as-built" heating, ventilation, and air conditioning [HVAC] rooftop units with new equipment screening on an existing commercial building. Additional "as-built" exterior alterations include two on-demand water heaters, lot line fence, and additional decorative elements. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Spanish Colonial Revival building designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings c. 1922.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was referred to the Full Commission from the January 13, 2016 Consent calendar.)

Actual time: 4:20 p.m.

Present: Craig Burdick, Studio 1030 Architects; and Michael Chenoweth, representative of the Owner

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernández stated that the grills on the smooth-stucco walls are not appropriate for the historic resource in the Spanish Colonial Revival Style; grills were placed over openings, and the plaster was kept simple, so adding them is conjectural and does not meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The frosted glass in the windows is not a traditional treatment for glass and not appropriate for the historic resource.
2. Ms. Kaufman discussed the background of the project. The project was referred from the Consent calendar because of the amount of changes proposed. The signage will be addressed under a separate permit.

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m.

1. Jesse Swanhuysen spoke on behalf of the Rehling family, a neighbor of the building. He expressed concern about skipped steps in the review process and an expansion of the project description since the last review. The fence in the back and unfinished work on top of the building are also concerns.
2. Valerie Rehling ceded her time to Jesse Swanhuysen.
3. Virginia Rehling ceded her time to Jesse Swanhuysen.
4. William Rehling highlighted several areas of concern of the building.

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments, and Final Approval for HVAC units and screening:

1. The proposed screening for the on-demand water heaters has not entirely addressed the issue of the visibility of surface-mounted piping.
2. The frosted glass in the windows should be removed.
3. The iron grills should be removed.
4. The lot line fence should be changed; more details should be provided for a more compatible fence for this location.
5. Staff shall investigate the outdoor dining improvements to verify permits.

Action: Shallenberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**8. 523 W FIGUEROA ST****R-3 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-250-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00017
 Owner: Meza Celia S
 Agent: Benjamin Lucas
 Applicant: Mark Meza
 Applicant: John Cuykendall

(Proposal for the relocation of two existing potentially historic single-family residences located at the Cancer Center of Santa Barbara project site to an existing 20,306 square foot lot adjacent to Old Mission Creek. The existing 1,000 square foot residence and 1,400 square foot residence will be converted into an attached duplex. Two covered and two uncovered parking spaces are proposed for a total of four parking spaces. Four parking spaces with a minimum of two covered parking spaces are required. A new driveway and covered trash enclosure are also proposed. The existing single-family residence and covered parking are to remain unaltered. The relocation of these potentially historic structures was part of the Conditions of Approval for the Cancer Center of Santa Barbara project [MST2007-00092].)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)

Actual time: 5:09 p.m.

Present: Benjamin Lucas, Agent

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernández discussed the background of the project. She stated that the relocated buildings will be compatible in this neighborhood of one-story, modest, single-family homes, many of which are over 50 years old.
2. Ms. Kaufman stated that it is important to focus on the footprint of the existing building. She requested comments on the proposal for the driveway.

Public comment opened at 5:16 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval, with the landscape plan to return to the Full Commission:

1. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
2. The following conditions of approval apply: (A) Requirements Prior to Permit Issuance-(1) Tree Protection Measures, (2) Creek Restoration Measures; (B) Construction Implementation Requirements-(1) Unanticipated Archaeological Resources Contractor Notification.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Murray, and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**9. 301 E YANONALI ST****M-1/SP-2/SD-3 Zone****(4:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-005
 Application Number: MST2012-00494
 Owner: The Wright Partners
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Concept review only. Proposal to construct a new 44,211 square foot two-story commercial building to include a market and retail spaces with 186 parking spaces on the 3.16 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo and the SP-2 Cabrillo Plaza Specific Plan area. Parking is to be provided in a podium parking structure with the market above. Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit and Development Plan square footage is requested.)

(Second concept review; comments only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit and Development Plan. Project last reviewed on January 16, 2013.)

Actual time: 5:24 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Courtney Jane Miller, CJMLA; and Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 5:41 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired about the height of the building and the tower.

Public comment closed at 5:42 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Study reducing the prominence of the building to maintain the mountain view.
2. Study the transition in style on the elevations.
3. Study the massing and explore breakup options.
4. The scale of the building is acceptable.
5. Strive to keep the landscaping simple and not obstructive of the view.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Murray, and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**10. 700 BLK STATE ST 1776 SEG ID**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-776
 Application Number: MST2015-00391
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Sharon James
 Architect: Frank Carter

(Conceptual review for the proposed installation of new small cell wireless antennas and radios in the right-of-way at six separate site locations in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project sites include the intersection of State and De La Guerra Streets, the 400 block of State Street, State and Anapamu Streets, Ortega and Anacapa Streets, Anacapa and Carrillo Streets, and the 900 block of Chapala Street. Proposed designs include underground vaults and new antennas on existing streetlights.)

(Second concept review; comments only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Visual Impact Findings. Project last reviewed on August 26, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:12 p.m.

Present: Sharon James, Applicant; and Heidi Payne, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 6:33 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest wondered about the dimensions of the aerial cans and whether the El Pueblo Viejo guidelines address wireless antennas.
2. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Nancy DiLoreto.

Public comment closed at 6:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comment:

1. The proposals need architectural detailing consistent with El Pueblo Viejo guidelines; the pole details should match the locations' pole standards.

Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 5/0/0. (Mahan stepped down/La Voie, Murray, and Orías absent.)
 Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:49 P.M. ****